EVALUATION OF THE NZAID/TONGA GRADUATE DIPLOMA IN PUBLIC SECTOR MANAGEMENT COURSES

Alison Gray Gray Matter Research Ltd Wellington 16 July 2008

Table of contents

	ATION OF THE NZAID/TONGA GRADUATE DIPLOMA IN PUBLIC SECTOR GEMENT COURSES	1
Aliso	n Gray	1
Gray	Matter Research Ltd	1
Welli	ngton 16 July 2008	1
Executi	ive summary	1
Back	ground	1
Meth	od and timing	1
The o	course	1
Findi	ngs	1
Qu	ality and content of reporting	3
Eva	aluations of programme delivery and outcomes	3
Co	st effectiveness of programme	3
Ad	ministration and management	3
Lesson	s learned	4
1. Inti	roduction	6
1.1	Background	6
1.2	Research objectives	6
2. Me	ethodology	7
3. Tin	ning of the review	7
4. Th	e course	7
5. Fin	ndings	8
5.1	Course delivery	
5.2	Reports and documentation	
5.3	Impact of course on ongoing work	.10
Pro	omotions and job changes	.10
•	pact on current work	.11
	ues that supported or constrained graduates from implementing the outcomes of the urse in their ongoing work	.11
5.4	Relevance of the DPSM to the needs of the public service in Tonga	.12
5.5	Usefulness of assignments and projects	.12
5.6 effect	Using training assistance to support continuing development and increased tiveness of the management of the public sector	.12
5.7	Other donor activity in training and capacity building	.13
5.8	Management of the Tongan DPSM programme	.13

	Quality ar	nd content of reporting	13
	Evaluation	ns of programme delivery and outcomes	14
	Cost effect	ctiveness of programme	14
	Administr	ation and management	14
6.	Gender is	sues	17
7.	Human rig	ghts issues	17
8.	Other cro	ss-cutting issues	18
9.	Lessons I	earned	18
Арр	endix 1	Glossary of acronyms used	20
Арр	endix 2	TERMS OF REFERENCE	21
0	utputs / Re	eports	27
Арр	endix 3	Tracer study questionnaire	29
Dipl	oma in Pu	blic Sector Management Tonga	29
TI	nank you f	or your time and comments	31
Арр	endix 4	People interviewed	32
Nan	ne		32
Pos	ition		32
Арр	endix 5	List of course participants and status	33
Арр	endix 6	Course content for Diploma in Public Sector Management	37

Executive summary

Background

In 1997, the Government of Tonga (GOT) concluded that staff at senior levels in the Tonga civil service lacked appropriate management skills and competencies required for effective and efficient performance. GOT identified the Massey University Institute of Executive Development's Diploma in Public Sector Management (Dip PSM) as suitable for their training needs.

NZAID funded Diploma intakes in 1998 and 1999. Following an independent review, NZAID funded two further intakes in 2002 and 2004. The contract with Massey University ended in December 2007. The overall purpose of the assignment was to evaluate the Dip PSM with a view to:

- analysing all issues affecting the effective delivery of the Dip PSM and its impact on course participants and on the public sector in Tonga;
- identifying lessons-learned for future NZAID-supported education and training programmes, particularly those involving the public sector in Tonga.

The results will be reported to NZAID as the commissioner and will be used by Ministry of Training, Employment, Youth and Sport (MOTEYS), the Ministry of Education, Women's Affairs and Culture (MEWAC), and NZAID to guide future programming support. The report will also be shared with the Massey University Graduate School of Business.

Method and timing

The review included a document review, a brief literature search, a tracer study and interviews with key informants in New Zealand and Tonga, including staff at NZAID and AusAID, officials of the GOT, present and past staff at Massey University and participants in courses. A feedback workshop was held in Tonga at the end of the field work. The review was completed between May 19 and July 18 2008.

The course

The Dip PSM is a graduate qualification that involves a mix of theoretical and practical learning over approximately 1500 hours. Participants study while working. The first intake completed the course in one year. It was later extended to 18 months with the addition of an extra module and should be completed within three years. The course has five modules and students complete a number of assignments and two projects.

Findings

The course material was well suited to Tonga. Course tutors made "customization" visits before each course to ensure that relevant local material was included. The modules were appropriate; in-country delivery mechanisms were well designed and appropriate for the needs of the Tongan civil service.

Participants and employers thought that the course should be cut back to one year to maintain motivation.

Reports covered attendance, progress, pass rates and student feedback for each module. They discussed issues around attendance and completion. Reports towards the end of the contract

detailed the status of individual students and the work they needed to do to complete the qualification. No complete list of pass rates and completion status was available.

Selection

Selection for the various intakes has been problematic. The first Dip PSM course was targeted at Heads of Department (HODs) and Level 2 staff, but very few HODs actually attended and over the four intakes, Level 1 and Level 2 staff never made up more than 30% of the group. Most of the students on the first intake were chosen by their Departments; applicants for the second and subsequent intakes were sought through various media, including the newspaper. GOT imposed an upper age limit of 45, which was counter-intuitive given the focus on HODs and Level 2 staff.

Outcomes

Of the 83 students who began a course:

- 34 are still employed in the Government. Only 10 permanent employees have actually graduated or are eligible to graduate. Two people on contract have also graduated. Most of the remainder have completed the course work, and only have project/s to complete.
- 11 are in State Owned Enterprises (SOEs). Six have graduated or are eligible to graduate.
- 5 are in private companies; two are graduates
- 1 graduate is a Member of Parliament
- 3 are in NGOs or sports bodies; two are graduates or eligible to graduate and one is not
- 19 have migrated (10), retired (5), died (2) or are not currently employed (2)
- 8 withdrew from the course
- 2 could not be traced

At 31/83 the overall rate of those who have graduated or are eligible to graduate was 37%. The graduation rate for Intake 1 was 95%. A number of those who did not graduate completed other qualifications over the period the Dip PSM was on offer. Some completed the course and went on to further study, including MBAs. The exact number is not known.

Of the 19 participants who responded to the tracer study, 10 had had a promotion since completing the course and nine had not.

Fourteen of the 19 respondents had made a "very great change" in their behavior since completing the course. Five had made "some change. These changes had had a direct impact on their work.

People's ability to implement what they had learned depended in part on their position within an organization. It was difficult for more junior staff who could only operate within the constraints of their job description and often only within their unit. Some HODs and senior managers did not understand the content of the course or the implications that could have for their Department.

Impact on the public service

Participants and officials agreed that while the Dip PSM had a big impact on those who took it and improved their individual performance, the overall impact on the public sector has been less than anticipated. This is partly due to the ongoing effects of restructuring and redundancies and partly to ongoing need.

The assignments and projects completed by participants in the Dip PSM courses were all relevant to their work and are a good example of the practical nature of the course.

The review identified a range of other donor activity but nothing comparable to the Dip PSM was offered in Tonga. .

Quality and content of reporting

Reports prepared after each module and at the end of each course were informative although they did not report separately on achievement by gender. This issue was raised in the first review but the reporting format did not change for subsequent intakes.

