

Partnering for Change

World Vision

PUBLIC-PRIVATE-
NOT-FOR-PROFIT
PARTNERSHIPS FOR
DEVELOPMENT





With the support of the New Zealand Aid Programme

Authors: Hannah Anderson, Dr. Kathryn Taetzsch, Lucy Laitinen (World Vision)

With thanks to: The case study participants that provided information. David Curtis, Stephen Chiu, Stephen Knowles, and Jamie Newth for reviewing the studies.

Images: Courtesy of Women in Business Development Inc., World Vision Zimbabwe and Eureka Forbes. (Images on page 5 and 27 are from <http://www.oxfam.org.uk/what-we-do/countries-we-work-in/ethiopia> and the image on page 17 is from <http://blogs.cisco.com/csr/connecting-sichuan-program-transforms-healthcare-and-education-in-china/>)

June 2013

Partnering for Change

Contents

- Introduction 4
- Indian Rural Water Initiative**
March 2007 – September 2009 7
- Samoan Virgin Coconut Oil**
1998 – ongoing 12
- Connecting Sichuan Healthcare Initiative**
2008–2010 17
- Revitalisation of Smallholder Agricultural Production in Zimbabwe (RSAPZ)**
October 2010 – September 2012 21
- Engaging Smallholders in Value Chains: Creating new opportunities for beekeepers in Ethiopia**
Pilot phase: 2003 | Scale up: 2010. 27
- Conclusion** 32

Introduction

The potentially transformative role of the private sector in addressing development challenges has been repeatedly pressed at UN fora¹ where “scalable and transformational partnerships for development”² have been promoted. This coincides with an increasing interest on the part of the private sector to invest in developing countries, which are seen as having the greatest potential for future economic growth. The 2013 Human Development Report referred to the rise of emerging markets as “unprecedented in its speed and scale.”³ As a consequence, there has been a significant shift in mind-set around the role of the private sector in reducing poverty and a blurring of roles among players in the development sector.⁴

This shift in mind-set, however, has not been universal. Many development professionals remain uneasy about the prospect of the private sector profiting from development, citing an insufficient focus on sustainability and a drive for profit above all else, often ignoring private sector expertise and their genuine interest in addressing development issues. The investment initiatives of private sector companies, on the other hand, have been hampered by insufficient knowledge of local conditions and community buy-in and, in some cases, an absence of interest in community needs. The public sectors of many developing countries lack the expertise and capital to address development challenges alone. What is emerging is a growing understanding of the potential value of cross-sector collaboration, driving a shift away from much tested public private partnership (PPP) models and traditional aid projects.⁵

The collaborative partnerships described in this research widen the scope of PPPs to incorporate Non-Governmental-Organisations in what some describe as Public-Private-Not for Profit Partnerships (PPNPs). There is no static model or commonly agreed definition for a PPNP. This report refers to a PPNP as a direct collaboration between:

- any type of business seeking commercial or strategic benefit from collaboration; and
- any form or level of government (local, district, state, national); and
- an NGO serving as a resource or implementing partner; where
- the collaboration uses the competencies, assets, and knowledge of each partner to achieve a shared outcome, while allowing each partner to achieve their respective goals.⁶



Each partner in a PPNP has differing motivations depending on their strategic goals and the opportunity available. While private sector partners might be motivated to access new markets, develop and test products, or build supply chains, they are becoming aware that NGOs have the local knowledge, capacity, networks, and legitimacy to support them. For example, NGOs are specialists in working with marginalized groups and are often more effective than private businesses in gaining the trust of poor communities. NGOs may also be motivated by the value that business brings to their efforts to lift economic and social development through access to new technology, new markets, capital, and expertise. The public sector in developing countries is largely motivated by its desire to lift economic growth and can maximize the potential of cross-sector collaboration through an enabling regulatory environment, strategic oversight, expertise, and advice.

1. For example the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), the post 2015 MDG discussions, the UN Millennium Summit in 2001, and the Fourth High Level Forum on Aid Effectiveness in Busan all asserted the validity of private sector involvement in development.

2. United Nations, 2013. *A New Global Partnership: Eradicate Poverty and Transform Economies Through Sustainable Development*. Retrieved 15 May from: <http://www.post2015hlp.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/05/UN-Report.pdf>, p.63

3. United Nations Development Programme 2013 *Human Development Report 2013, The Rise of the South: Human Progress in a Diverse World*. Retrieved 1 June from: <http://hdr.undp.org/en/reports/global/hdr2013/summary/> p.1

4. New Zealand's Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFAT), for example, has increased emphasis on stimulating economic development in the Pacific and has specifically opened its development assistance programme to the private sector: <http://www.aid.govt.nz/about-aid-programme>

5. Accenture Development Partnerships & World Vision. 2008, *Emerging opportunities for NGO-business partnerships*, London.

6. Pilkington, J. 2001, *Three Sectors, One Vision, Cross Sector Collaboration for Economic Development*, Melbourne Business School & Business for Millennium Development, Australia.



The case studies

Today, leading Pacific Rim economies such as the US, Taiwan, Australia, and China are seeking commercial opportunities through engagement with Pacific nations. New Zealand is also looking to enhance its presence in the region, dovetailing its economic growth and foreign aid strategies⁷.

The New Zealand Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade (MFAT) views the PPNP approach as a means to both achieve its development outcomes in the Pacific and provide support to private sector internationalisation. Accordingly, it is promoting PPNP initiatives through the Partnerships Fund (albeit that a company may not profit directly from the Fund itself).

This report includes five PPNP case studies. The case studies describe the formation of each partnership, role and motivation of each partner, critical success factors, challenges and limitations, overall outcomes, and their applicability to the Pacific. The case studies come from different countries, span a range of sectors, and include a range of partnership types.

Research methodology

The case studies were selected after an extensive literature review. All the information in the case studies was collated from research of publicly available literature and was further detailed and validated where possible by email correspondence and phone conversations with the partners involved.

Finding robust examples of PPNPs proved difficult, partly because of their newness but mainly due to their hybrid business models, the lack of established terminology, and the number of partners involved from various sectors. It was only by actively looking for PPNP features and corresponding with partners that we were able to ascertain whether a partnership could be classified as a PPNP for the purposes of this research. There is the possibility of a positive bias in the case studies because we specifically looked for examples that appeared successful and which could be applied to some extent to the Pacific region.

Like any private sector venture, the commercial sensitivity of much of the pertinent information made access to data related to return on investment, profitability, and so on, problematic. In none of the case studies examined was an aligned metric for success created at the outset of the collaboration. Thus, while it was difficult to define success in each individual case study, it was also impossible to draw standard comparisons across the case studies.

The variable responsiveness and availability of partners and varying levels of published information for each case study prevented standardized case studies. As such the case studies vary in their emphasis on the aspects of each partnership.



7. New Zealand Ministry of Foreign Affairs & Trade, 2011. *Statement of Intent 2011-2014*. Retrieved 1 June from: <http://www.mfat.govt.nz/downloads/media-and-publications/soi-mfat-2011-14.pdf> p.20

Indian Rural Water Initiative

→ March 2007–September 2009

PPNP Overview

Eureka Forbes (a company specialising in water and air purification systems), World Vision (WV), the local government of the Manikypuram area in India, and community groups came together in 2007 to develop water purification products and solutions for the rural poor. The project had a strong community education component, focusing on sanitary practices.

Women's self-help groups contributed to the design of Eureka Forbes' reverse osmosis water-treatment product (it removes excess chemicals from water), purchased the customised water purification equipment, facilitated by WV micro-loans, and provided water to the community at a profit. Eureka Forbes was able to use WV's relationships and community understanding to co-create a product and a business model that was commercially viable in a market that otherwise would have been inaccessible to the private sector. The involvement of the Panchayat⁸ (local council) enabled the project to run smoothly with local government support.

In addition to the primary focus of the project, WV enlisted Eureka Forbes to provide water filters during emergencies. A manually-operated filtration unit was developed specifically for emergency use.

PPNP Formation

In 2004, World Vision Canada (WVC), Zenon Environmental, a water treatment company, and World Vision India (WVI) collaborated during the tsunami disaster response. This led to a formal partnership agreement for further collaboration between Zenon's Indian partner Eureka Forbes with WV, the local government, and community groups. Each sector added value to the mission of the other. WVI provided knowledge of the rural areas and helped Eureka Forbes leverage their technological skill to aid lower-income communities. The local government's support to this relationship provided the legitimacy necessary to work in the area.

Commercial Opportunity

There was no affordable water purification system on the market to address the needs of the rural poor in India. Eureka Forbes was well known in urban areas of India as a pioneer of water purification systems. Although their profile in rural areas was low, they saw a commercial opportunity: the potential to expand their access to market and up scale. The project allowed Eureka Forbes to test reception to their commercial water purification units for the first time in India. In addition, showcasing their products through this project gave Eureka Forbes the chance to demonstrate their benefits to other partners and government agencies, increasing brand recognition.

8. The governing body of the area composed of a local village development committee who support their village through the distribution of government funds and the implementation of a development programme.

Development Challenge

A high number of people in the Manikypuram area, India, were suffering from the effects of fluorosis, including anaemia, weak teeth, sore joints and even birth defects, because the drinking water had a high level of dissolved solids including fluoride. Furthermore, there was a lack of understanding about good sanitation and hygiene practices, resulting in waterborne diseases. The 2004 tsunami in the coastal belt in the Bay of Bengal area left people in even more desperate need of clean water. A strategic partnership was created to increase access to clean drinking water for rural communities in India and create income-generating activities for women and youth.

Public Opportunity

The Manikypuram community lacked the income to independently reduce or eliminate the water-related diseases that had been afflicting them for generations but the community's involvement in this partnership provided an avenue to address these issues. The local Panchayat was supportive of the project, specifically related to the health benefits they would see as a result. Moreover, their success would inspire other communities to become involved in similar projects.

High Level Outcomes

■ Business outcomes

Access to new markets: Through co-creation and customer-focused product development, Eureka Forbes established a new market for affordable water purification units among the rural poor. Dr Rajesh Roy, head of strategic partnerships for Eureka Forbes, stated their involvement in this programme has helped them to build up trust levels for their brand and company. Furthermore, in 2010, Eureka Forbes was awarded "Best Company of the Year" by Frost & Sullivan (global market analysis and research firm),⁹ with particular praise for their work to provide safe drinking water in India. This, in turn, has increased brand recognition and increased sales.

Product innovation: As a result of this project, Eureka Forbes is launching two new products; solar water plants and a stove. The solar water plant is to be initiated in a WVI Area Development Programme, with the same concept of becoming an economic venture for community members. The success of the innovation provided by Eureka Forbes caused WVI to consider how further designs, beyond the traditional technology models, could enhance the lives of the rural poor. The unique partnership has triggered technology and product innovation that would have most likely not been pursued in a generic sub-contractual engagement without not-for-profit involvement.



Scalability: The project has already been scaled to 60 communities in India; in 2010, 40 UV and 60 Reverse Osmosis water treatment plants were built in 100 rural and four urban communities. Further collaboration on disaster preparedness and response has provided 10,860 purification units for flood-affected communities; therefore, the partnership has provided a platform for expansion of water systems, addressing the various water and sanitation needs of most vulnerable population.

Partnership benefits: This project showed the potential for private companies to offer services to the development sector while still meeting their business goals. Eureka Forbes is now seen as a pioneer water purification company by other similar businesses, and is already supplying more water filtration units for emergencies. It is likely none of the partners involved would have been able to address the issue in an innovative and cost-efficient manner without this partnership.

■ Development outcomes

Positive health outcomes: There is reduced exposure to waterborne diseases and increased understanding of good sanitation and hygiene practices in the community. More than 44,000 people affected by the tsunami benefitted from clean water supply, as well as 12,000 families that were previously affected by excess fluoride, saline, and iron. Reduction of fluoride-related diseases such as joint pain, tooth decay, and diarrhoea were evident after the introduction of the filtration systems.

Business enabling environment/sustainable income-generation for women: Women's self-help groups now own the filtration systems and generate revenue by charging the community for the potable water. In this way, marginalised social groups are encouraged to engage in entrepreneurial activities.

9. See: http://nityam.in/viscis/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=173:best-company-of-the-year-award-for-eureka-forbes&catid=75:cip-news&Itemid=155

Advocacy & fundraising: WVI and Eureka Forbes later developed a cause-related marketing campaign targeting 200,000 wealthy households in two of India's largest cities – Mumbai and Chennai – to raise awareness and funds to address water-related issues in India. Sharing the resources and expertise between partners means that the cost for similar WV initiatives has decreased.

