

Background

Since 1998, the New Zealand Government (NZ) has assisted with the development of Community Auxiliary Police (CAP) on Bougainville. This assistance has most recently been delivered through the Bougainville Community Policing Project (BCPP), managed and funded by the New Zealand Agency for International Development (NZAID). New Zealand Police (NZP) implements the project under a Memorandum of Understanding with NZAID.

Project reviews were undertaken in October 2000, and October 2001. The 2001 review recommended “that NZODA maintain continued support to community policing on Bougainville for a period of 18-24 months... in this transitional ... phase” as the Bougainville Police Service (BPS) was established and planned. This recommendation was accepted by the stakeholders and led to the design of Phase Three of the BCPP. Phase Three of the project was not mobilised until April 2004.

Purpose and Objectives

The purpose of reviewing the BCPP after two years of Phase Three implementation was to continuously improve the project and ensure its continuing relevance to the newly established Bougainville region and alignment with other law and justice developments on Bougainville. The Review was also intended to contribute to setting the future direction and duration of the project.

Retrospective Assessment

1. To what extent is the current BCPP achieving, its goals and objectives?
2. Why have goals and objectives of Phase Three Project not been achieved?
3. What have been the impacts/outcomes of the project to date?

Prospective Assessment

1. How valid is the rationale for New Zealand’s on-going support to this sector to community policing on Bougainville, and the wider law and justice sector?
2. What are the views of the key stakeholders at the national, Autonomous Bougainville Government (ABG) and project levels on the future role of community auxiliary police and Royal Papua New Guinea Constabulary (RPNGC) in Bougainville?
3. What could be the future directions for NZAID and NZP support?

Main Findings

The project goal is “To establish community-based policing on Bougainville as an essential contribution to restoration of effective civil authority and to reduce the incidence of crime and the fear of crime throughout the communities of Bougainville”.

The Review team consider that the goal has been substantially achieved. Evidence of this includes that community police:

- has been established in all areas of mainland Bougainville, including the Panguna No Go Zone
- have dealt with up to 3200 incidents since July 2004, a significant percentage of which have been resolved at the community level

- ave begun to provide security services to the Village Courts, allowing them to resume operation
- are accepted by all factions in some areas where regular police cannot operate, suggesting that the civil authority model being used is appropriate.

The lack of crime statistics in Bougainville makes it difficult to measure the incidence of crime. BCPP collected baseline data on community perceptions of crime in 2004; however, this has not been updated. Anecdotal evidence suggests the incidence and fear of crime have been reduced through CAP operation.

Progress against key objectives has been made. The Review team found:

- the project has been well-managed, particularly staff management within Bougainville and establishment/ management of project infrastructure; there is a good level of local ownership of CAPs
- CAP allowances were fully paid with payment linked to monthly performance reports, BPS effectively delivering training and supervising CAPs
- good relationships between CAPs and Council of Elders (COEs)/ communities have been developed, despite limited BCPP support in this area; there are some good examples of CAPs working with BPS, though inconsistencies were found
- all parts of mainland Bougainville now have CAPs, including five in the No Go Zone. BCPP is now ready to move training to atolls; BCPP training has been of high quality
- most CAPs have had regular access to one-day refresher training courses; specific training is being delivered in target subjects
- other donor projects are generally informed of BCPP activities; there are limited examples of projects co-delivering activities.

Other Impacts and Outcomes

Since the uneasy law and order situation of the late 1990s, the CAPs have developed into a highly functional culturally and situationally appropriate community policing system that complements and supports formal law and justice sector processes. All areas of mainland Bougainville now have some form of state policing authority. The general acceptance of CAPs by former combatants and parties still in dispute with the government has allowed the state policing authority to establish itself without deployment of regular police. There is strong support for the CAP programme from senior leaders and public servants, who variously described the programme as a “success”, and “a blessing” which reinforces traditional ways and which was the “right approach”. The CAPs are also strongly supported in their work by COEs and community stakeholders. The CAPs’ community focus reinforces traditional authority, in accord with the new Bougainville Constitution. The CAPs presence has also facilitated investor and community confidence in many areas, including areas still lacking BPS regulars. Some CAPs have graduated to become Bougainville Police Service (BPS) regulars.