Evaluations of programme delivery and outcomes

Neither Massey University nor the Civil Service Training Centre (CSTC) or MOE/MOTEYS has undertaken any evaluation of the programme's effectiveness or impact. The numbers participating were relatively small and it should not have been difficult to establish and maintain a database. The information should have been made available to the PSC for planning purposes.

Cost effectiveness of programme

Course costs ranged from approximately \$132,000 for Intake 1 to \$194,000 for the final intake. Budgets for later intakes included provision for individual coaching of students from previous intakes who had uncompleted assignments and projects. The GOT provided facilities and administrative support and a small budget (around \$2000TOP for the last intake) for postage, transport and catering.

The high graduation rate for the first course suggests that with careful selection, good support and a stable political environment this can be an extremely cost effective programme. Even those who have not yet graduated believed that they acquired good practical skills and knowledge that they can and do apply in their work.

Administration and management

Administration and management by NZAID was generally timely and effective as the courses were progressing.

The quality of administration by GOT varied. The first intake was managed by the CSTC under the auspices of the Prime Minister's Office (PMO). Intakes 3 and 4 were managed by the Short Term Training Centre (STTC) through the Ministry of Education (MOE) and subsequently through MOTEYS. Facilities for the first intake were good. Once the course moved to the MOE and the STTC, the same level of support was not available and completion rates never again reached the level of the first intake.

Administration by Massey University was of a good standard and the Course Director and his team worked hard to support students in their work. One report noted that all the staff on the course provided support that "is well beyond that normally expected in university teaching roles".

Cross-cutting issues

Only six out of the 20 participants in the first course were women, but women were well represented in the following three courses. Overall 33/83 (37%) of participants were women. Fourteen of the 31 (45%) graduates were women; some achieved distinction.

Representation from across Tonga was extremely limited. Obviously, with the first intake, the aim of focusing on HODs and their deputies reduced opportunities for representation from the Outer Islands. Later intakes were based on more open selection procedures but participants still came almost exclusively from Tongatapu.

The age limit should be reviewed.

The HRM module addressed issues to do with conflict resolution. Individual student projects focused on environmental and health matters.

Lessons learned

The context

- Specific training in public sector management is still needed for senior managers in the public service and in SOEs.
- Management programmes for the public sector need to fit into a broader framework that includes basic skills for new entrants and ongoing competency training for professional staff. They are not sufficient on their own to transform the public service.
- Support for in-country management programmes for the public sector needs to be considered within the context of the NZAID scholarship, STTA, ICA and ICT programmes.

Roles and responsibilities

- NZAID and GOT need to work with other donors in offering training. In particular NZAID should liaise with AusAID, which is currently undertaking a regional stocktake of training needs and available programmes. GOT should be responsible for preparing an overall plan for training in the public sector and setting priorities. If management training for senior public servants is a priority, and alternatives are not already available then New Zealand institutions should have an opportunity to offer a programme that matches the needs of GOT, possibly in association with a local provider such as USP, through accreditation and quality assurance.
- NZAID would be responsible for funding. Part of the funding could be results-based i.e. successful students could have their fees refunded along the lines of In Country Awards.
- The review supports the need for an overall training plan for the public service, particularly for senior management. Ideally, members of the public service should have individual career development and training plans that fit within the overall plan. While this may be unrealistic in the short term, it would be useful for senior managers.

GOT

- GOT needs to be fully committed to any management programmes it asks NZAID to support and should demonstrate that commitment through quality coordination, resourcing and support to complete. Without that commitment, programmes will have limited effectiveness.
- GOT needs to be clear about which segment of the public service they are targeting and ensure that selection processes are in line with targeting.
- Courses and graduates need to be appropriately recognised through the reward and promotion system.
- Participants should be appropriately placed after completion.

- Participants on year-long management programmes should not be eligible for scholarships while they are studying. Nor should they be sent on other short-term courses until they have completed the programme. Overseas travel also needs to be managed to cater for the demands of the programme.
- Programmes should be monitored more closely. The numbers participating are relatively small and it should not be difficult to establish and maintain a database.
- The information should be available to the PSC for planning purposes.

NZAID

• NZAID needs to review programmes in a timely fashion. It is unclear whether the delay with this review contributed to the withdrawal of the programme by Massey University, but an early review may have made some difference.

Course design

- In country courses cater for people who cannot go overseas; they are cost effective and can be more relevant and practical than overseas courses.
- Courses should be limited to one year.
- Management courses should continue the high level of local contextualization evident in the Diploma.
- HODs and applicants need to be fully briefed on the content of courses and understand the practical implications of studying and the need to make use of the knowledge that students gain.
- HODs need to recognize the practical value of students' projects and provide support for these to be completed.
- Other design options should be explored, including:
 - delivering the programme in two lots of three modules plus a project, with a Certificate at the end of the first set of modules and a Diploma once the second set was completed -entry to the Diploma would depend on the completion of the Certificate
 - having a single paid tutor/mentor available within Tonga throughout the year to assist students when overseas tutors were not available
 - having a designated coordinator for the course as happened with Intake 1, where the pass rate was 95%
 - o reducing the length of the programme to one year, as was the case with Intake 1
 - giving students a shorter time to complete assignments and projects but more support.

1. Introduction

1.1 Background

In 1997, the Government of Tonga (GOT) concluded that staff at senior levels in the Tonga civil service lacked appropriate management skills and competencies required for effective and efficient performance. GOT contacted a number of universities overseas for an appropriate integrated training programme for senior managers, and the Massey University Institute of Executive Development's Diploma in Public Sector Management (Dip PSM) was identified as suitable for meeting their training needs. The programme has also been offered in Samoa, the Cook Islands and the Solomon Islands.

GOT requested New Zealand ODA funding to enable participants from a range of government ministries and departments to undertake the Dip PSM course in-country in association with the Establishment Division of the Prime Minister's Office (PMO). New Zealand agreed to assist as this was in line with a focus within the bilateral NZODA programme with Tonga on human resource development and public sector upgrading.

NZAID funded intakes in 1998 and 1999. Following an independent review, NZAID funded two further intakes in 2002 and 2004. The contract with Massey University ended in December 2007, and while there is no intention to renew funding for the Diploma course within the bilateral programme, NZAID is interested, more widely, in training needs within the public sector.

The overall purpose of the assignment was to evaluate the Dip PSM with a view to:

- analysing all issues affecting the effective delivery of the Dip PSM and its impact on course participants and on the public sector in Tonga;
- identifying lessons-learned for future NZAID-supported education and training programmes, particularly those involving the public sector in Tonga.

The results will be reported to NZAID as the commissioner and will be used by Ministry of Training, Employment, Youth and Sport (MOTEYS), the Ministry of Education, Women's Affairs and Culture (MEWAC), and NZAID to guide future programming support. The report will also be shared with the Massey University Graduate School of Business.