Public outcomes

Without this partnership, the Government would have struggled to resolve the water purification problem due to high costs.

Sustainability: Staff were trained on installation and maintenance of water purification units; school children are now supplied with clean water and Village Development Committees have been established to take charge of the water purification units. Water cost has also decreased, allowing increased access to potable water for the rural poor. Women's appreciation of the benefits of establishing a business within their communities and confidence in their business skills is evidenced by the increasing number of women's self-help groups inspired by the success of the project.

Public health awareness: There is far greater understanding of the importance of safe drinking water. Through hygiene and sanitation education that was linked to the project, the incidence of open defecation has decreased, as have cases of diarrhoea. WVI states that as a consequence of the project, there has been a reduction in health expenses both for individual households and the wider public healthcare system.

Policy impact: The regional government has since developed a plan based on the Rural Water Initiative to increase access to clean drinking water for rural communities throughout the state of Andra Pradesh. This would not have been possible with only one or two partners being involved and required the NGO, Government and, to a certain extent, private partner engagement.

Role of each partner

Local council/Panchayat (public partner), in particular the Health and Electricity Departments

ROLE

Provided on the ground support and resources:

- Ensured participation of the community and represented their voices
- Helped establish the water users' committee
- Provided the land and covered some of the building costs
- Provided free water supply, installation of bore wells, subsidized electricity supply and provided technical support to test the water and provide public awareness on sanitation issues
- Conducted an audit on revenue and maintenance

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- There has been a marked improvement in the health and income levels for people in the community. The water is now fluoride, iron and saline-free
- The local councils have seen savings on medical bills, greater public awareness on sanitation issues, and reduction in water costs
- The water plants have been well received by the communities, strengthening the local government's position in the community
- The water units have enabled the local Panchayat to receive additional benefits under central Government schemes

“

The Manikyapuram community lacked the income to independently reduce or eliminate the water-related diseases that had been afflicting them for generations



Role of each partner

Eureka Forbes India & initially Zenon Environmental Canada (private partner)

ROLE

Innovation partner, provided capacity support:

- Developed the community water filter units and provided the technical expertise
- Worked with the women's self-help groups to design a filtration unit appropriate for rural communities
- Carried out training classes for operators and water user committees
- Provided water quality reports
- Provided the resources and staff to monitor project implementation
- Supplied water purification units at low cost (however, not as low as WVI had expected)¹⁰

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- Entered a new market for affordable water purification units
- This project demonstrated the potential to move into other rural areas and test out other products, therefore encouraged Eureka Forbes to access new markets and create new products, establishing itself in an un-served market niche with large potential

World Vision Canada (not-for-profit informal partner)

ROLE

- Informal role as a broker supporting the partnership
- Facilitated initial engagement platform for water filter systems (after 2004 Tsunami)
- Supported the systems and strategies that were put in place and the development of the projects

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- Through its health benefits a variety of WVC's development objectives were met, particularly four development goals: gender equality, reduction in child mortality, sustainability, and developing a global partnership
- Because of the level of success with the project, it triggered discussion around their cross-sector partnerships' strategy

World Vision India (not-for-profit partner)

ROLE

Community-based facilitator for the partnership:

- Integrated the pilot project into its larger Area Development Programme¹¹ (funded by child sponsorship)
- Provided micro-loans to women's self-help groups
- Formed water user groups to take care of the community purification units
- Trained user groups on financial literacy and created awareness on water, sanitation, and hygiene practices
- Provided the facilitation and brokering function for the partnership with WVC

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- Facilitated a stronger relationship between the NGO and the local government
- Increased capacity of staff to address rural water problems
- 23,151 households from 39 communities have access to affordable, safe water
- 60 community water plants were installed

Women's self-help groups (beneficiaries)

ROLE

- Worked with Eureka Forbes to help them understand community needs, capacity, and key issues of affordability
- Bought the filtration units and sold water to the community

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- Created income-generation opportunities for women, allowing them to repay loans and cover maintenance as well as generate profit
- Has strengthened gender equity

10. Installation and maintenance for the water filtration units were higher than WVI initially thought, this created a degree of tension in the partnership

11. Long-term integrated development programmes funded through child sponsorship

Critical PPNP Success Factors

Shared PPNP goal: Although their strategic objectives may have differed, there was a joint focus on improving water safety for rural communities. Eureka Forbes' company mission statement outlines their commitment to providing safe drinking water and their pledge to help alleviate the impacts of the global water crisis. Eureka Forbes emphasises the need to involve the community when carrying out rural initiatives, a key component to WV's development work. This shows that before the different partners engaged with each other, there was a common commitment to the cause. The identification of alignment in goals and strategic commitments therefore was key to a successful partnership between all entities.

Legitimacy within the community: Every partner involved had a level of legitimacy within the community. WVI had been involved in community development for decades, the local government supported the needs of the area, and Eureka Forbes had been providing water systems to Indian cities for 25 years.

Flexibility in product innovation: The original use of ultra-violet technology in the water filtration unit was ineffective at removing fluoride, saline, and other chemicals from the water. However, the flexibility of Eureka Forbes' approach meant that they were able to adjust the design and create an effective solution (reverse osmosis).

Partnership growth: Although there were initial issues with communication and understanding between the partners, both have since decided that collaboration is beneficial for their strategic goals. Recently Eureka Forbes and WV partnered again to support a solar powered water purification project in Unnao (a WVI Area Development Project in the Uttar Pradesh state in India). The local Panchayat is also involved in the project.

Challenges

Project conception: The *ad hoc* origin of the partnership was a hurdle at the beginning. There was a lack of appreciation between the partners of how much investment of time would be needed, leading to a period of mistrust.

- Commitment by the partners, and the brokering role of WVC helped to mend some of the misgivings and push the project forward. As a consequence, WVI have a greater appreciation of the importance of implementation processes; taking time to communicate with everyone and understanding the objectives of all internal stakeholders is key to ensuring goals are being met.

Discord: Contact with the private and not-for-profit sector has revealed a difference in the outlooks of the partners. Although Eureka Forbes is extremely positive about the strength of the relationship between themselves and WV, the positivity is not completely reciprocated. The Associate Director, Humanitarian and Emergency Affairs of WVI, Kunal Shah, reaffirmed that there were positive impacts from the partnership but also raised some issues. The relatively high price of the units was a concern as well as recurring maintenance work. This highlights the challenging aspect of business interests to, as quickly as possible, ensure that efforts "pay-off" and increase return on investment.

Project design: Language differences, inadequate consultation with the community, and different motivations of the partners meant that there were some delays and friction in the project. For instance, Eureka Forbes found some issues with WVI as their timelines were not as Eureka Forbes expected them to be. While the technical solutions to the problems were ready early on, the communities had not been appropriately educated on sanitation and the importance of clean water. As a result, the partners had to review their approach and ensure education was a primary component. This highlights the need for joint planning, design, and ongoing consultation during implementation among all partners. Accountabilities and problem-solution mechanisms were not clear from the outset, contributing to delays.

Moving forward: This PPNP was an iterative process for WVI. Now that they have had experience with the private sector, they are taking a more evaluative approach to the commercial sector; they will not automatically enter an MOU with Eureka, instead requiring a regular tender process:

“World Vision India has developed a deeper understanding of how to address challenges in rural water, including the business acumen needed to provide sustainable solutions”¹²

This statement sums up a key learning for the NGO partner in this initiative: while PPNPs may be a good solution to complex development challenges and meeting public and private sector interests, they must be assessed alongside more traditional approaches such as a tender process.

12. World Vision Canada, 2010, *The future in their hands: A Program Review*, World Vision, Canada p. 32



Samoan Virgin Coconut Oil

→ 1998 – ongoing

PPNP Overview

The Virgin Coconut Oil (VCO) project is part of the non-governmental organisation (NGO) Women in Business Development Inc.'s (WIBDI) wider organic production programme, aiming to provide families across the Pacific with economic livelihood options.

In 1998, WIBDI performed a sub-sector analysis of Samoa's coconut industry to ascertain if producing virgin coconut oil could be economically viable. They researched Direct Micro Expelling (DME) technology, finding it was more affordable and superior to traditional copra¹³ extraction, which after processing is used for cooking, cosmetics, and health products. The DME approach takes small-scale processing to the production site (farms), mechanically expelling pure coconut oil from the coconut without using chemicals. As a result, high quality virgin coconut oil (VCO) could be locally produced by farmers. They found that the return on coconut oil when using DME would be substantially higher than when applying the traditional extraction method. Realising the additional commercial potential, organic certification was introduced, which added value to the product and attracted international buyers.

¹³. Dried coconut meat

WIBDI provided families with training, education around financial literacy through a microfinance project (tailored to meet the needs of Samoan families), arranged access to finance, facilitated organic certification, and supplied the DME technology. WIBDI was always interested in finding an international buyer, as was the Samoan Government, who supported and promoted the initiative, providing financial and strategic support through the development and implementation of facilitating policies and strategies.

In 2008 The Body Shop entered a Fair Trade Agreement with WIBDI to export the VCO, giving producers a stable framework for involvement in the global market.

PPNP Formation

The PPNP was initiated by the Samoan based NGO WIBDI, with Oxfam New Zealand acting as an informal partner, this included financially supporting the initiative (beginning in 2001 with funding from NZAID). The Samoan Government believed organic products such as VCO were a global niche product with potential for economic return and were subsequently keen to align themselves with WIBDI's work. The private partner and VCO buyer, The Body Shop, was the last to come on board. Each partner offered a different capability:

WIBDI had a strong understanding of Samoan culture and economy; the Samoan Government's role facilitated a sense of legitimacy and longevity to the project through focused policies and financial support; and The Body Shop's strong brand and global retail presence provided a stable demand for products.

The partnership was fostered through visits from The Body Shop and stakeholder engagement groups such as the National Organic Steering Committee (NOSC), formed by the Government in 2006 and made up of the Prime Minister, WIBDI, and farmers, aiming to promote organic practices and farming in Samoa.

Commercial Opportunity

Organic products are commercially appealing. According to public perception, organic food is healthier and organic production gentler on the environment. As a result, sales of organic produce have rocketed in recent years.¹⁴ As organic coconut oil is hard to mass-produce, there was an opportunity for Samoa to enter the global market without competing with large-scale suppliers. In 2008, The Body Shop, a business that prides itself on sourcing organic products and trading ethically, was looking to develop a new line of products based on organic coconut oil. Samoa's VCO production fit the bill. Already there were very few artificial fertilizers in smallholder coconut farms, allowing a relatively simple process for organic certification.

Development Challenge

Many Samoans rely on subsistence agriculture and remittances from family overseas (25 percent of Samoa's GDP comes from remittances).¹⁵ There are few economic opportunities in rural communities and as a consequence there has been an increase in migration to urban areas, negatively affecting agricultural production and intensifying social problems.¹⁶ In 2008, however, 78 percent of women still lived in rural areas and were struggling to earn an income.¹⁷ In addition, numerous cyclones and earthquakes have caused considerable damage to Samoa, affecting various industries and reducing income levels in many rural areas.

Coconut products are one of Samoa's principal exports and coconut oil, extracted from copra, required expensive, high-energy and large-scale equipment located in urban centres. With the fluctuating market prices for copra¹⁸ (beginning in 1998) many Samoan families had to abandon their plantations and were left with a surplus of coconuts.¹⁹ At this time, WIBDI

were searching for income-generating activities for vulnerable rural families.²⁰ In 2001, they partnered with Oxfam and together they developed a partnership to produce a product that was attractive to the international market, improved livelihoods, and could therefore benefit Samoan families and villages. Oxfam's involvement aligned with a variety of their strategies including their mission to create sustainable livelihood options in the Pacific through fair trade.

Public Opportunity

Revenue from agriculture had decreased significantly as a consequence of cyclone damage and fluctuating markets. Between 1998 and 2001, prices of copra and coconut halved, worsening the already fragile economy.²¹ Accordingly, with global consumption of organic products growing rapidly, the Samoan Government saw the value of export opportunities for organic produce: one of the six goals in the 2005-2007 Strategy for the Development of Samoa was to partner with the organic industry to increase its growth.

High Level Outcomes

■ Business outcomes

Access to new suppliers: The Body Shop is the primary buyer of coconut oil in Samoa and is beginning to expand to other countries in the Pacific, such as Tonga. Due to the quality of the produce, the company's demand for product has increased. The Body Shop's Fair Trade Agreement with WIBDI demonstrates the strong relationship that has been built between the two partners.