The success of the CAP programme has broader ramifications beyond Bougainville. The CAP system is being highlighted as a model for other parts of Papua New Guinea (PNG), with other provinces already requesting the establishment of the CAP system. In addition the invaluable support provided through BCPP has reinforced a strong bond between NZ and Bougainville.

Although women stakeholders were supportive of CAPs, they and many other stakeholders called for more women CAPs. Of the 168 new CAPs that BCPP trained in 2000-2002, 26 were women. In 2006, the total number of women CAPs across the Autonomous Region as a whole dropped to 24, only 6.9 percent of the total. Also, given that six women have been among the 45 new CAPs trained to date in Phase Three, it suggests poor retention of women CAPs. Although communities have significant say in the selection of new CAPs, this imbalance should be addressed.

Summary: the success of the CAP programme in Bougainville reflects the high levels of local ownership and local stakeholder support. The success of BCPP in meeting the project goal and objectives also reflects the quality of BCPP inputs. Nevertheless, the Review has shown that there is scope to further strengthen the CAPs programme. Using the five DAC as a guide, the following summary comments can be made:

- **Relevance:** the project remains highly relevant: the CAPs system has genuine local ownership and is a high policy priority for ABG
- **Efficiency:** the project has been well- managed but there are some concerns about whether all five NZP advisers are being effectively used
- **Effectiveness:** the project has been effective, with Phase Three goal and objectives substantially achieved
- **Impact:** the project has had a very significant impact, and most stakeholders agree that without the NZAID support, policing and law and order in Bougainville would be in a significantly worse state
- **Sustainability:** while there are positive signs in terms of BPS training capacities and Bougainvillean ownership, sustainability is the key concern as NZAID continues to fully fund CAP allowances and some of the project processes are not based on sustainability or international development principles.

Future Development Needs

The key needs for the project were noted as improving strategic management, including better staff preparation, annual planning processes and strengthened monitoring; and developing a greater focus on sustainability, including support for appropriate processes, and analysis of the future recurrent cost implications to ABG of BCPP activities, including extension of community policing to all atolls. For CAPS:

- strengthening performance management systems
- achieving consistency of training across all parts of Bougainville
- supporting BPS to increase staffing within the BPS Community Policing Section and providing support to develop management capacities
- on-going logistical and financial support
- enhancing the relationship between CAPs and BPS regulars.

Future Directions: there was stakeholder consensus that community policing is the right concept, that it has been successful and ongoing donor support is required for both CAPS and PBS. Now that CAPs are established and operational, the project needs to focus on strengthening the community policing system, including provision of broader support to the BPS and focusing on sustainability issues.

Key Issues and Learning for NZAID

Poverty Alleviation: the report states that “CAPS have facilitated investor and community confidence in many areas” implying some economic benefits. Rule of law is essential before economic activity can develop.

Gender Equality: although women stakeholders were supportive of CAPs, they and many other stakeholders called for more women CAPs. Available data suggests a need to strengthen the retention of women CAPs. Although communities have a significant say in selecting new CAPs, this gender imbalance should be addressed. The reasons underlying the retention of women CAPS, merits further investigation.

Conflict Prevention and Peace Building: there is sensitivity in government, among the police and at the community level towards bringing in police from mainland PNG.

Participatory Approaches: community policing is a participatory approach to policing with potential for replication beyond Bougainville.

Cost-Effectiveness and Value for Money: Phase Three has cost NZ\$1.2 – 1.5 million per year, between 2003/4 and 2006/7. Phase 4 is estimated at 1.75 million per year. Objectives and outcomes were generally achieved, so there was value for money.

Relationships with NZAID: when NZAID contracts a government department/agency to manage an international development project (for whom international development is not core business or an area of expertise) then NZAID needs to actively support that department/agency in aligning their approach with international development principles. NZAID can achieve this through appropriate briefings, close monitoring, and provision of appropriate technical support, as required.

To request a copy of the full report email aidevaluation@mfat.govt.nz and quote the reference number - Eva0601 sum.