1.2 Research objectives

The evaluation had three main objectives:

- 1. To assess the effectiveness of the Dip PSM programme in achieving the objectives and outcomes expressed in the original letter of commission with the Massey University Institute of Executive Development (25 March 1998), namely:
 - significantly increasing the level of competence of the course participants leading to improvements in public sector management in Tonga;
 - enhancing the ability of the course participants to perform functions set out in the Dip PSM module learning outcomes;
 - strengthening public sector management in Tonga.
- 2. To assess the relevance of the Dip PSM to the needs of the public service in Tonga.
- 3. To undertake an evaluation of the management of the Tonga Dip PSM programme.

2. Methodology

The evaluation began with a review of documentation held by NZAID, including:

- the independent review of the first two intakes
- reports on intakes three and four
- correspondence regarding issues relating to selection for and delivery of courses
- outlines of the course content.

A literature search identified a number of relevant documents, most of which referred to other options for public sector management training in the Pacific. None offered a critique of courses that have been offered in the past or an assessment of their impact.

A tracer study was undertaken with participants from all four intakes who are still in employment in Tonga. Forty-five questionnaires were distributed and 19 were returned. The questionnaire is attached as Appendix 3. Five people were overseas during the review. The low return rate reflects the lack of a postal system in Tonga. Questionnaires had to be hand delivered and returned by hand or collected. While some people returned their questionnaires directly, most were collected during the fieldwork. The questionnaires came from participants in Intake 1 (5), Intake 2 (2), Intake 3 (5) and Intake 4 (7).

Information was collected from the current Director of the College of Business at Massey University and the former Director of Public Sector Management at the Graduate School of Business who was responsible for the courses in Tonga by email and telephone.

Participants, government officials and other key stakeholders were interviewed during a visit to Tonga from 25 June to 2 July 2008. A list of those contacted is included as Appendix 4.

A full list of participants is attached as Appendix 4. The information was compiled before and during the fieldwork for this review and was as accurate as possible at that time.

Early findings were presented at a workshop in Tonga at the end of the fieldwork. This workshop was shared with a consultant presenting preliminary findings from a review of NZAID's regional scholarships and short-term training attachments programme. The workshop attracted a broader range of participants than would have attended a workshop relating solely to the Dip PSM. They included representatives from Government Departments, NZAID, AusAID and JICA, the Association of Tonga, the Chamber of Commerce, private training providers and USP.

3. Timing of the review

The review was completed between May 19 and July 18 2008.

4. The course

The Dip PSM is a graduate qualification that involves a mix of theoretical and practical learning over approximately 1500 hours. Participants study while working. The course is taught in one-week modules. The first course lasted one year but it was later extended to 18 months with the addition of an extra module. Students were required to complete the course within three years. Participants and employers were of the view that the course should be cut back to one to maintain motivation.

Intake 1 in 1998 studied five modules:

- Public sector human resource management
- Public sector policy
- Public sector financial management
- Public sector planning management
- Service delivery.

A module on public sector evaluation was added for the second intake and subsequent courses.

Students were also expected to complete practical project work equivalent to two modules. One project was to be in the student's own organization and the other in an external organization. A two-day group exercise and a related individual assignment made up the final assessment.

The course is accredited in New Zealand through the university accreditation system. This was important for the Public Service Commission (PSC) as well as participants.

5. Findings

5.1 Course delivery

Material

The course material was well suited to Tonga. Course tutors made "customization" visits before each course to ensure that they included relevant local material in each module. For example, the material for Intake 3 was revised to recognize the public sector reform proposed for Tonga. The policy module was presented with extra material about the international and local policy environment. The class project was based on local fisheries and in the HR module group projects related to restructuring and change management.

Participants appreciated this. Seventeen of the 19 respondents to the tracer study said that the material they studied was very relevant to management in the public sector. The other two thought it was "quite relevant". Only two thought there should be more Tongan examples. This was an improvement on the earlier review of Intakes 1 and 2, which found that while most course materials were appropriate and relevant, some students thought that case study examples did not always apply to the Tongan situation. They also found the amount of reading required excessive. This issue was not raised in the current review.

Modules

Participants in the first two intakes rated the HR, planning and service delivery modules most highly. Participants in the current review did not favour any particular module. Instead they commented that the usefulness of modules depended on the participant's position in the Government. The tracer study showed that they used the evaluation and monitoring module much less than other modules.

Delivery mechanisms

In-country delivery mechanisms were generally well designed and appropriate for the needs of the Tongan civil service. Delivery mechanisms included lectures, local speakers, case studies, presentations by participants working individually and in syndicates, individual projects and written material. Attendance at the week long modules was compulsory. Missing modules because of other work commitments – including overseas meetings – was a major cause of

non-completion. Assignments were due in four weeks after each work long workshop. Students who took part in the review agreed that this time should be cut back to two weeks to increase motivation and ensure a higher completion rate.

A learning contract was signed by participants, their manager (usually the Head of Department) and the Course Director. The Head of Department or line manager was expected to participate in the assessment of the student's projects.

Students were encouraged to have individual mentors and this worked well for some but not all. Several suggested that in future there should be one part time paid tutor/mentor for the whole group to provide support, guidance and encouragement in between modules in addition to administrative support.

Selection

Selection for the various intakes has been problematic. The first Dip PSM course was targeted at HODs and Level 2 staff, but very few HODs actually attended and over the four intakes, Level 1 and Level 2 staff never made up more than 30% of the group. Most of the students on the first intake were chosen by their Departments; applicants for the second and subsequent intakes were sought through various media, including the newspaper.

In response to concern at the high drop out rate for Intake 2, which had a relatively high proportion of more junior staff, PMO developed a selection process. This set out expectations on departments, participants and the Tongan Government and detailed course content. Aspiring participants applied and were interviewed for the course. The criteria for selection were:

- Applicants should have a university degree or significant work experience
- Applicants should be in senior management positions in Ministries or Boards
- Applicants must be 45 years of age or below.

The first two criteria were set by Massey University; the third was added by Civil Service Training Centre (CSTC). No information was available on the age of students in the various intakes but later courses did have a higher proportion of participants in middle rather than senior management positions. The course gradually shifted from its original focus on training senior staff to a course for younger people who wanted to prepare themselves for more senior posts or have a career change by moving into management.

The criteria did not include any limitation on students undertaking other study during the period of the Diploma and completion rates were affected when students were sent on three-month courses overseas or gained scholarships to study full time in New Zealand or Australia. With any future courses, students clearly need to be ineligible for other study awards while they are doing the Dip PSM study and their Departments need to plan any overseas travel to accommodate the demands of the course.

Participants in the feedback workshop at the end of the fieldwork for the review had differing views on who should be eligible to attend a course like the Dip PSM. Those from the private sector believed that the course should be available to anyone in Tonga given the high need for good management and planning skills. Others pointed out that there is a range of business management courses available through USP and Australian and New Zealand educational institutions. They argued that the course should continue to be dedicated to public sector management. The issue for them was whether it should be widely available to public sector

staff or return to its original focus on senior public sector managers. They generally agreed that unless senior staff are trained and understand the concepts taught in the course, its impact will always be limited.