Access to new products: Samoan VCO farmers are now considering producing Tamanu oil (natural oil extracted from Tamanu nuts with skin healing properties). The Body Shop is interested in adding this to its product line and is working with WIBDI to do so.

■ Development outcomes

Financial independence: Farmers can now earn up to \$US 256 a week compared with little to no income previously. Microfinance and saving schemes have proved beneficial, enabling families to save and become eligible for loans (WIBDI strongly promotes this). The VCO project highlights the ability to amalgamate "sustainability, trade and income generation for families."²² VCO producers are also able to hire other villagers to work on production, offering jobs where there otherwise would not be any.

14. European Commission. 2013, *Agriculture and Rural Development: Organic Farming*. Retrieved 15 June from: http://ec.europa.eu/agriculture/organic/consumer-confidence/consumer-demand_en

15. New Zealand Ministry of Foreign Affairs & Trade, 2013, *Samoa*. Retrieved from: <http://www.mfat.govt.nz/Countries/Pacific/Samoa.php>

16. Oxfam, *Trading coconuts*. Retrieved from <http://www.oxfam.org.nz/what-we-do/where-we-work/samoa/improving-livelihoods/trading-coconuts>

17. Druzca, K. & Hutchens, H. 2008, *Women in Business in Samoa: Key findings from the August 2008 scoping mission*. Retrieved 20 May from: http://www.usaid.gov.au/Publications/Documents/pwpsd_samoa.pdf

18. A consequence of the fluctuating world markets.

19. Cretney, J. & Tafuna'i. A. 2004, *Tradition, Trade, and Technology: Virgin Coconut Oil in Samoa*. In: Carr, M. *Chain of Fortune, linking women producers and workers with global markets*, Commonwealth Secretariat, London. p. 45-75

20. Their original focus was on craft production and traditional weaving, but this created only sporadic income.

21. Bell, W. 2009, *Organic Agriculture and Fair Trade in Pacific Island Countries*, Natural Resources Management and Environment Department: Food and Agriculture of the United Nations. Retrieved 15 June from: <ftp://ftp.fao.org/docrep/fao/011/ak356e/ak356e00.pdf>

22. Duncan, S. & Gray, B. 2007, *The WIBDI Story: Technology, Tradition & Trade*, Centre for Entrepreneurship, University of Otago, Dunedin, New Zealand. p.7

Project design: The structure of the project was designed to fit Samoan culture, meaning that its focus on families has had repercussions for entire villages, with hundreds of people directly benefiting from increases in income and employment levels. Furthermore, there has been a shift in mind-set with many families identifying agriculture as a valuable way to earn a living; evidence seen in the waiting list of people wanting to become certified coconut oil providers.

■ **Public outcomes**

Increase in global recognition: Through the Government’s persistence (Organic Steering Committee) and commitment to organic certification and DME virgin processing, Samoa has added value to their coconut oil and created a reputation as a country with quality organic products.

Economic return: As a country heavily reliant on remittances and development assistance, a successful move into the global export market is promising and contributes to the Government’s overall strategic aspirations for the economy.

Employment opportunities: Some family members of those participating in VCO-production have returned to Samoa after migrating elsewhere for work. Today, farms may have 40–50 workers. New skills have been brought to communities such as oil production and budgeting knowledge.



Role of Each Partner

Samoan Government (Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Environment, Ministry of Commerce, Industry and Labour) (public partner)

ROLE

Provides strategic support and facilitates project growth:

- Has provided some financial and organisational support to WIBDI since the late 1990s
- Instigated various strategic plans; the 2005–2008 Government Plan analysed options for the Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries’ assistance to accelerate the growth of organic production
- The Ministry for Commerce, Industry and Labour pays for the annual organic audit

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

The Government’s strategic goal of promoting organics has proved successful:

- Many family members are now returning to Samoa to seek employment
- This product has helped them prove the quality of their products, opening up the potential for future export markets (such as increasing their organic banana export levels)

The Body Shop International (private partner)

ROLE

Provides project support and income:

- Holds the exclusive international contract for Samoan VCO
- Frequent visits to support and monitor community trade processes

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- Maintains status as a fair-trade and organic company
- Virgin coconut oil has proved a very successful product in their Coconut Bath and Body range. The VCO produced supplies 30 Body Shop products
- In 2012, 25.4 metric tonnes of VCO were imported by the Body Shop

Role of Each Partner

Women In Business Development Inc. (not-for-profit partner)

ROLE

Project coordinator:

- Manages the relationship between families, industry groups, and government ministries
- Prepares marketing material

Delivers ground-level support:

- Provides organic training and farming supervision
- Assists with farm preparation and prepares farms for annual audit
- Provides a microfinance programme for farmers

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- Met their strategic goal of providing Samoan families with income-generating activities
- As a testimony to the success of WIBDI's support in 2013, 20 farms are ready to produce VCO with nine in current production

Oxfam NZ (not-for-profit informal partner)

ROLE

Offered project support:

- Provides financial and organisational support to WIBDI
- Continues to support WIBDI in financial and farming practices, and helps promote the benefits of organic foods and ethical trades

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- According to Oxfam, a key achievement was the establishment of an environment conducive to organic farming, increasing income for producers, contributing to Oxfam's overall strategic goal of sustainable development for communities

VCO Farmers (beneficiaries)²³

ROLE

- Produce organic VCO for buyers such as the Body Shop

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- Families now earn a regular income and have a stronger position within the community
- According to WIBDI, women have an increased status in the family, contributing to the household income



23. Refers to the recipient of benefits deriving from the PPNP at the community level (beneficiaries are outside the formal PPNP partnership)

Critical PPNP Success Factors

The NGO's knowledge of the cultural context: The approach that WIBDI took for this project came from the experience and knowledge of having worked within the community and understanding the cultural context. Unlike many African and Asian countries, Samoa does not suffer from food shortages but rather a lack of opportunities to turn agricultural activities into sustainable income. This was well understood with the economic activities reflecting the local resources. Furthermore, the social system was well understood: in Samoa extended families often make up a community and have a defined structure. By focusing on families the project often supported a whole village, built social capital, and increased the sense of ownership and responsibility. WIBDI appreciates that business approaches in Samoa differ from the 'Western' approach, taking into account delays to production in the case of a community festival or funeral. To ensure there is a constant supply WIBDI has set up their own VCO processing site so that if any short-term interruption of supply occurs, demand can still be met.

WIBDI's focus on supplying oil-pressing technology that could be used locally paid off. The small-scale, affordable technology was a good fit for rural farmers, requiring little training. In the past, copra production has been viewed as a man's job but because the oil can now be produced in rural areas, women's involvement has grown and the attraction of remaining in the villages has increased. As WIBDI is grass-roots based, they were promptly able to respond to any emerging issues, meaning the private sector did not have to monitor production too closely. For instance, when the Body Shop came on as a partner, issues arose with the DME supplier. WIBDI was able to deal with this independently, deciding to instead use Axis Industrial Press, a New Zealand supplier of presses for olive oil. The technology is cheaper and technical adaptation is currently underway so the equipment can begin to press Tamanu oil, which has value in the international market.

Government support: The Government's support, through the Prime Minister of Samoa, was also of value: The Ministry of Agriculture with funding from the Secretariat of the Pacific Community, carried out a regional programme on the 'Development of Sustainable Agriculture in the Pacific', which promoted organic agriculture as an employment avenue.

Challenges

Perception: When the project began, there was a widespread perception locally that coconut oil was unhealthy. WIBDI worked to overcome this through information seminars, brochures, and being present for conversations about health benefits at markets. There still remains a low level of knowledge about its health benefits within Samoa. Consequently, entering local markets has proved more difficult.

Supply and demand: Producers have at times struggled to keep up with the production levels agreed that were agreed upon with The Body Shop.

- WIBDI have been providing Tongan farmers with training and they are now producing VCO. This relieves some of the production pressure from Samoa and provides a safety net if one country's production is affected by a natural disaster.

Sustainability: Funding is an ongoing concern. WIBDI asserts that external funding (through donors) is required to ensure the initiative continues. The farmers involved often have had very little education, may be illiterate, have no means of transportation, and typically have never had jobs in the commercial sector. WIBDI works hard to provide them with a support system and encourages them to continue to work towards financial independence. Without WIBDI's support it is unlikely farmers could continue to produce at current levels of quality and quantity. This raises the importance of partnerships considering the ground-level environment if they are to achieve sustainability.

“

The Body Shop is the primary buyer of coconut oil in Samoa and is beginning to expand to other countries in the Pacific, such as Tonga



Connecting Sichuan Healthcare Initiative

→ 2008–2010²⁴

PPNP Overview

Following the 2008 Sichuan (China) earthquake Cisco²⁵ agreed to provide post-earthquake relief support of \$US 2.6 million in aid, emergency communication infrastructure, and volunteers. Furthermore, they committed \$US 45 million over three years, via networking expertise, grants, and equipment donation, with the understanding that they would work with the Government and non-governmental organisations (NGOs) to improve the capacity of the health sector in Sichuan. The focus was to respond to the disaster and design and deliver innovative solutions for healthcare that were replicable, scalable, and sustainable.

The technology was designed to link urban and rural health clinics through a centralized data platform, sharing patient information and connecting specialists, nurses, and doctors. Medical workers in rural areas of Sichuan were supported by urban health centres via online systems, training, and guidance. The Chinese Government pledged full support and cooperation. According to Cisco, NGO partners provided advice on the necessary infrastructure, promoted the systems, and used the technology for their physical and psychological rehabilitation work. The project became known as “Connecting Sichuan”.

PPNP Formation

This project was driven primarily by Cisco with support from the Government (both provincial and national). The Sichuan Provincial Government and Cisco signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU), outlining Cisco's commitment to provide disaster relief and information and communication technology (ICT) support to the region. Cisco provided the design, products, and human resources. In return, the Government offered financial, political, and logistical support to their work. In interviews, Cisco stressed that it was a cross-sector partnership with relevant NGOs having high levels of input into the collaboration, specifically on project design. However, our research revealed that this may potentially be more motivated by Cisco wanting good ‘PR’ as one NGO referred to by Cisco claimed they had very little to do with the project. This raises an interesting issue around the perception of partners. For this case it could not be validated whether there was a specific or written agreement involving NGOs.

Commercial Opportunity

Cisco saw multiple benefits from their involvement. At first glance supporting the earthquake response effort was an opportunity to deliver on its corporate social responsibility (CSR) strategy.²⁶ Cisco, however, also appreciated that China,

24. The project has an education component; however, this case study focuses on the healthcare aspect only

25. A multinational company that designs, manufactures, and sells networking equipment

26. Cisco. 2009, *Connecting Sichuan Program at a glance*. Retrieved 5 June from: http://www.cisco.com/web/about/citizenship/socio-economic/specialprograms/docs/sichuan_overview.pdf

one of the world's largest and fastest growing economies, had huge market potential for their products. Dr. Yu Yi (Managing Director of Cisco Corporate Affairs and Manager of the Connecting Sichuan project) stated that as healthcare improvement is a long-term focus area of the Chinese Government it was beneficial for Cisco to demonstrate the expertise they could offer. Cisco saw various attractive elements to their involvement: brand development, key relationship-building with the Chinese public sector, and social responsibility benefits in providing technical expertise to help improve the quality of healthcare.

This partnership was a first between the Chinese Government and a U.S. private sector company, providing Cisco with a unique opportunity to present the strength of their products and form a connection with the Government and raise their profile in China:

“China is very important to Cisco and we want Cisco to be very important to China’s transformation”²⁷

Development Challenge

In 2008, an 8.0 magnitude earthquake struck Sichuan Province, China. 87,000 people were killed, hundreds of thousands were injured, and over four million were left without shelter.²⁸ The earthquake also destroyed important infrastructure such as hospitals and roads, and other community assets. Response to the survivors’ physical and psychological needs was limited due to the damage. The disaster put pressure on an already weak healthcare system, which, with a shortage of trained practitioners, struggled to provide care to rural areas such as Sichuan province.

Public Opportunity

The partnership with Cisco and the NGOs supported the Chinese Government’s efforts to rebuild Sichuan Province. Cisco’s long-term financial investment was of particular interest to the Government as it complemented their financial commitments to healthcare and provided relief after significant economic loss resulting from the earthquake. Furthermore, the “Connecting Sichuan” project was aligned

with the Chinese Government’s policies, particularly the 2020 health reform initiative, which aims to deliver universal health services throughout the country. By supporting Cisco’s ICT platform, the Government could evaluate its success and potentially replicate it across China.