5.2 Reports and documentation

The Massey Course Director completed reports at the end of each module, using the same template throughout. The reports covered attendance, progress and pass rates in each module as well as student feedback. Relevant reports listed project topics. The Course Director also discussed issues around attendance and completion and described steps taken to address these. Steps included extra visits to provide individual coaching in the later intakes where completion rates were lower. The reports prepared towards the end of the contract detailed the status of individual students and the work they needed to do to complete their Diplomas. No complete list of pass rates and completion status was available.

5.3 Impact of course on ongoing work

Summary of outcomes

Of the 83 students who began a course:

- 34 are still employed in the Government. Only 10 permanent employees have actually graduated or are eligible to graduate. Two people on contract have also graduated. Most of the remainder have completed the course work, and only have project/s to complete.
- 11 are in SOEs. Six have graduated or are eligible to graduate.
- 5 are in private companies; two are graduates
- 1 graduate is a Member of Parliament
- 3 are in NGOs or sports bodies; two are graduates or eligible to graduate and one is not
- 19 have migrated (10), retired (5), died (2) or are not currently employed (2)
- 8 withdrew from the course
- 2 could not be traced

At 31/83 the overall rate of those who have graduated or are eligible to graduate was 37%. The graduation rate for Intake 1 was 95%. A number of those who did not graduate completed other qualifications over the period the Dip PSM was on offer. Several who did complete the course went on to further study, including MBAs. The exact number is not known. Appendix 5 details the known status of participants in each intake.

Students who had not completed the course referred to issues of:

- time management and commitment the most common reason
- Work load
- staff movement within the Ministry
- overseas commitments such as workshops, meetings and training
- family, church and community commitments.

Promotions and job changes

Of the 19 participants who responded to the tracer study, 10 had had a promotion since completing the course and nine had not. Five of those who had been promoted had begun the course on Level 9 (new graduate rate) and had moved to Level 7 (three) or Level 5 (two). Three had moved to Level 2 positions from Level 5 or Level 7. Two had become CEOs of organisations.

Even though only half of the participants had had a promotion, 15 of the 19 had changed jobs, six of them within the same Ministry or Department and three by moving to another Ministry or Department. The remainder had moved to an SOE (two), an NGO or the private sector (four). Two of the latter had become contractors/consultants.

One participant noted that the Dip PSM is not included among the qualifications recognised for senior posts. Without official or financial recognition there was less incentive to complete it. Participants who completed the Diploma and were not at the top of their financial scale did receive an increment. Those who were already at their maximum did not.

Impact on current work

According to the tracer study, 14 of the 19 respondents had made a "very great change" in their behavior since completing the course. Five had made "some change. These changes had had a direct impact on their work as the following comments show:

Change in management style, involving more of staff in decision making. Listening more to what others are saying. More training and delegation.

Able to contribute to various aspects of the Department's work programme, especially with Corporate Planning, Human Resource Management, Asset Management etc.

Have been involved in the HRM review activities, developing the Annual Management Plan for respective units within the Ministry and outside.

Manage and administer the implementation of legislations and their evaluation.

1.More knowledgeable 2. More systematic in undertaking a project. 3. Much more aware of environmental factors to consider in tackling a problem. 4. The way I see / approach things – from a much wider perspective. 5. Becoming more strategic.

The financial management module allowed me to introduce an asset register for the Department and to design one that is appropriate for the organization. I later found out that this is a requirement of the Public Finance Management Act, but was rarely enforced by Finance. When the public sector reform programme was launched in 2001, Finance and Audit began to enforce the requirements of the Act. At that stage, I had already introduced the asset register. Further, the module allowed me to use the monitoring principles to monitor the Departmental budget and insist on staff reporting on outputs.

Issues that supported or constrained graduates from implementing the outcomes of the course in their ongoing work

People's ability to implement what they had learned depended in part on their position within an organisation. It was difficult for more junior staff to implement their knowledge as they could only operate within the constraints of their job description. Few were able to implement an initiative across a whole organisation. Course completers with supervisors who had done the course themselves were much more likely to be able to implement changes, as were those who were promoted to more senior positions. One person commented:

My current position as Departmental Manager enables me to put to use what I have learnt, especially in areas covered in the modules. The organisational structure allows me to share and exchange skills and ideas on various matters pertaining to management tasks. With later courses the reverse situation was more common. Comments included:

Working with higher authority without any management training or background.

Not given recognition at work to learn new skills from the course. Lack of understanding of HOD for the programme to provide a conducive environment to excel.

Supervisors who did not go through Dip PSM make it hard to allow changes recommended from subordinates.

Lack of appropriate placement after completing the course inhibited some participants' progress and opportunities:

Not being recognised by the Government or the Ministry [made it harder to use what I learnt]. The course content should be well known by the CEO so he/she could put me in the right post. Too much restructuring of the Ministry. Changes in job title within the Ministry.

5.4 Relevance of the DPSM to the needs of the public service in Tonga

Former students, officials and participants in the feedback workshop agreed that the Dip PSM was highly relevant to the public service in Tonga and had a big impact on those who took it. They also acknowledged that while it improved individual performance, the overall impact on the public sector has been less than anticipated.

5.5 Usefulness of assignments and projects

The assignments and projects completed by participants in the Dip PSM courses were all relevant to their work and are a good example of the practical nature of the course. Some examples are listed below:

- developing Asset Management Register
- tackling primary school truancy since implemented
- a training needs analysis since implemented
- development of a sick leave policy since implemented
- development of a business plan (2)
- development of performance appraisal systems (2)
- planning a move to digital technology in Tonga Broadcasting since implemented
- modernizing school examination systems since implemented
- developing customer service standards since implemented.

Most of the students reported that the projects they had worked on had led to a change in their organisation or in the external organisation with which they worked. They found this a rewarding aspect of the course.

5.6 Using training assistance to support continuing development and increased effectiveness of the management of the public sector

The Tonga Education Strengthening Programme (TESP) funded by NZAID includes a Training Needs Analysis (TNA). The draft report on the TNA refers to government administration and identifies a need for generalist training at middle management level in leadership, management, HR, financial management, policy analysis and planning. It notes that while the PSC has responsibility by law to provide training for the public service, there is currently no formal training plan for the public service. Plans are under way to decentralize and delegate decision-making. If

these plans are formally adopted, training will be required in the skills (e.g. HR skills) that ministries will need to develop. The draft report recommends that:

The Public Service Commission develops a training plan to improve skill levels for members of the Government public service across a range of essential competencies.

This recommendation is in accord with the view of senior officials interviewed for this review. They acknowledged that the Dip PSM needs to fit into a broader framework that includes basic skills as well as ongoing competency training for professional staff. It is not sufficient on its own to transform the public service but is needed for senior staff who do not have management training or an equivalent qualification as well as for middle management. There are some 3,500 public servants (excluding the Police and Defence forces). Approximately 15% are in senior positions and some are very recent appointments with limited experience in public sector management.

A review of the NZAID Scholarships, Short Term Training Attachments and In Country Awards was being carried out at the same time as this review. A review of In-Country Training in Tonga was completed in December 2007. It is clear that any further developments in public sector management training need to be made in the context of these reviews.

5.7 Other donor activity in training and capacity building

In March 2000, the Asian Development Bank (ADB) announced a Regional Technical Assistance Project to support a Pacific governance and public sector management training programme. It had three components: (i) a governance conference for Pacific parliamentarians organized in partnership with ESCAP Pacific Operations Centre and the UNDP, held in Nadi, Fiji in March 2000; (ii) begin a four-module course on public sector management for senior government officials from various Pacific developing member countries of ADB and East Timor; (iii) follow-up in-country seminars on public sector management.

The four course modules were to be delivered six months apart over 7 to 10 days using interactive learning and self-study via the Internet in between modules. (This model was based on a Massey University Executive programme.) This review was unable to find any Tongan senior officials who took part or knew about the programme.

Since August 2004, the Australian Public Service Commission has delivered assistance programmes in the Pacific region under AusAID's Pacific Governance Support Program., but not in Tonga. AusAID funds the Commission's multi-year programme that focuses on leadership development (2006-07), capacity building (2007-08) and networking and communication (2008-09). This programme does not specifically target the public sector.

AusAID has recently announced funding for a large public sector development project in the Pacific, of which Tonga could be a part. A State of the Sector survey is currently being undertaken to identify capacity and issues. This will be followed by a stocktake of the programmes currently on offer.

5.8 Management of the Tongan DPSM programme

Quality and content of reporting

Reports prepared after each module and at the end of each course were informative although they did not report separately on achievement by gender. This issue was raised in the first review but the reporting format did not change for subsequent intakes.

Evaluations of programme delivery and outcomes

Students were asked to evaluate each module once it was completed. They were asked 16 questions relating to course content and delivery but only answers to the question: "Overall, how would you rate this module?" were reported. With a single exception, the modules were always rated as "good" or "very good". One person in Intake 4 rated one module (Customer Service Delivery) as poor.

Outcomes in terms of completions and pass standards were routinely reported but neither Massey University nor the CSTC or MOE/MOTEYS has undertaken any evaluation of the programme's effectiveness or impact. The officer previously in charge of the programme at the Ministry of Education agreed that this would have been useful and should be done routinely. No database has been established to monitor the progress or location of participants since they took part in the course and it took considerable effort for this review to determine where participants are. The numbers participating were relatively small and it should not be difficult to establish and maintain a database. The information should be available to the PSC for planning purposes.

Cost effectiveness of programme

Course costs ranged from approximately \$132,000 for Intake 1 to \$194,000 for the final intake. Budgets for later intakes included provision for individual coaching of students from previous intakes who had uncompleted assignments and projects.

The GOT provided facilities and administrative support and a small budget (around \$2000TOP for the last intake) for postage, transport and catering.

Although the graduation rate declined over the years - the overall average was 37% - the graduation rate for the first course was 95%, which suggests that with careful selection, good support and a stable political environment this can be an extremely cost effective programme. Even those who have not yet graduated believed that they acquired very good practical skills and knowledge that they can and do apply in their work.

The cost is certainly much cheaper than sending an equivalent number of students to New Zealand to study (at approximately \$30,000 - \$40,000 per person per year). The learning is also directly applicable in a Tongan context.

Senior officials, participants and other stakeholder, including participants in the feedback workshop, were strongly in favour of having an in-country training programme because:

- it is cost effective
- many people are unable to go overseas because of family and other commitments
- the programme is more likely to be tailored to the needs of the Tongan government and flexible enough to meet the needs of employers and students
- teaching staff are able to develop familiarity with the Pacific and Pacific needs.

Administration and management

NZAID

Administration and management by NZAID were generally timely and effective as the courses were progressing, although there was some confusion at one point over whether a Letter of Variation or a Letter of Commission was required for the contract with Massey University. This was resolved satisfactorily.

A letter from the High Commissioner in response to a request from GOT for a fifth intake, advised GOT of the intention to review progress to date and noted that:

Pending the outcome of the review, we would envisage that a fifth intake of Graduate Diploma in Public Sector Management participants would occur sometime during 2007. [Letter 23 January 2006]

Lack of personnel resources in Wellington meant that NZAID was unable to commission the review and the intake did not proceed. During 2006, government restructuring took place and there was considerable civil unrest. The Director of the new Ministry of Training, Employment, Youth and Sports (MOTEYS) advised NZAID in February 2007 that the course was no longer needed and that GOT would prefer resources to be moved into other areas of skills training in line with the proposed new framework for short-term training.

GOT

The quality of administration by GOT varied. The first intake was managed by the Civil Service Training Centre (CSTC) under the auspices of the Establishment Committee of the Prime Minister's Office (PMO). Subsequent intakes were managed by the Short Term Training Centre (STTC) through the Ministry of Education (MOE) and subsequently through MOTEYS.

GOT was responsible for selection and for providing training facilities and equipment, administrative support, transport and a contribution to catering.

Facilities and administrative support

Facilities for the first intake were good. The modules were delivered at the CSTC. Morning and afternoon tea and lunch were provided to ensure that students were able to stay together during the day and after teaching had finished to work on presentations and assignments. They had an active course coordinator who was fully available during the week of each module and attended syndicate meetings in between. As the first review noted:

The Principal Training Officer (PTO) and the administrators have been very proactive in providing encouragement to students and notifying both them and their supervisors when they are behind in their assignments or projects. Many of the students said how the support of the PTO and his staff made the difference between their continuing or withdrawing. [Solomon Leonard 2000:20]

Once the course moved to the Ministry of Education and the STTC, the same level of support was not available and completion rates have never again reached the level they did in the first intake.

Time management is clearly an issue in Tonga given the demands of work, family, church and community life on top of study. While it is ultimately the students' responsibility to complete their work on time, they do need the support of senior management at their workplace, and clearly benefit from the kind of support provided for Intake 1. If nothing else, the provision of that level of support reflected the value GOT put on the qualification, at least for the first intake.

Practical administration also needs to be of a high standard. The poor quality of facilities and administrative support was a source of regular complaint in relation to Intakes 3 and 4. Course

material was often late and assignments were not dispatched promptly to New Zealand which led to long delays in students receiving their results This did little to maintain motivation. Equipment at the STTC was either broken or non-existent and lunch arrangements were often unsatisfactory. The course administrator in Tonga pointed out that the budget was limited (\$2000TOP a year), particularly given that the Ministry was expected to courier assignments to New Zealand. (Students who were late with assignments were asked to pay the courier costs themselves). Other costs had to be budgeted carefully. The level of administrative support needs to reflect the fact that this was intended as a one year or 18 month course for senior managers, rather than short-term training in the normal sense of the word (i.e. one- off one to three week courses).

Massey University

Administration by Massey University was of a good standard and the Course Director and his team worked hard to support students in their work. All tutors were on contract to the Graduate School of Business and all were specialists ion their area. They prepared and revised teaching resources, visited Tonga for the one week teaching module, marked and gave detailed feedback on assignments and provided support to students by email and telephone as asked. Staff attempted to complete marking promptly but on several occasions, delays in forwarding assignments to New Zealand meant that students had to wait an unduly long time to get their marks back. One report noted that all the staff on the course provided support that "is well beyond that normally expected in university teaching roles".