High Level Outcomes

■ Business outcomes

Increased brand recognition and market share: Cisco has established smart hospitals, a regional healthcare cloud, tele-health (video conferencing), and mobile clinics. These ICT developments are viewed in China as important technological advancements. This provided Cisco with recognition as a premium ICT company. Evidence of their growth in China was seen in 2012 when Cisco signed a joint-partnership agreement with China Electronics Software Information Service Co. to further develop cloud technology in China.²⁹ Evidence of their market share in China can be seen in their revenue growth; in 2013, Cisco’s sales across Asia Pacific-Japan-China were up 10.2 percent (\$US 2.01bn) from the 2012 fiscal year.³⁰

Legitimacy with the government: The success of Cisco’s project led to a strong relationship with the Chinese Government with the Minister of Health endorsing the model. This has allowed the company to continue their move into the Chinese market, which is one of Cisco’s long-term strategies.

■ Development outcomes

Long-term victim support: Through the establishment of new health centres and enabling technology, NGOs were able to connect with earthquake victims more consistently. For instance, according to Cisco, by equipping hospitals with tele-health/tele-presence video-conferencing technology, the “StandTALL” Foundation was able to organize rehabilitation programmes for patients in Sichuan although they were based in Hong Kong.³¹ Before the introduction of this technology it was difficult for consultants to maintain contact with their patients.

Healthcare Collaboration: By linking rural and urban hospitals through technology, healthcare workers were able to work together to improve the quality of their care and connect with experts outside of their region. This was particularly important in the Sichuan Province as there was a lack of equipment and expertise in many of the poor rural areas. Through the implementation of the Regional Healthcare Cloud³², patients had access to advanced treatment options via online systems.

27. Morgan, T. 2012, *Cisco cuts costs, boosts profits faster than sales*. Retrieved from: http://www.theregister.co.uk/2012/11/14/cisco_q1_f2013_numbers/

28. Daniell, J. 2013, *Sichuan 2008: A disaster on an immense scale*. Retrieved 5 June from: <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/science-environment-22398684>

29. STL-Logistics Group. 2012, *The World IT leader creates a joint venture in China*. Retrieved 7 June from: <http://group-stl.com/news/2012/december/25/world-it-leader-creates-joint-venture-china>

30. Morgan, T. 2012, *Cisco cuts costs, boosts profits faster than sales*. Retrieved 7 June from: http://www.theregister.co.uk/2012/11/14/cisco_q1_f2013_numbers/

31. J. Li, 2009, *The Charity StandTALL Assists Sichuan Earthquake Amputees Uses Cisco Telepresence*. Retrieved 20 June from: <http://www.vcinsight.com/telepresence/telemedicine/78/the-charity-standtall-assists-sichuan-earthquake-amputees-uses-cisco-telepresence/>

32. Data centre built into an area network (cloud), connecting rural areas with urban centres.

Public outcomes

New business model: The success of this partnership demonstrated to the Government the strengths of cross-sector collaboration. The model has received attention across China, specifically for its distribution and integration of hospital resources among rural and urban areas. A review of the project by Peking University found that local government bodies are now open to using new ICT models.³³ The approach is also spreading beyond healthcare; for instance a town in Wenchuan County is using the ICT connecting model to inform tourists of their attractions (sharing information across regions and cities).

Supports public/Government initiatives: The project was designed to align with China's 2020 health reform initiative; working towards modernizing and nationalizing healthcare systems.³⁴ The Chinese Government views the project as a successful beginning to their long-term health strategies. A significant part of their reform strategy looks at making healthcare more affordable for the rural poor and Cisco worked with NGO partners to help make this a tangible goal. Cisco has acknowledged that the company's globalization plans are aligned with China's development plans.³⁵

“

Upon evaluation of this project certain questions were raised around the dangers of prematurely labelling a project as a 'PPNP'

33. Cisco. 2011, *Connecting Sichuan: A landmark partnership to revitalize communities by transforming healthcare, education, and the workforce*. Retrieved 5 June from: http://www.cisco.com/web/about/citizenship/socio-economic/specialprograms/docs/Connecting_Sichuan.pdf

34. The healthcare initiatives were designed as a collaborative delivery network: enabling providers throughout the healthcare system to share resources such as patient records. Smart hospitals: equipped with networked equipment to improve operational and management efficiency. The Telehealth: video conferencing. Mobile clinics: equipped with medical and networking technologies, they also surveyed rates of diseases in less-accessible regions.

35. STL-Logistics Group. 2012, *The World IT leader creates a joint venture in China*. Retrieved 5 June from: <http://group-stl.com/news/2012/december/25/world-it-leader-creates-joint-venture-china>

Role of Each Partner

Central Government; the Ministry of Commerce; China Customs; the Sichuan Provincial Government; the Sichuan Departments of Commerce and Health (public partners)

ROLE

Project co-developer:

- Provided policy and implementation support
- Department of Health was allocated funding to continue developing and supporting the system after Cisco withdrew
- Tax was waived from Cisco's product imports as the Chinese Government believed it to be appropriate after Cisco's large donations

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- This healthcare project acts as a building block towards the Chinese Government's 2020 health reform initiative
- The partnership has built numerous networking systems: IT infrastructure in 66 healthcare organisations, two operation centres, an emergency response centre, and an ICT training centre
- Public healthcare infrastructure improved: 32 digitalized hospitals, six regional healthcare centres, and three mobile clinics have been established, speeding up and extending the level healthcare around Sichuan

Cisco (private partner)

ROLE

Project co-developer and implementer:

- Donated the majority of the equipment
- Designed the systems and technology
- Provided experts to implement the project
- Established the Cisco Networking Academy to provide entry level technology training to young students in the region

Provided support to the partners:

- After the three-year project period, Cisco moved from the role of director and implementer to advisor to the local Government.

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- Brand recognition: 7,000 practitioners, 5,000 in-patients, and 280,000 out-patients interact with the technology each month
- Won Chinese philanthropy awards in 2008 and 2009
- Improved employee engagement (employees volunteered)
- Gained market insights through testing their products into what worked best for the patients and experts
- Benefited from resulting tax waivers

Role of Each Partner

Health for All By All (not-for-profit)

ROLE

- Worked with Red Cross to promote healthcare for the rural population

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- Unable to get information

Stand Tall (not-for-profit)

ROLE

- Provided physical rehabilitation of people
- Took part in the implementation and revision process (inviting orthopaedic surgeons to contribute as well)

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- Unable to get information

The Youth Foundation (not-for-profit)

ROLE

- Provided and trained in psychological counselling and rehabilitation services using the ITC systems

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- The Foundation indicated that they were not deeply involved in the project and therefore could not supply much information on benefits

Critical PPNP Success Factors

Project sustainability considered in the partnership

formation: The MOU at the start of the project considered the issue of project sustainability. It was agreed that after three years, and significant financial and other resource investment from Cisco, the local government would take charge of the project. They have now taken over the ownership from Cisco although Cisco remains engaged at an advisory level providing solution guides to technologies

and training programme. To date, data centres manage 60 million rural insurance records and over 400,000 electronic health records.³⁶ The Government is beginning to replicate the technological advances in other areas of China. The training of rural professionals by those in the urban medical centres and Cisco system experts helped support the project's sustainability, with directors of health centres noting their training has allowed them to manage their centres more effectively. This orchestrated hand-over meant that all parties could prepare for Cisco's departure and work to ensure sustainability.

Needs-based collaboration: Dr. Yu Yi stressed that Cisco's approach to healthcare development was needs-based. They researched the major issues and adapted technology to fit the environment and the needs. For example, the telecommunication system that provided psychological support was a unique system built specifically for the project, based on the needs identified by local NGOs. Dr. Yu Yi emphasised that even though Cisco was the driver of the project, collaboration between the partners was integral to achieving what no partner could have done alone or in a different partnering relationship, such as a contractual situation. However, our reflection is that the design of the project was based on Cisco's understanding of what the Chinese Government wanted, and, although NGOs appear to have been involved at some stage, evidence to support this is weak.

Challenges

Infrastructure issues: When Cisco first responded to the earthquake disaster, access to affected areas was a major issue due to damaged infrastructure. ICT infrastructure implemented by Cisco should ensure communities are more resilient to the subsequent impact of another disaster in terms of connectivity.

Trust: The healthcare reform technology introduced by Cisco was foreign to the people of Sichuan. The technology, change in workflow, and communication systems were all new. With this came scepticism and concern that Cisco would put the system in place and then abandon it.

- In response to these concerns, Cisco and the local government started the programme gradually, giving users time to see its value. Their ongoing commitment to the region has helped to change perceptions, leading to greater product acceptance. The number of times Cisco has been invited back to the region to visit, as well as the implementation of the products in other areas, exemplifies this strengthened relationship. It also emphasises that the private partner invested extra effort, which did not immediately provide commercial returns, but proved invaluable for long-term business outcomes.

Partner bias: Upon evaluation of this project certain questions were raised around the dangers of prematurely labelling a project as a 'PPNP'. Although NGOs may have been consulted, the concern is that, for a project that referred to itself as a 'public-private, not-for-profit collaboration', the power dynamics and design within this project were strongly biased towards the strategic objectives of the public and private partners.

36. Cisco. 2011, *Connecting Sichuan: A landmark partnership to revitalize communities by transforming healthcare, education, and the workforce*. Retrieved 5 June from: http://www.cisco.com/web/about/citizenship/socio-economic/specialprograms/docs/Connecting_Sichuan.pdf



Revitalization of Smallholder Agricultural Production in Zimbabwe (RSAPZ)



→ October 2010–September 2012^{37 38}

PPNP Overview

In October 2010 the RSAPZ project was awarded a grant of \$US 2 million by USAID to directly support 1,700 smallholder-farmers in the Honde Valley of Manicaland Province, the eastern-most province of Zimbabwe, and increase the financial viability of commercially orientated tea and coffee farms. The project was designed with two strategic goals: to increase productivity and to enhance farmer support systems. Initially, a value chain analysis was carried out by World Vision Zimbabwe (WVZ) and another non-governmental organisation (NGO) Netherlands Development Organisation (SNV) to identify and address the business gaps and capacity limitations among farmers. It was further used to identify markets. Due to the fact that tea and coffee are long-term agriculture investments, the project took a three-pronged approach to agricultural sustainability by supporting production of maize and quick-win cash crops (sugar beans) to help mitigate the issue of food and income insecurity (i.e. helping to ensure that inputs for coffee and tea production were not diverted to household food production).

Production increase was supported through the promotion of sustainable farming practices such as water management, conservation farming (e.g., mulching and crop rotation), and the use of demonstration plots where farmers were trained in

planting, harvesting, and agronomic practices. Coffee and tea extension staff, coordinated through the private local partners, government agencies, and WVZ, provided the technical advice needed for sustainable farming.

The private partners Zimbabwe Coffee Mill (ZCM) and Honde Valley Development Smallholder Development Company (HVSDC) worked with farmer associations to train their members in business skills. Smallholder producer co-operatives were both formed and strengthened; they were trained on subjects such as collective marketing, production practices, and business management. The involvement of women was also a consideration; training sessions were designed to consider their needs, and RSAPZ aimed to have women make up 50 percent of all project committees.

The need for quality inputs was an essential factor in the revitalisation of farms and became a focus of the project. For instance, irrigation equipment was designed to mitigate the effects of erratic weather such as droughts. The project used Government officers and a trainer-to-trainer model (trainees became trainers) to help reach a large number of farmers in a cost effective way and turn farmer groups into commercially viable producer groups. To help farmers' access agricultural inputs for crops a voucher-based seed and fertilizer system was established and distributed through agro-dealers.³⁹

37. Extended until September 2013 under WV's Area Development Programme sponsorship funding to ensure a smooth transition.

38. The majority of the content for this study was retrieved from two sources: USAID & World Vision. 2012, *Revitalization of Smallholder Agricultural Production in Zimbabwe (RSAPZ) Project: End of Project Report October 2010-June 2012*, USAID Cooperative Agreement and Chaipa, I., Jasi, P. & Sango, D. 2012, *End of Project Evaluation Report: Revitalisation of Smallholder Agricultural Production in Zimbabwe (RSAPZ) 2010-2012*, World Vision Zimbabwe

39. Beneficiaries' received a free input voucher that could be redeemed through community agro-dealers who received a commission for their service.

PPNP Formation

RSAPZ was a private sector/market driven project, meaning that the two NGOs (SNV and WVZ) sourced the companies, Honde Valley Smallholder Development Company (HVSDC) and Zimbabwe Coffee Mill (ZCM), before beginning to re-establish the production and processing systems. Furthermore, the NGOs established that there were U.S. and South African importers and domestic companies interested in buying the processed coffee and tea. This preplanning was done with the understanding that demand-led production and a public, private, not-for-profit partnership (led by SNV and WVZ) would foster an environment that enabled farmers to participate in the market and increase their income. Alongside this, due to input-shortages, private companies and the Government required additional support to achieve production revitalisation.

The RSAPZ project coordinated its activities with other projects in the region through a perennial crop management board hosted by the Zimbabwe Coffee Mill. This was to encourage collaboration and harmonization of crop production.

Each partner invested and engaged in different aspects of training and capacity building of the farmers. Constant reviews took place to ensure that farmers were being supported and the private partners were seeing an increase in outputs. Education on revolving funds and loan systems was provided to farmers. The objective was to foster a sustainable project and increase the presence of private companies in the credit scheme.⁴⁰ Frequent meetings with farmers and the private processors were held to ensure clear communication and negotiations, appreciating the value of an informed and transparent partnership.

Commercial Opportunity

As a consequence of political and economic instability ZCM experienced a 98 percent decline in processing between 1993 and 2001.⁴¹ It was estimated that tea production was operating at less than 20 percent of its capacity.⁴² HVSDC and ZCM recognised the potential for an increase in their production and output from improved farming and marketing techniques. They also saw value in revitalizing the farmers' lands, incentivising production to remain in the area and economically empowering the community. It was a strategically significant task, given the on-going macro-economic situation in Zimbabwe at the time and considering the high level of urban migration. The private companies wanted to invest in the project beyond just financial assistance, appreciating the fact that without an understanding of how business works, farmers would make unreliable business partners. By educating farmers on business management, HVSDC and ZCM assumed that this would facilitate stable supply and market linkages.

Development Challenge

Up until the late 1990s many smallholder farmers in Zimbabwe received significant income from coffee and tea production. Land reforms, changes in weather patterns, and the challenging political climate resulted in a deteriorating macro-economic situation⁴³ leading to economic instability and reduced production. These factors, combined with a lack of affordable agricultural inputs for farmers, weak technical support, and a lack of access to markets and credit, meant that coffee production, in particular, dropped significantly (700 metric tonnes (MT) in 1991/1992 to 2.5 MT in 2009).⁴⁴ Tea production also declined and the number of farmers in production dropped from the thousands to the hundreds by 2010. Over the last decade, this has created a serious reduction in household income for many families that once relied on income from coffee and tea.

Through their research into the value chain, WVZ and SNV saw potential in supporting smallholder farmers in the Honde Valley region. The aim was to create sustainable additional income, stimulate job opportunities, and increase farm-business efficiency.

Public Opportunity

The Agricultural Technical and Extension Department of the Ministry of Agriculture (AGRITEX) was already looking at opportunities to support tea and coffee farmers and saw this project as a way to complement their work. Agronomy and business-skill training for tea and coffee production was appealing to AGRITEX as it had the potential to create a production line with economic value, contributing towards the Government's strategic goals of reinvigorating agricultural production and export.



40. USAID & World Vision. 2012, *Revitalization of Smallholder Agricultural Production in Zimbabwe (RSAPZ) Project: End of Project Report October 2010-June 2012*, USAID Cooperative Agreement

41. Mudyazvivi, E. 2011, *Recovering Lost Livelihoods: The case of smallholder plantation crops in Zimbabwe*, SNV Netherlands Development Organisation.

42. *ibid*

43. As a consequence of changes in the socio-economic climate, such as: hyperinflation, emigration, and changes to landowner legislations.

44. Mudyazvivi, E.2011, *Recovering Lost Livelihoods: The case of smallholder plantation crops in Zimbabwe*

High Level Outcomes

Although this project has had many positive outcomes, its long-term impact remains uncertain due to the cultivation period of the seeds for the particular crops involved (coffee has a long gestation period). The true benefits will be seen in the next three years. However, because of the unstable political and economic climate partners are uncertain as to how this PPNP will evolve; the current macro-economic climate does pose a threat to the project's stability.⁴⁵

■ Business outcomes

Production increase: The improved production and agriculture practices had significant results for the private companies involved, with 1,000 MTs of tea leaves sold and 50 hectares of coffee planted. The local nurseries carried out successful seed propagation and there has been an increase in arable land for farmers involved in the project, which means there is the potential for further and sustainable cultivation of tea and coffee. Both private partners acknowledge that the external support from HVSDC and SNV significantly contributed to the recovery of the land.⁴⁶ This has enhanced their appreciation for the work of NGOs and the potential of future partnerships.

Increase in farmer collaboration and skill base: Josephat Rushinga, the General Manager of ZCM, noted a key success of the project was that it “rejuvenated” the interest of smallholder farmers in coffee farming resulting in greater collaboration between ZCM and smallholder farmers. Aside from direct beneficiaries, there were around 20 farmers (across five hectares) who used their own resources to establish new coffee plantations. Overall, ZCM saw improvement in the technical and business skill levels of the coffee farmers involved in the project.

■ Development outcomes

Increase in resource and knowledge capacity: There is increased participation by farmers in collective bargaining and improved knowledge in areas of agriculture, intercropping, and seedling production. A final review by USAID⁴⁷ found that 74 percent of farmer cooperative members regularly attended farming meetings. The project facilitated marketing improvements through business training, resulting in a greater number of contracts. The long-term success will be assessed when the coffee seeds have matured and the tea is re-pruned and harvested. It is hoped farmers' cooperatives will secure a meaningful gross profit margin. In addition, the participating farmers have acquired capital assets, such as sprayers, which increase productivity in the long-term.

Food security: There was an improvement in household security resulting in 75 percent of beneficiaries harvesting cereals that would last 12 months (a 44.2 percent increase).⁴⁸

Infrastructure development: Prior to the project there were unfinished, abandoned irrigation schemes. Efforts to rebuild these have seen an increase in the farmers' confidence in the project. The completion of an irrigation scheme will benefit farming practices and, in turn, the wider community.

Strengthened relationships: WVZ believes that the strengthened relationship between themselves and the Zimbabwe Government is a point of success. The interaction between the WV Area Development Programme⁴⁹ and the various district government departments on issues such as agronomy and irrigation has been a beneficial outcome in the eyes of WVZ. It has the potential to ensure project sustainability and allow for collaboration on future projects.

■ Public outcomes

Income: The gross income from tea sales increased from \$US 66,268.08 to \$US 144,360.46 between 2010 and 2012, representing a 117 percent increase in sales.⁵⁰ There was a 30 percent increase in household income compared to non-beneficiaries.⁵¹ This has accelerated profit generation and economic activity in the agricultural sector at district and national levels, enhancing Zimbabwe's national strategy of re-invigorating the national economy.

Employment opportunities: Employment creation was an important focus and a successful outcome of the project. By 2012, for the 1700 beneficiary households, around 1760 direct employment opportunities were created (with more than one household member working permanently on the farm), 850 of which were female. Some farmers have now moved into the coffee nursery business and many have become private sector employees, working in the processing plants.



45. As a result of ongoing civil unrest, political instability, increasing international sanctions imposed on the government

46. Chaipa, I., Jasi, P. & Sango, D. 2012, *End of Project Evaluation Report: Revitalisation of Smallholder Agricultural Production in Zimbabwe (RSAPZ) 2010-2012*.

47. USAID & World Vision. 2012, *Revitalization of Smallholder Agricultural Production in Zimbabwe (RSAPZ) Project: End of Project Report October 2010-June 2012*, USAID Cooperative Agreement

48. *Ibid*, p.4

49. A World Vision programme to support a particular community for a period of approximately 15 years

50. USAID & World Vision. 2012, *Revitalization of Smallholder Agricultural Production in Zimbabwe (RSAPZ) Project: End of Project Report October 2010-June 2012*, p.4

51. *Ibid*

Role of Each Partner

AGRITEX (Agricultural Technical and Extension Department in the government under Ministry of Agriculture) (public partner)

ROLE

Project implementer and consultant:

- Provided farmer training in tea, coffee, and summer crop agronomy
- Involved in the consultation process and resolving implementation issues
- Working on implementing the irrigation scheme
- Supported the training programme

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

The increase in employment, land rehabilitation and income growth met the Government's strategic goal for revitalizing smallholder farms:

- 300 jobs created in tea and coffee farming, 100 jobs created in private sector companies in tea and coffee processing;
- Increase in overall gross income by 7% for farmers;
- Improvement in business skills in the region, strengthening small holder sector production

ZCM (Zimbabwe Coffee Mills-Private sector) (private partner)

ROLE

Private investor and trainer:

- Provided farmer training on coffee agronomy – through ZCM Field Extension Officers
- Responsible for coffee processing and marketing

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

Increase in supply resulted in an increase in business for ZCM:

- 6% increase in coffee production with expected further increases
- 500 new coffee farmers were contracted and established 60ha of new coffee plantings

HVSDC (Honde Valley Smallholder Tea Development Company) (private partner)

ROLE

Private investor and trainer:

- Provided farmer training in tea agronomy
- Helped link the smallholder farmers with the commercial farmers who process the leaf
- Provided logistical support and supplied pruning machines to help farmers reclaim their land
- Responsible for tea processing and marketing
- HVSDC Field Extension Officers provided further training
- Along with WV, helped established a local nursery for tea and coffee seedlings

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

Increase in supply resulted in the increase in business for HVSDC:

- 48% increase in tea production from 2000 to 2003
- 368% increase in return earning for tea production from 2000 to 2003
- The pruning machines allowed 700 farmers to move back into production, meaning there were more deliveries of green leaf to HVSDC and an improvement in quality
- As a result of the nursery HVSDC raised 87,000 tea and 240,000 coffee seedlings, allowing for increased production
- In less than a month over 450 hectares of tea fields were reclaimed

SNV (Netherlands Development Organisation) (not-for-profit partner)

ROLE

Support partner working to strengthen farmer capacity:

- Assisted in value-chain analysis
- Trained farmers on business skills and market analysis
- Facilitated contract farming with tea and coffee companies
- Strengthened producer groups
- Developed training material
- Created a Multi-Stakeholder Platform to increase collaboration (WV, SNZ and Tea and Coffee commodity associations)

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- Helped to achieve their strategic goal of enhancing farmer support systems and establishing links between producers

Role of Each Partner

World Vision Zimbabwe (not-for-profit partner)

ROLE

Primary manager, coordinator and monitor of the project:

- Provided training and educated farmers on credit models
- Communicated with the private sector partners

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- The successes of this project were in line with their project goals; production and productivity increase and the enhancement of farmer support systems
- Strengthened the relationship with the Government

World Vision United States (not-for-profit informal partner)

ROLE

- Match-funded the project in its initial stages (via USAID)

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- Strengthened the relationship with the Government of Zimbabwe
- Supported the USAID annual programme statement of increasing partnerships with the private sector. This reflected positively on WVUS

Participating farmers (beneficiaries)

ROLE

- Beneficiaries of the initiative

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- Improved household food security; 75% of beneficiaries have harvested cereals that will last two months (44.2% increase)
- Increase in household purchases on food and non-food items
- Improved farmer knowledge in conservation agriculture practices and home nursery care
- Increase in overall crop sales
- Farmers are gaining smallholder farm certification, supporting sustainability beyond the intervention

Critical PPNP Success Factors

“Capacity building, demand-led production and private-public partnerships provided the enabling environment for farmers to more equitably participate in the market and ultimately increased household income.”⁵²

Stakeholder engagement and collaboration: By working with smallholder farmers, partnering with private companies, engaging with the Government (e.g. Ministry of Agriculture), and working alongside other relevant parties, the RSAPZ project was able to link all relevant stakeholders together and leverage private and public support to strategically change the capabilities of 1,700 farmers. The NGOs ensured there was continual interaction with the stakeholders; technical subcommittees, stakeholder meetings, and project reviews were frequently instigated to support the project outcomes and encourage communication. SNV stressed the importance of transparency between all parties as a key component to successful collaboration. ZCM believes that the high collaboration and farmer involvement reduced the level of mistrust between farmers and private processors.

Ownership: Each partner contributed to the increase in farmer capabilities, whether through business development, marketing techniques, or production training. The involvement from each partner was substantial. The project was implemented under WV’s long-term area development programme; AGRITEX’s involvement was planned to continue after the end of the project; the private sector involvement in the value chain ensured economic returns; and lead farmers were trained to support other farmers. This meaningful stakeholder involvement resulted in a shared sense of ownership and responsibility. Furthermore, both coffee and tea are long-term investments, meaning that the commercial partners have vested interests in the farmers’ long-term success and sustainability

Contingency planning: The use of contingency planning proved successful: The HVSDC nursery produced a surplus of seedlings, allowing for some losses between the growing and distribution period. Value-chain analysis was used throughout the project, identifying and addressing gaps and limitations facing farmers and traders. Conservation agriculture was well established in the area by AGRITEX before the project, which meant the participants had land ready to cultivate.