All students were provided with teaching resources and case studies to which many still refer. Appendix 6 gives an outline of the content of each module. All courses after the first showed a diminishing completion rate as the modules progressed. The evaluation module was poorly completed in the last three courses as were the two individual projects. Evaluation and monitoring is not common practice in Government departments and this may have contributed to the poor attendance at and subsequent use of this module.

The Diploma used a model that moved from more structured coursework to the less structured stages of the course. These required students to set personal objectives and plan projects, which they then self-managed. The End of Contract Report: Tonga Groups 2 and 3 (August 2005) noted that "these are all capabilities needed for effective management and leadership...Many students have difficulty sustaining motivation at this later part of the programme or have difficulty working independently." The report also noted the importance of local support through the interest of local senior management. Any redesign of the course would need to take account of this experience and adapt accordingly.

The Course Director provided additional individual coaching as the intakes progressed in an effort to have more students graduate, but he was not always successful in achieving this. He was also responsible for contract negotiations with NZAID and reporting to both NZAID and GOT.

Location of programmes such as Dip PSM

The location of programmes such as the Dip PSM is obviously a matter for GOT. The key point is that whichever organisation hosts a programme like Dip PSM should be well resourced, efficient and supportive, and staff should understand the nature of the programme, the target group and participants' needs.

The general view of participants in the feedback workshop was that courses like the Diploma should either come under the auspices of MOTEYS or be run by a local organisation like USP. A staff member from PSC made it clear that she did not think it was the role of PSC to run such

courses. Participants agreed that GOT needs to decide exactly who a programme like the Dip PSM is targeting before delivery arrangements can be finalised.

6. Gender issues

Only six out of the 20 participants in the first course were women, but women were well represented in the following three courses. Overall 33/83 (37%) of participants were women.

Fourteen of the 31 (45%) graduates were women; some achieved distinction.

Despite the family demands on women - several had babies before, during or immediately after the course – women have been just as likely to remain in the public service or in SOEs as men. Nineteen out of the 33 (57%) participants still in the public service are women as are six of the 11 participants currently employed in an SOE.

Women interviewed as part of the review were very positive about their experience. They described the men in the course as supportive and helpful and remarked on the lack of sexism on the part of course tutors and other participants. The earlier review of Intakes 1 and 2 noted that:

One of the results of the Diploma process is that men and women are provided with the opportunity to interact in a new way based upon new insights, skills and behaviours gained from the experience of learning as a group in the context of a university course delivered in Tonga. It seems that many have learnt new ways of behaving. [Solomon Leonard 2000:28]

Both men and women confirmed that they have continued to enjoy respectful and enjoyable professional relationships since taking the course. The networks they established at that time have stood them in good stead since. None remarked on any adverse response from their supervisors because of their gender and none had experienced any limits on opportunities for promotion or other gender-related tensions in or out of the workplace since attending the course.

7. Human rights issues

Two potential human rights issues emerged during the review. Representation from across Tonga was extremely limited. Obviously, with the first intake, the aim of focusing on HODs and their deputies limited opportunities for representation from the Outer Islands. Later intakes were based on more open selection procedures but participants still came almost exclusively from Tongatapu. This may be because:

- they did not know about the course
- they were not encouraged to apply because it would be difficult for Departments to release their most senior staff them for the time required
- the cost of coming to Tongatapu for a week five or six times a year was prohibitive.

If another course is considered, it will need to take access issues into account.

The second issue relates to age. The GOT imposed a 45 year age limit on participants, presumably to ensure that they got maximum value from the course in terms of longevity within the public sector. However, this approach conflicts with the original aim of targeting HODs and senior management, many of whom are over 45 but may still have 10 or more years to work. From both a practical and a human rights perspective, the age limit should be reviewed.

While both men and women benefited equally from the programme, and the programme was extended to include staff in state-owned enterprises, some people in the private sector felt they should also have access to the programme. Given that the programme was specifically designed for the public service, this does not appear to be a genuine human rights issue.

8. Other cross-cutting issues

Three other cross-cutting issues for NZAID are to protect the environment; promote conflict prevention and peace building and limit the spread of HIV/AIDS. While none of these issues was formally addressed within the course structure (other than conflict resolution in HRM), a number of the projects undertaken by students did address them. For example, students in Intake 2 undertook projects on waterfront litter management, Nuku'alofa town centre improvements, a village health and fitness plan and a national prescription drug policy.

9. Lessons learned

The review identified a number of lessons for future NZAID-supported education and training programmes, particularly those involving the public sector in Tonga. These are summarized below.

The context

- Specific training in public sector management is still needed for senior managers in the public service and in SOEs.
- Management programmes for the public sector need to fit into a broader framework that includes basic skills for new entrants and ongoing competency training for professional staff. They are not sufficient on their own to transform the public service.
- Support for in-country management programmes for the public sector needs to be considered within the context of the NZAID scholarship, STTA, ICA and ICT programmes.

Roles and responsibilities

- NZAID and GOT need to work with other donors in offering training. In particular NZAID should liaise with AusAID, which is currently undertaking a regional stocktake of training needs and available programmes. GOT should be responsible for preparing an overall plan for training in the public sector and setting priorities. If management training for senior public servants is a priority, and alternatives are not already available then New Zealand institutions should have an opportunity to offer a programme that matches the needs of GOT, possibly in association with a local provider such as USP, through accreditation and quality assurance.
- NZAID would be responsible for funding. Part of the funding could be results-based i.e. successful students could have their fees refunded along the lines of In Country Awards.
- The review supports the need for an overall training plan for the public service, particularly for senior management. Ideally, members of the public service should have individual career development and training plans that fit within the overall plan. While this may be unrealistic in the short term, it would be useful for senior managers.

GOT

• GOT needs to be fully committed to any management programmes it asks NZAID to support and demonstrate that commitment through quality coordination, resourcing and

support to complete. Without that commitment, programmes will have limited effectiveness.

- GOT needs to be clear about which segment of the public service they are targeting and ensure that selection processes are in line with targeting.
- Courses and graduates need to be appropriately recognised through the reward and promotion system.
- Participants should be appropriately placed after completion.
- Participants on year-long management programmes should not be eligible for scholarships while they are studying. Nor should they be sent on other short-term courses until they have completed the programme. Overseas travel also needs to be managed to cater for the demands of the programme.
- Programmes should be monitored more closely. The numbers participating are relatively small and it should not be difficult to establish and maintain a database.
- The information should be available to the PSC for planning purposes.

NZAID

• NZAID needs to review programmes in a timely fashion. It is unclear whether the delay with this review contributed to the withdrawal of the programme by Massey University, but an early review may have made some difference.