52. *ibid*, p.3

Challenges

Delays: The original plan was to distribute the coffee seedlings to 500 coffee farmers during the project's first year, on the understanding that the coffee seedlings were already available in Zimbabwe.

- The screening process revealed the risk of spreading fusarium (invasive fungus) to the Honde Valley. The initial plan was to distribute coffee seeds but, because of the disease a breeding nursery was established to provide enough seedlings for the region.

Infrastructure issues: The breakdown of tractors and other equipment delayed the overall production. In response to this the maintenance of the tractors was given high priority. However, the lack of access to agriculture inputs has been raised by many farmers. Sporadic rainfall meant that farmers also cited absence of irrigation as a key issue.

- The Ministry of Agriculture's Department of Irrigation is helping to construct and rehabilitate dams and irrigation systems.

Pricing and repayment: Participants in the project bought seedlings at a higher price than those sold by some local dealers. Farmers and HVSDC are also concerned about the low prices of green tea leaf (the unstable economic situation means they struggle to keep up with inflation). There have been reports that farmers deliberately understate their crop yields and do not reveal their true income level when repayments are made.

- SNV's effective brokering role between the farmers and HVSDC and the Tea Association was said to be very helpful. Farmers were organized into groups and the group leaders were responsible for following up on repayments. To support those who were genuinely struggling to repay the loans the date to make the final repayments was extended. Therefore, the NGO was an effective broker.

Sustainability: The viability of the project was threatened by its short time span; the gestation period for coffee is three years and the project was only for two years. ZCM has concerns the project is not sustainable as it is difficult for farmers to find inputs to sustain the crops for three years. However, the technical and business skills and strengthening of market linkages do provide a sound basis for moving forward. WVZ hopes the project will progress to providing farmers with greater financial assistance and training around repayment models, allowing them to maintain their yields.



“
The gross income from
tea sales increased
from \$ US 66,268.08
to \$ US 144,360.46
between 2010
and 2012



Creating opportunities

for smallholder beekeepers in Ethiopia

→ Pilot phase: 2003
Scale up: 2010–ongoing⁵³

PPNP Overview

This livelihood development programme evolved from a 2003 pilot project, which aimed to show the potential for commercial beekeeping in Ethiopia, particularly in the Amhara region. The pilot was funded by Oxfam and executed by SOS Sahel, a non-governmental organization (NGO) working with herders and farmers in Africa’s dry lands. The focus was on reducing poverty by supporting smallholder farmers in apiculture, with a particular focus on women and landless people. Beekeeping is a viable income option for landless people as it requires little space and landowners are willing to pay for people to set up hives for crop pollination.⁵⁴ The introduction of more accessible hives allowed women to overcome cultural barriers that had traditionally kept them out of beekeeping. Previously, honey collection involved climbing trees to reach the hives, a culturally unacceptable activity for women.

SOS Sahel and Oxfam concentrated on the development and strengthening of co-operatives, comprising of 2,100 farmer households. In 2006, SOS Sahel, with support from the NGO Netherlands Development Organization (SNV), established the women-led Zembaba Beekeeper Co-Operatives Union. These organizations trained others in production techniques and new hive technology (Kenyan top bar hives are easy to use and are at ground level rather than in trees).⁵⁵ Local government provided advice and helped build the capacity of the cooperatives.⁵⁶ In a combined effort between the

government agencies and NGOs, honey collection and processing centres were set up in eight villages, substantially reducing travelling time for producers. This provided women with greater market access. The NGOs supported the Meket Microfinance Institute in establishing a credit facility, allowing cooperatives to purchase honey from member beekeepers. This pilot was successful, with many producer groups becoming organically certified and over 3,500 farmers increasing their productivity.

In 2010, Oxfam decided to scale up the project, wanting to connect the smallholders with formal markets through the introduction of a private sector partner.⁵⁷ At this point the project evolved into a PPNP. Oxfam switched from being heavily involved in the ground-level work to becoming the facilitator, pulling together the other partners in the project. Ambrosia PLC (an Ethiopian-owned honey exporter based in France) was identified as a promising partner due to its knowledge of the area, commitment to social responsibility, and its previous study into Ethiopian honey. Oxfam and Ambrosia agreed to a long-term plan that would expand the pilot phase. Ambrosia signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) with the co-operatives and the Zembaba Union to purchase raw honey and market their produce.⁵⁸ Ambrosia collects the honey when production has reached five metric tonnes (MT).⁵⁹ The MoU supported the Zembaba Union’s aim to become the primary producer of honey and cultivator of bees for commercial sale in the region.

53. Our attempts to contact the partners have been unsuccessful. From our research it seems the project is ongoing.
54. Anand, S. & Sisay, G. 2011, *Engaging Smallholders in Value Chains: Creating new opportunities for beekeepers in Ethiopia*, Oxfam GB, Oxford. p.1
55. *ibid*, p.3
56. *ibid*
57. In 2008 the EU approved Ethiopia as a honey exporter
58. *ibid*, p.5
59. Once there is assurance that a co-op is a reliable supplier, the honey producers are paid up to 30 % in advance

PPNP Formation

SOS Sahel and Oxfam initiated the project. Soon after, the Government and relevant ministries joined the partnership, helping to ensure the policy environment was conducive to the commercial success of beekeeping. The Government also supported capacity building of farmers. Ambrosia PLC was the third formal partner, identifying the partnership as an opportunity to increase their production output. The public and not-for-profit sector saw the involvement as integral, providing:

“access to larger and more stable markets both within Ethiopia and for export, and would also leverage greater investment to develop the co-operatives’ processing and marketing activities”⁶⁰

Ambrosia also set up beekeeper training schools with Oxfam to help turn subsistence beekeeping into commercial production.⁶¹

All partners and beneficiaries belonged to regional groupings that allowed producer groups to talk with the key stakeholders (the NGOs, Ambrosia PLC, and government agencies) on issues such as price of honey.⁶² These communication channels worked as a mechanism to ensure that there was a shared focus for the project as well as giving partners the opportunity to support their own goals.

The NGOs’ commitment to involving females in the project was viewed, by the other partners, as a valuable contribution as it incorporated a social element into a commercial venture, something that they would not have focused on in a regular subcontracting arrangement.

The Commercial Opportunity

Honey and bee products are an attractive commodity. There is global demand because of colony collapse disorder (CCD), which especially affects northern hemisphere bee populations. Furthermore, there is an unmet global market demand for organic honey. Ethiopia already had over 10 million bee colonies before the project started.⁶³ Ambrosia saw involvement in the project as a promising opportunity in line with their motivation to become the market leader of bee products in Ethiopia. The company already had production sites in Ethiopia capable of processing and packaging large

quantities of honey and bee products for export; they also had a contract with CSV International, an overseas honey buyer. Unorganized local supply had meant they had not been able to meet CSV International’s demand. Ambrosia saw the partnership as a means to ensure stable export levels.⁶⁴

The Development Challenge

Ethiopia has the highest population of any landlocked country in the world and after various famines and civil war the country remains deep in poverty. Oxfam found that poor production techniques, poor technology, infrastructure issues, cultural barriers, and investment capital challenges meant the country’s output was well below its potential. It produced just 43,000 MT of honey per annum rather than its potential of 500,000 MT and, with 95 percent of beekeepers engaging in traditional practices, the quality remained poor.⁶⁵ Limited market access forced the producers to sell locally at low prices. Oxfam and SOS Sahel recognized that “honey and beeswax provides a secondary source of income for smallholder farmers”.⁶⁶ As honey has a long shelf life there is the ability to balance supply and demand, meaning less production pressures, compared with other agriculture crops, for the beekeepers.

The Public Opportunity

Public partners in this project included local, regional, and national bodies. The commercial opportunity for beekeeping as a microeconomic enabler was the main motivation for their involvement. Prior to Oxfam’s project the regional government had identified districts with the potential for commercial beekeeping, establishing their own plan to help strengthen the unions and modernize beekeeping. Crop-diversification to improve farmers’ disaster resilience was regarded as an important factor with honey being a relatively stable and easy source of income creation for farmers. Furthermore, the Amhara region was targeted by these government agencies as it already accounted for nearly 25 percent of Ethiopia’s honey production.⁶⁷

High Level Outcomes

■ Business outcomes

Stability of supply: In 2008, as a consequence of an unstable supply, Ambrosia was unable to fulfil the CSV International contract demand of 2,300 MT of honey a year. This project has helped ensure a stable supply of honey for Ambrosia, promoting their aim to become the market leader for honey export from the Amhara region.

60 Anand, S. & Sisay, G. 2011, *Engaging Smallholders in Value Chains: Creating new opportunities for beekeepers in Ethiopia*, p.4

61. *ibid*

62. *ibid*

63. *ibid*

64. *ibid*

65. *ibid*

66. *ibid*, p.1

67. King, S. 2013, *Involving marginalized women in collective action: Making a difference through NGO interventions*, Oxfam GB, Oxford. p.2

Brand recognition and business expansion: Ambrosia's involvement extended beyond product sourcing. They collaborated with Oxfam in the establishment of the training and demonstration schools. Because of the high number of people moving through these schools Ambrosia's brand became well recognised by those in the region and the number of potential suppliers increased.

■ Development outcomes

Technology adoption: The use of the new hive technology has proved successful. The hives are relatively cheap, do not have to be mounted on trees, and do not need much space or physical strength for maintenance. This has enabled both women and the landless to participate. They have also greatly improved the quality of bee products and production levels so much so that "four modern hives can earn as much as half a hectare of maize or teff".⁶⁸

Women's engagement: To further enhance women's active engagement, the cooperatives and Union have now amended their bylaws so more than one person per household can join their organisation. This has dramatically increased the number of women involved. For example, in the Agunta cooperative, the number of women grew from just one in 2006 to 197 in 2007.⁶⁹ Women becoming beekeepers resulted in a shift in the culturally-based interpretation of women's roles both within their households and their communities. By introducing women to this type of farming they have had the opportunity to move away from crops with low profit margins and saturated markets to high-value, non-perishable products. This has contributed to a more sustainable income.⁷⁰ Due to the success of the project Oxfam is now investing in a hive factory in Amhara, aiming at increasing participation of women under a joint venture.

Diversification and expansion: Most participants have switched from the traditional beekeeping methods and hives. Some farmers have started to produce beeswax, diversifying their product offering. The scale-up phase of the project gave the farmers and the Union the confidence to enter the commercial market. The Union is now looking to expand their export market and is exploring options in the Middle East. They are also looking at the benefits of Fair Trade labelling.

■ Public outcomes

Increase in skill base: There has been a marked increase in literacy rates and business skills amongst women involved. The project also created secondary industries: the Union requires storekeepers, distributors, and farm equipment producers. Women are also employed to make the protective clothing required for beekeeping: gloves, veils, and overalls.

Project expansion: The Bureau of Agriculture and Rural Development and the Regional Agriculture Research Institute, who make wax foundation sheets for bees to build their honeycombs,⁷¹ have begun purchasing wax from the farmers. There is further potential to export beeswax to cosmetic and pharmaceutical companies.

Role of Each Partner

Amhara Government, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, and the regional Co-operative Promotion Bureau (public partner)

ROLE

Provides capacity, policy, and stakeholder support:

- Oversees the rural development policies
- Local, regional, and national government offices involved in the information sharing forum with honey value chain stakeholders
- Assisted in organizing farmers into co-ops and providing technical and managerial support
- Provides loans through the cooperatives so that farmers can buy modern hives

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- The project is aligned with the Ethiopia's national objective to increase bee production
- The Government has seen a growth in family income and those families are now investing in education⁷²
- More people are now in recognised employment

Ambrosia PLC. (private partner)

ROLE

Product buyer:

- Signed a contract beginning in 2010 to purchase raw honey from co-operatives
- Offered pre-financing, training and marketing services

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- Supports their strategic goal to be primary exporter of honey in the region
- Investment in smallholder groups helps them meet their supply orders from CSV International
- Productivity in the region has increased from 5-10 kg per hive per year to 20-30 kg (a 300% increase), quality also improved, enhancing brand reputation

68. Anand, S. & Sisay, G. 2011, *Engaging Smallholders in Value Chains: Creating new opportunities for beekeepers in Ethiopia*

69. King, S. 2013, *Involving marginalized women in collective action: Making a difference through NGO interventions*, Oxfam, Oxford. p.6

70. *ibid*

71. Anand, S. & Sisay, G. 2011, *Engaging Smallholders in Value Chains: Creating new opportunities for beekeepers in Ethiopia*

72. Anand, S. & Sisay, G. 2011, *Engaging Smallholders in Value Chains: Creating new opportunities for beekeepers in Ethiopia*

Role of Each Partner

Oxfam (not-for-profit partner)

ROLE

Project co-developer:

- Provided funding for the pilot
- Focused on involving females by subsidising hives and setting up women's self-help groups
- Conducted a feasibility study on bee products and a gender focused value chain analysis
- Provided training to farmers and access to credit and markets

Project facilitator and manager:

- Monitors quality standards and production
- Shares information with all partners
- Targets new farmers for co-operative membership
- Identifies opportunities to add value to the products (e.g. branding and certification)

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- The success of the project aligns with one of Oxfam's strategic objectives - to increase women's economic leadership⁷³
- The success of the value chain is evident through secondary business opportunities; e.g. protective clothing production
- There were significant levels of engagement: In 2011 there were 36 registered co-operatives (compared with six in 2003), a total of around 10,500 members⁷⁴

SOS Sahel Ethiopia (not-for-profit partner)

ROLE

Project co-developer and manager:

- Supported the original six co-operatives and helped establish the Zembaba Beekeeper Co-operatives' Union
- Provided support for packaging and organic certification
- Trained farmers in production and marketing

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

The project is aligned with their organisational goal to give people in Africa control over their economic and natural resources:

- 3,500 farmers organically certified

SNV Netherlands (not-for-profit)

ROLE

- Offers technical support to the Zembaba Union and facilitates organic certification
- With the Chamber of Commerce, co-ordinates a national committee supporting the beekeeping sector

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- The success in the Amhara region is aligned with their strategic goal to create sustainable livelihoods for those living in poverty
- Ongoing talks around a national regulatory framework for beekeeping

Zembaba Beekeepers Cooperatives Union (comprised of nine cooperatives)

ROLE

An umbrella organisation that helps to boost productivity, capacity, processing, and marketing of the co-operatives:

- Produces the beekeepers' clothes
- Provides training on modern beekeeping
- Offers hives on credit to be paid back when honey is sold through the Union
- Helped women organize self-help groups
- Set up collection centres so women didn't have to travel far

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

The Zembaba Union is working towards its goals to be the a leading honey producer in the region and have a greater percentage of women in the Union:

- Over one-fifth of the 3,700 members in the Zembaba Union are women
- In 2009–2010 25 tonnes of honey and wax were sold through the Union
- In the first year of the MoU with Ambrosia (2010) the Zembaba Union had collected over 100 tonnes (on their way to meeting the agreed target)

73. Oxfam, 2013. *Women's Economic Leadership*. Retrieved 1 June from: <http://policy-practice.oxfam.org.uk/our-work/food-livelihoods/womens-economic-leadership>

74. *ibid*

Role of Each Partner

Female farmers (project beneficiaries)

ROLE

Beneficiaries of the project

TANGIBLE BENEFITS

- Because of the production and processing location changes women gained greater negotiation power and involvement in the market
- Since the project began-women producers' income has risen by up to 200%⁷⁵
- Women's participation in co-ops increased from 1% to 17% over the project period⁷⁶
- The modern hives increased the quality of the honey and allowed women to move away from tej (honey wine) production to table honey

Critical PPNP Success Factors

NGO focus on gender: the NGOs involved offered targeted support to overcome the barriers women faced and identified an appropriate commercial commodity to promote.⁷⁷ Consultation with the husbands of the women beekeepers who were involved in the project improved the acceptance of the women's new role. Women said that support from their families, particularly their husbands, was a critical factor in their own success.⁷⁸ The support system that Oxfam and SOS Sahel offered is a testament to the ground level work and cultural understanding that NGOs can provide in a partnership.

Capacity building by the NGO: The intensive training, support systems, and investment provided by SOS Sahel and Oxfam, prior to private sector involvement, enabled them to assure Ambrosia PLC that the beekeepers' skill and capacity were at an appropriate level for commercial entities.

Political environment: the support of the Government from the outset was integral to the project's success. The Governments committed to marketing, trading, certification, and commercial involvement. The Government, Zembaba Union, and SNV are now considering the future shape of a national regulatory framework, that will provide the beekeeping industry with enough support to allow Oxfam and other NGO partners to withdraw.⁷⁹

Collaboration: Commitment to the PPNP is evident from the high level of communication between all parties. The value chain analysis was conducted with input from many of the stakeholders, especially the Government. This allowed for shared awareness of the challenges and the opportunity to provide suggestions about the design and implementation of the project. For example, the goal to concentrate on women's involvement was agreed upon by all partners. Oxfam argues that 'win-win' market opportunities (like this one) are of value:

“Development actors can use ‘win-win’ market opportunities as a leverage point to encourage individuals, communities and companies to support increased women’s participation and visibility in market activities”⁸⁰

Challenges

Financing and trade barriers: There are no “mainstream financial institutions for co-operatives and Unions;”⁸¹ which are required for NGOs to be able to reduce their involvement and ensure long-term project sustainability. Trade barriers mean that small-scale beekeepers cannot develop their own brand. This leaves them dependent on the Union. The partnership has not been able to address this issue. The commercial partner, however, benefits from the situation.

Environmental sustainability: Sustainability of the project depends on the livelihood of the bees; thus, maintaining healthy flora is essential. However, erratic rainfall, climate change impact, and deforestation place flora at risk.

Limited product diversification: There has been a heavy focus on beeswax and honey, with technology and skills restricting entry into other product markets, such as propolis and bee venom which hold high market demand.

Female engagement: Although the number of female beekeepers is rising, the number is still relatively low, especially at leadership levels within the co-operatives. All partners are working to address this through targeted training and marketing.

75. Anand, S. & Sisay, G. 2011, *Engaging Smallholders in Value Chains: Creating new opportunities for beekeepers in Ethiopia*, p.7

76. *ibid*, p.9

77. King, S. 2013, *Involving marginalized women in collective action: Making a difference through NGO interventions*

78. *ibid*

79. Anand, S. & Sisay, G. 2011, *Engaging Smallholders in Value Chains: Creating new opportunities for beekeepers in Ethiopia*, p.7

80. *ibid*, p.11

81. *ibid*

Conclusion

The aim of this research was to provide some practical examples of PPNPs for the private, public, and not-for-profit sectors in New Zealand, and to generate interest and discussion about how such partnerships might enhance their engagement with the Pacific. To assist this discussion, we conclude with an overview of the key findings from the five case studies, while recognizing the limitations of our small sample size. The key findings are:

1. There is no standard PPNP 'model'
 2. The 'traditional' roles of each sector are blurred in PPNPs
 3. Opportunities to leverage resources, capabilities, and market access are a key driver for participation in PPNPs
 4. Communication and trust are vital
 5. Long-term sustainability of the partnerships is difficult but not impossible
 6. Future research and acknowledgement of such partnerships will help strengthen the PPNP approach/concept
 7. There are features of PPNPs that could be beneficial to Pacific development
-

1. No standard PPNP model

There was no common template for what a PPNP looked like in these case studies. In fact, all the partnerships in the case studies evolved into a PPNP on an *ad hoc* basis, and thus were not intentionally 'designed'. Although in many cases the role and motivations of the partner could be deciphered, it was not necessarily formally discussed at any point. In the case of the Eureka Forbes Rural Water Initiative this proved problematic, giving rise to discord because of the lack of clarity among partners of what each actually expected as a return on investment (particularly the not-for-profit and private sectors).

The main facilitators or motivating partners varied from project to project: The Virgin Coconut Oil (VCO) partnership and the Beekeeping partnership in Ethiopia were driven by Non-Governmental-Organisations (NGOs). Business partners were sought only after initial gains in improving production of oil and honey, respectively, were made. In the case of the Beekeeping partnership, the Government was already actively promoting the sector and bee products were in high demand. The commercial sector was offered a business opportunity and engaged. However, for the VCO project, unstable demand and inconsistent output were barriers to investment, meaning it took them a long time to find a committed business partner (The Body Shop, which imported their product).

The Revitalisation of Smallholder Agriculture Production partnership in Zimbabwe (RSAPZ) was based on private sector interest; the two NGOs secured commercial commitment before re-establishing production and processing systems. The Connecting Sichuan and Eureka Forbes Rural Water Initiative partnerships were born from earlier collaboration between the private sector and NGOs on disaster response. Unlike the others, Connecting Sichuan was a partnership driven primarily by the business partner. Cisco, however, insists that collaboration with NGOs was an integral part of the partnership's success, although the NGOs' perspective does not necessarily validate this view.

2. Blurring of traditional roles

These PPNP case studies demonstrate a shift away from traditional concepts of aid and business delivery towards a more synergized approach. Partnering for development is not a new concept, but the cross-sector convergence displayed in a PPNP offers value-addition beyond the widely known PPP models or an NGO-implemented aid project.⁸⁷

Accordingly each partner appears to have transitioned from its historical role into a more dynamic and fluid one, adapting to the particular initiative or partnership rather than being defined by preconceived models. For instance, many of the NGOs took on the role of consultant or facilitator, convening all parties to ensure clear communication (e.g. Revitalisation of Smallholder Agriculture Production in Zimbabwe, RSAPZ). In some cases, the private sector moved beyond simple financial investment, for example by helping to train beekeepers and improve their financial literacy (Ambrosia, the private partner in the Beekeeping PPNP). The role of government progressed from traditional support via the regulatory framework towards more active involvement in facilitating market re-vitalisation and business innovation⁸⁸ (Eureka Forbes, RSAPZ).⁸⁹ For the private sector partners in these case studies, we generally observed a shift from an engagement with the not-for-profit sector through traditional corporate social responsibility (CSR) initiatives to stronger engagement at planning, co-creation and co-implementation stages. The activity was aligned with their core business goals,⁹⁰ i.e. their participation had genuine commercial drivers. Each partnership was entered into with the expectation that investment would directly or indirectly impact business strategies.

A clear and important theme was the change in perception from the historic notion that wealth creation is, or should be, separate from development goals.⁹¹ It seems that all parties have approached the particular initiative they were involved in more holistically than they would have had they worked independently.

87. Accenture Development Partnerships & World Vision. 2008, *Emerging opportunities for NGO-business partnerships*, London.

88. Pilkington, J. 2001, *Three Sectors, One Vision, Cross Sector Collaboration for Economic Development*, Melbourne Business School & Business for Millennium Development, Australia.

89. Panchayat-provided the land and subsidized the building costs for the local sellers. AGRITEX, the government agency in the RSAPZ project offered provided training, capacity building, and acted as a consultant for resolutions to emerging issues

90. Crowley, J. & Alzaga, C. 2009, *The "Rubik's Cube" of Cross Sector Collaboration: Connecting Business and Development: Research Findings, Conclusions and Implications*, the Crowley Institute.

91. *ibid*

3. Leverage is a key driver

The element that attracted most parties and donors to form a PPNP was leverage. By collaborating and sharing resources, capabilities, and knowledge, each partner saw a return that was arguably greater than they could achieve on their own or in sub-contractual arrangements.

There were several points of leverage for businesses: they used the partnerships to test out new products or markets (e.g. Eureka Forbes Rural Water Initiative), to achieve a stable supply of product (VCO and Beekeeping), or to secure market access (Connecting Sichuan). For NGOs, collaboration with public and private entities gave them greater influence and provided them with a stronger platform for their advocacy efforts (Rural Water Initiative), address gender issues (Beekeeping), and introduce employment opportunities (VCO, RSAPZ). This would not have been possible within a sub-contractual relationship with the private or public sectors. For governments, there was an acknowledgement that collaboration with different sectors provided them with the support needed for sustainable economic growth as well as realising overarching public sector goals (shown to some extent in all of the case studies).

4. Communication and trust are key

Communication was a key component to both the successes and limitations of these partnerships. Stakeholder agreements and meetings, supported by a facilitator, proved successful for projects such as RSAPZ and Beekeeping. Conversely, Cisco's claim that they communicated with NGOs in the Connecting Sichuan partnership has been refuted by one NGO that was identified by Cisco as a partner. The Connecting Sichuan project raised some interesting queries about boundaries around what a PPNP is.

The issue of trust was recognized as important to the success of the partnerships. World Vision India (WVI) admitted that at points in their partnership with Eureka Forbes the lack of trust was a de-stabilising factor; something that arose out of a lack of understanding by WVI of Eureka Forbes' strategic goals.