Course design

- In country courses cater for people who cannot go overseas; they are cost effective and can be more relevant and practical than overseas courses.
- Courses should be limited to one year.
- Management courses should continue the high level of local contextualization evident in the Diploma.
- HODs and applicants need to be fully briefed on the content of courses and understand the practical implications of studying and the need to make use of the knowledge that students gain.
- HODs need to recognize the practical value of students' projects and provide support for these to be completed.
- Other design options should be explored, including:
 - delivering the programme in two lots of three modules plus a project, with a Certificate at the end of the first set of modules and a Diploma once the second set was completed -entry to the Diploma would depend on the completion of the Certificate
 - having a single paid tutor/mentor available within Tonga throughout the year to assist students when overseas tutors were not available
 - having a designated coordinator for the course as happened with Intake 1, where the pass rate was 95%
 - o reducing the length of the programme to one year, as was the case with Intake 1
 - giving students a shorter time to complete assignments and projects but more support.

Appendix 1 Glossary of acronyms used

ADB	Asian Development Bank
CEO	Chief Executive Officer
CSTC	Civil Service Training Centre
GOT	Government of Tonga
Dip PSM	Diploma in Public Sector Management
ESCAP	Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific
HOD	Head of Department
HRM	Human resources management
ICA	In country awards
ICT	In country training
MBA	Master of Business Administration
MEWAC	Ministry of Education, Women's Affairs and Culture
MOE	Ministry of Education
MOTEYS	Ministry of Training, Employment, Youth and Sport
ODA	Overseas Development Assistance
РМО	Prime Ministers Office
PSC	Public Service Commission
SOE	State owned enterprises
STTA	Short term training attachments
STTC	Short Term Training Centre
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
USP	University of the South Pacific

Appendix 2 TERMS OF REFERENCE

FOR AN EVALUATION OF THE NZAID/TONGA GRADUATE DIPLOMA IN PUBLIC SECTOR MANAGEMENT COURSES

Background

Graduate Diploma in Public Sector Management

Over the past decade, the Government of Tonga (GOT) has undertaken various training activities, drawing on NZAID and other donor support, aimed at upgrading the skills of its public sector. The GOT found that appropriate management skills and competencies required for effective and efficient performance in the Tonga civil service were lacking, especially at senior levels. GOT identified a need for an integrated training programme for senior managers. In 1997, GOT contacted a number of universities overseas for an appropriate training programme, and the Massey University Institute of Executive Development's Diploma in Public Sector Management (Dip PSM) was identified as suitable for meeting their training needs. (GOT was aware Massey had been running the same Diploma programme in Samoa and the Cook Islands.)

In 1997, GOT requested New Zealand ODA funding to enable participants from a range of government ministries and departments to undertake the Dip PSM course in-country, in association with the Establishment Division of the Prime Minister's Office. New Zealand agreed to assist as this was in line with a focus within the bilateral NZODA programme with Tonga on human resource development and public sector upgrading.

NZAID-funded 1st intake (1998) & 2nd intake (1999)

The first intake of students into the Dip PSM programme commenced in March 1998 and completed the course in August 1999. Although 25 middle-senior managers commenced the course, a number of participants subsequently withdrew for various reasons, and 19 graduated. A second intake of twenty participants commenced the diploma in March 1999 and, while a small number of students also withdrew from this course, a total of 4 students graduated on 1 November 2002.

Initial review of Diploma

The GOT requested NZAID fund a third intake to the diploma and a review of the course to date. NZAID agreed to fund a review, with a decision on funding a third intake to be conditional on the findings of the review. A largely positive independent review of the first two courses recommended, among other things, that NZAID fund a further two courses to enable Tonga to build up a critical mass of diploma student graduates throughout the public service to help encourage improvements in effectiveness and efficiency in the public sector which badly needed reform.

3rd intake (2002) and 4th intake (2004)

Based on this review, NZAID agreed to fund a third intake that commenced in February 2002 with a class of 21. A fourth intake involving 20 students commenced in May 2004 – that contract with Massey expired in December 2007. In 2002, the Short-term Training Centre became the venue and in-country coordinators of the course.

Review discussions

In late 2005, NZAID received a request for a fifth intake. It was decided that, before any further intake request was considered, a review would be undertaken to assess more clearly the impact the Dip PSM course was having in Tonga and whether further intakes were a priority for NZAID bilateral funding. For various reasons, that review was not carried out and NZAID did not approve funding for a fifth intake. In March 2007, the Ministry of Training, Employment, Youth and Sport (MOTEYS) stated that they no longer wanted to continue with the programme as it was felt that the most senior personnel in the public service had already been trained and that there was a preference for NZAID funding to be channelled into other areas. The contract with Massey University ended in December 2007 and an evaluation of the assistance was scheduled. There is no intention to renew funding for the Diploma course within the bilateral programme; however NZAID is interested, more widely, in training needs within the public sector. A Training Needs Analysis is being conducted separately, under the auspices of the Tonga Education Support Programme (TESP) also funded by NZAID.

Diploma course content

The PSM diploma programme included management modules in policy, planning, service delivery, human resources, finance and (from 1999) in evaluation. It combined theory packages with practical implementation and provided linked modules which the participants were able to study while continuing their usual work. The courses were run in-country with staff from Massey making periodic visits to run course modules and other course activities. In general, students were expected to complete the course within three years of commencing.

The main purpose of the Dip PSM course was to give public sector managers in Tonga an opportunity to participate in an academically rigorous and practically-oriented programme of public sector management development. The course was specifically designed to increase the management competence of participants in their places of work.

Purpose

The overall purpose of the assignment is to evaluate the Dip PSM with a view to:

- a) analysing all issues affecting the effective delivery of the Dip PSM and its impact on course participants and on the public sector in Tonga;
- b) identifying lessons-learned for future NZAID-supported education and training programmes, particularly those involving the public sector in Tonga.

NZAID is accountable to Parliament, the New Zealand public, and partner governments and communities to ensure that development programmes remain relevant to the priorities of partners, are achieving the original objectives, and are likely to have sustainable results. NZAID is also concerned with learning from both past successes and challenges to improve future practice, and evaluations are a key part of this process. The timing for this evaluation is in line with the expiry of the contract with Massey University and will help guide future NZAID assistance.

The results of this evaluation will be reported to NZAID as the commissioner, but will be used by MOTEYS, the Ministry of Education, Women's Affairs and Culture (MEWAC), and NZAID to guide future programming support. The report will also be shared with the Massey University Graduate School of Business.

Scope

The evaluation covers all aspects of the Dip PSM funded by NZAID since the previous review was completed in 2002. In terms of carrying out a tracer study, the review will primarily be focused on participants based in Nuku'alofa, although some outreach work may be required in order to contact former participants now located in the outer islands. The evaluation will also involve working with staff at Massey University, NZAID in Wellington and the New Zealand High Commission, Nuku'alofa.

While the 2002 to 2007 period is a guideline when carrying out the tracer study, it may be appropriate to look beyond the five-year limit, particularly when examining trends and patterns involving participants working in other sectors, going overseas, changing careers, and discontinuing or continuing study.

Ideally the evaluation will cover all aspects of gaining the diploma, including the pre-diploma selection process, the overall period of study, and the post-diploma phase.