Furthermore, it is worthwhile appreciating the various cultural contexts within which these partnerships evolved. WIBDI

(VCO), for instance, stresses that it is their understanding of the Samoan culture that makes the project so successful, and at the same time, it is the lack of understanding by others that threatens to undermine its success.

Transparency and a clear awareness of each party's motivation for involvement reduced the likelihood of mistrust over the long term (VCO and RSAPZ). Considering the shift in mind-set from traditional practice that needs to occur for many of these partners to work together in the first place, this is not surprising.

5. Sustainability

Sustainability of the partnerships arises as an issue from some of the case studies. If partners were not committed to the longevity of the project then there was uncertainty around whether it would produce the expected benefits (RSAPZ). The reliance of NGO partners on external funding (e.g. Women In Business Development Inc. in the VCO partnership) threatened their ability to continue supporting the VCO project. In concluding this, however, the fact that some of the initiatives are ongoing, indicates that some of the PPNPs did kick start self-sufficient and economically viable development beyond project completion.

6. Future research

The findings of this research demonstrate that multi-sector approaches can reap long-term benefits for all partners. However, it does identify risks attendant on such partnerships. Future advances for PPNPs will come from better understanding of the various models and more research into the motivating factors and needs of the different partners. This hybrid model of project delivery and funding is worth exploring and it would be of value to consider the establishment of a long-term impact evaluation framework.

The metrics of each partner are unlikely to align completely but some standard of achievement that captures the value-add by leveraging PPNPs would be helpful. This will require greater discussion around what 'success' means and a clearer understanding of what value and comparative advantage each partner is bringing.⁹²

92. United States Agency for International Development: Private Sector Alliance Division. 2010, *(Re) Valuing Public-Private Alliances: An Outcomes-Based Solution*. Retrieved 10 June from: <http://www.usaid.gov/sites/default/files/documents/1880/RevaluingPublicPrivateAlliances.pdf>.

Scalability and sustainability are factors that nearly all partners will be interested in; did the partnership lead to scalability that benefited communities and the participating partners? Was sustainability achieved in a way that promoted the input of all engaged? By evaluating the strengths and weakness of a PPNP against traditional models of development and investment, various organisations and businesses will be able to assess if they have the capacity and relevant capabilities to support this type of approach.

7. PPNPs and the Pacific

As the New Zealand Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade is currently focused on aligning development outcomes with economic benefits in the Pacific region, it is worth highlighting some contextual factors that are conducive to a PPNP approach and those that may impede the success of PPNPs in the region.

■ Factors that support a PPNP approach

- There are growth markets in the Pacific. Sectors such as fisheries, agriculture, and tourism all show promise and align with the NZ Aid Programme Sector Priorities 2012-2015.⁹³ Niche products such as organic coconut oil have already proven their market potential.
- There are various opportunities for sectors to leverage their resources and capacity;
 - The 2004 report by the Pacific Island Forum Secretariat⁹⁴ suggested that foreign investment without NGO involvement had little impact on Pacific development, noting there was a reliance on imports rather than domestic supply. Partnerships between businesses and not-for-profits in the region could provide opportunities to overcome this challenge.
 - Innovative technology advances such as solar water filtration systems could have significant benefits for isolated Pacific communities and NGOs could support private companies with community engagement, product development, market validation, and testing.

- Products with long shelf lives, such as honey, have the potential to succeed in the region. NGOs, however, do not have the resources to implement these types of income generating activities alone; they require investment and export interest.
- Although there are still political barriers, certain governments are demonstrating a commitment to providing enabling policy environments for new initiatives that provide returns for their country. For instance, at the Renewable Energy Summit 2013, some governments such as the Cook Islands signalled an ongoing adjustment to their regulatory framework to attract investment in various sectors.⁹⁵

■ Potential barriers to a PPNP approach

- There is a strong feeling amongst private sector entities that the economies of scale in the Pacific are challenging as low population density, poor infrastructure, and geographical remoteness means accessing Pacific markets can be very expensive and thus uncompetitive compared to other regions; they are therefore seen as having limited financial return and scalability;
- Traditional island communities can be perceived as too difficult to work with;
- Pacific island governments are sometimes perceived as having limited political will or economic constraints that hinder the long-term sustainability of projects.

The essence of a PPNP is that the 'sum of the whole is greater than the parts'. In a region like the Pacific with economic growth potential and niche market opportunities, as well as vulnerable and impoverished communities, an argument can certainly be put forward for a multi-sector approach. Commercial investment and development assistance are not necessarily mutually exclusive. The PPNPs in this report demonstrate that when partners from different sectors are aligned by a common goal, despite their differing motivations, change can be achieved.

93. New Zealand Ministry of Foreign Affairs & Trade. 2012, *New Zealand Aid Programme Sector Priorities 2012-15*. Retrieved 1 June from: http://www.aid.govt.nz/webfm_send/432

94. The report analysed five case studies of foreign investment in the Pacific: Read, R., & Driffield, N. 2004, *Linkages and Flow-On Impacts of Foreign Investment in Pacific Island Economies, Case Studies Report*, Pacific Island Forum Secretariat, Fiji.

95. The Government of the Cook Islands has announced its strategic target to generate 50% of required electricity from renewable energy and reach 100% sourcing from renewables by 2020. From: http://www.irena.org/DocumentDownloads/events/Workshop_Accelerated_Renewable_Energy_Deployment/Session7/S7_3IRENAPRESENTATION.pdf

References

Accenture Development Partnerships & World Vision. 2008, *Emerging opportunities for NGO-business partnerships*, London.

Anand, S. & Sisay, G. 2011, *Engaging Smallholders in Value Chains: Creating new opportunities for beekeepers in Ethiopia*, Oxfam GB, Oxford.

Bell, W. 2009, *Organic Agriculture and Fair Trade in Pacific Island Countries*, Natural Resources Management and Environment Department: Food and Agriculture of the United Nations. Retrieved 15 June from: <ftp://ftp.fao.org/docrep/fao/011/ak356e/ak356e00.pdf>

Chaipa, I., Jasi, P. & Sango, D. 2012, *End of Project Evaluation Report: Revitalization of Smallholder Agricultural Production in Zimbabwe (RSAPZ) 2010-2012*, World Vision Zimbabwe.

Cisco. 2011, *Connecting Sichuan: A landmark partnership to revitalize communities by transforming healthcare, education, and the workforce*. Retrieved 5 June from: http://www.cisco.com/web/about/citizenship/socio-economic/specialprograms/docs/Connecting_Sichuan.pdf

Cisco. 2009, *Connecting Sichuan Program at a glance*. Retrieved 5 June from: http://www.cisco.com/web/about/citizenship/socio-economic/specialprograms/docs/sichuan_overview.pdf

Cretney, J. & Tafuna'i. A. 2004, Tradition, Trade, and Technology: Virgin Coconut Oil in Samoa. In: Carr, M. *Chain of Fortune, linking women producers and workers with global markets*. London: Commonwealth Secretariat. p. 45-75.

Crowley, J. & Alzaga, C. 2009, *The "Rubik's Cube" of Cross Sector Collaboration: Connecting Business and Development: Research Findings, Conclusions and Implications*, the Crowley Institute.

Daniell, J. 2013, *Sichuan 2008: A disaster on an immense scale*. Retrieved 5 June from: <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/science-environment-22398684>

Druzca, K. & Hutchens, H. 2008, *Women in Business in Samoa: Key findings from the August 2008 scoping mission*. Retrieved 20 May from: http://www.aisaid.gov.au/Publications/Documents/wpwsd_samoa.pdf

Duncan, S. & Gray, B. 2011, *The WIBDI Story: Technology, Tradition & Trade*, Centre for Entrepreneurship, University of Otago, Dunedin, New Zealand.

Ejigu, K., Gebey, T. & Preston, T. 2009, *Constraints and prospects for apiculture research and development in Amhara region, Ethiopia*, Andassa Livestock Research Center, Ethiopia.

European Commission. 2013, *Agriculture and Rural Development: Organic Farming*. Retrieved 15 June from: http://ec.europa.eu/agriculture/organic/consumer-confidence/consumer-demand_en

J. Li, 2009. *The Charity StandTALL Assists Sichuan Earthquake Amputees Uses Cisco Telepresence*. Retrieved 20 June from: <http://www.vcinsight.com/telepresence/telemedicine/78/the-charity-standtall-assists-sichuan-earthquake-amputees-uses-cisco-telepresence/>

King, S. 2013, *Involving marginalized women in collective action: Making a difference through NGO interventions*, Oxfam GB, Oxford.

Mapusua, K. & Maccari, M. 2007, *An Overview of Organic Agriculture in the Pacific*. Retrieved 30 May from: http://www.ifam.org/partners/projects/pdfs/OA_Pacific_web.pdf

Morgan, T. 2012, *Cisco cuts costs, boosts profits faster than sales*. Retrieved 7 June from: http://www.theregister.co.uk/2012/11/14/cisco_q1_f2013_numbers/

Mudyazvivi, E. 2011, *Recovering Lost Livelihoods: The case of smallholder plantation crops in Zimbabwe*, SNV Netherlands Development Organisation.

New Zealand Ministry of Foreign Affairs & Trade, 2013, *Samoa*. Retrieved 10 May from: <http://www.mfat.govt.nz/Countries/Pacific/Samoa.php>

New Zealand Ministry of Foreign Affairs & Trade. 2011, *Statement of Intent 2011-2014*, Retrieved 1 June from: <http://www.mfat.govt.nz/downloads/media-and-publications/soi-mfat-2011-14.pdf>

New Zealand Ministry of Foreign Affairs & Trade. 2012, *New Zealand Aid Programme Sector Priorities 2012-15*. Retrieved 1 June from: http://www.aid.govt.nz/webfm_send/432

New Zealand Ministry of Foreign Affairs & Trade. 2012, *New Zealand Partnerships International Development Fund: Summary Guidelines*. Retrieved 14 June from: <http://www.aid.govt.nz/funding-and-contracts/nz-partnerships-international-development-fund>

References

New Zealand Ministry of Foreign Affairs & Trade. 2012, *New Zealand Aid Programme Sector Priorities 2012-15*. Retrieved 1 June from: http://www.aid.govt.nz/webfm_send/432

Oxfam, *Trading coconuts*. Retrieved 10 June from: <http://www.oxfam.org.nz/what-we-do/where-we-work/samoa/improving-livelihoods/trading-coconuts>

Oxfam, 2013. *Women's Economic Leadership*. Retrieved 1 June from: <http://policy-practice.oxfam.org.uk/our-work/food-livelihoods/womens-economic-leadership>

Pilkington, J. 2001, *Three Sectors, One Vision, Cross Sector Collaboration for Economic Development*, Melbourne Business School & Business for Millennium Development, Melbourne Business School, Australia.

Read, R., & Driffield, N. 2004, *Linkages and Flow-On Impacts of Foreign Investment in Pacific Island Economies, Case Studies Report*, Pacific Island Forum Secretariat, Fiji.

STL-Logistics Group. 2012, *The World IT leader creates a joint venture in China*. Retrieved 7 June from: <http://group-stl.com/news/2012/december/25/world-it-leader-creates-joint-venture-china>

United Nations Development Programme. 2013, *Human Development Report 2013, The Rise of the South: Human Progress in a Diverse World*. Retrieved 1 June from: <http://hdr.undp.org/en/reports/global/hdr2013/summary/>

United Nations. 2013, *A New Global Partnership: Eradicate Poverty and Transform Economies Through Sustainable Development*. Retrieved 15 May from: <http://www.post2015hlp.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/05/UN-Report.pdf>

USAID & World Vision. 2012, *Revitalization of Smallholder Agricultural Production in Zimbabwe (RSAPZ) Project: End of Project Report October 2010-June 2012*, USAID Cooperative Agreement.

USAID: Private Sector Alliance Division. 2010, *(Re) Valuing Public-Private Alliances: An Outcomes-Based Solution*. Retrieved 10 June from: <http://www.usaid.gov/sites/default/files/documents/1880/RevaluingPublicPrivateAlliances.pdf>

World Vision Canada. 2010, *The future in their hands: A Program Review*, World Vision, Canada.



t. 0800 800 776

e. nzcommunications@worldvision.co.nz

w. worldvision.org.nz

Postal address

Private Bag 92078

Auckland 1142

New Zealand

Auckland

51 Hugo Johnston Drive

Penrose

Auckland 1061

Christchurch

70 Suva Street

Upper Riccarton

Christchurch 8041

Wellington

Level 3

148 Cuba St

Te Aro

Wellington 6011