It is also essential that the evaluation of the Dip PSM takes into account core NZAID cross-cutting issues, namely to: uphold human rights, promote gender equality; protect the environment; promote conflict prevention and peace building; and limit the spread of HIV/AIDS. In considering the effectiveness of the diploma programme, the evaluation should identify any roadblocks to promoting cross-cutting issues within this programme and make appropriate recommendations for resolving the roadblocks in future.

It is anticipated that this review will take place in May 2008 and will take a maximum of 12 days (including at least 5 days in-country).

Overall Outcome and Objectives

<u>Outcome:</u> Comprehensive and thorough evaluation of the effectiveness of the Dip PSM programme and its impact on course participants and on the overall development of the Tongan public sector.

Objectives:

- 1. To assess the effectiveness of the Dip PSM programme in achieving the objectives and outcomes expressed in the original letter of commission with the Massey University Institute of Executive Development (25 March 1998), namely:
 - significantly increasing the level of competence of the course participants leading to improvements in public sector management in Tonga;
 - enhancing the ability of the course participants to perform functions set out in the Dip PSM module learning outcomes;

• strengthening public sector management in Tonga.

The consultant should consider the following in answering this objective:

- How effective was the course documentation, teaching resources, delivery mechanisms and student materials for the Dip PSM in Tonga?
- To what extent did all reports and documentation relate to the various intakes of the diploma programme?
- Using the data from a tracer study of the graduates from various intakes, to what extent are the objectives and outcomes of the course reflected in their ongoing work?
- What are the issues that supported or constrained graduates from implementing the outcomes of the course in their ongoing work?
- 2. To assess the relevance of the Dip PSM to the needs of the public service in Tonga.

The consultant should consider the following in answering this objective:

- To what extent do the Tongan authorities feel the Dip PSM supported activities of the GOT to strengthen its public sector?
- Was the material studied under the Dip PSM programme relevant to the management of the public sector in Tonga?
- How could training assistance better coordinate with and support continuing development and increasing effectiveness of the management of the public sector in Tonga?
- What other donor activity strengthens the public sector in Tonga, especially with reference to training and capacity building?
- 3. To undertake an evaluation of the management of the Tonga Dip PSM programme.

The consultant should consider the following in answering this objective:

- Was the quality and content of reporting satisfactory and did it meet agreed objectives?
- Were programme delivery and outcomes evaluated effectively?
- Was the programme cost effective?
- Was administration and management of the Dip PSM including any roles undertaken by NZAID (the DPM and the Post) and the GOT and Massey University –effective?

Method or Approach

In order to ensure the evaluation contributes in a meaningful way to supporting the growth and learning of NZAID programmes, the consultant is expected to employ participatory review techniques in undertaking this assignment (refer *NZAID Guideline on Participatory Evaluation*). This should include comprehensive involvement and consultations with a variety of stakeholders and an end of visit workshop to feedback draft findings to key stakeholders.

Although there is some flexibility in the methodology used, it is recommended that the consultant takes into account the following when carrying out the tasks outlined above:

- Prior to departure to Tonga, complete a literature search of relevant publications and reports on public sector training and management in the Pacific and analyse reports and documentation relevant to the Dip PSM programme;
- Visit and consult with the Graduate School of Business (formerly the Institute for Executive Development) at Massey University;
- Liaise with the Short-term Training Centre over preparation for the review including a tracer study of students in Tonga;
- Attend a pre-departure briefing at NZAID in Wellington with the Development Programme Manager and/or Officer for Tonga, and the relevant SAEG adviser(s);
- Consult with relevant organisations and groups in Tonga to discuss the impact of the project on development needs and priorities, including gender issues. Stakeholders consulted could include:
- Intended beneficiaries of the project as well as those likely to be affected;
- Relevant central government agencies, especially the Establishment Division of the Prime Minister's Office, Short-term Training Centre, Central Planning Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Finance, and other government agencies and project beneficiaries;
- Other donors active in the sector or in the area, eg AusAID, ADB.
- Visits to participants' employers to assess the impact of the diploma course;
- Consult with diploma graduates and any students who have previously dropped out;
- Provide feedback on preliminary findings this could include conducting a brief workshop with representatives of the partner government to discuss preliminary findings;
- Prepare a draft report;
- Attend a debriefing meeting at NZAID in Wellington;
- Prepare a final report.

The consultant will be required to spend three days preparing for the mission, five days in Tonga and four days writing the report on return to New Zealand - a total of up to 12 days. The consultant will be expected to submit a draft report to NZAID for comment within 14 days of returning to New Zealand, discuss the draft report with NZAID officials, and prepare a final report to include their comments.

Cost Effectiveness / Value for Money

While an assessment of relevance and sustainability is the primary focus of the review, NZAID also emphasises a 'value for money' approach. The review should therefore provide a brief assessment of how the money spent compares with the broad outcomes, impacts and changes brought about by the programme.

Composition of the Evaluation team

The review itself will be undertaken by one consultant. As the review is being commissioned by NZAID, an internal 'Steering Committee' has been established to provide a supervisory role for this review (membership outlined below). The consultant will liaise mainly with the NZAID Development Programme Officer (DPO) in Wellington who will provide the interface between the consultant and the wider agency. While in Tonga, the DPC will be the main point of contact.

Composition of the Steering Committee:

- DPO and DPM, Wellington
- DPC, Nuku'alofa
- SAEG Education Advisor, Wellington

Skill set required:

It is envisaged that the review would require the services of one person (who may be matched with a local GOT counterpart) to ensure a range of skills and perspectives. The consultant will need to have:

- Pacific development experience and knowledge and understanding of the social, cultural and political context of Tonga, including cross-cultural communication skills;
- Knowledge and experience of training delivery modes that result in effective skills development;
- Knowledge and experience in a range of tertiary training modes;
- Experience of public sector management and human resource development in the Pacific, and particularly Tonga;

- Project planning skills and experience;
- Demonstrated analytical and reporting skills;
- A broad knowledge and experience of development issues;
- Demonstrated understanding of, and commitment to, gender and development issues;
- Demonstrated ability to integrate results of multidisciplinary studies;
- Demonstrated ability to integrate gender issues in study methodology, analysis and reports
- Demonstrated facilitation and negotiation skills;
- Demonstrated understanding of, and commitment to, NZAID Guiding Principles.

Outputs / Reports

The consultant is required to produce the following outputs:

- <u>Output 1:</u> Methodology framework, submitted to NZAID in draft at the start of the assignment, for discussion and agreement;
- <u>Output 2</u> End-of-mission workshop in Tonga to report back preliminary findings to key stakeholders;
- <u>Output 3:</u> A draft written report within 14 days of returning to New Zealand followed by a debrief with NZAID staff in Wellington;
- <u>Output 4:</u> A debriefing with the development programme manager (DPM) and/or development programme officer (DPO) at NZAID after submission of the draft report.
- <u>Output 5:</u> A final report within 5 days of receiving feedback from NZAID.

The consultant should refer to the NZAID guideline on the structure of review and evaluation reports to ensure correct formatting and structure.

Quality Indicators

The Contractor shall ensure that the assignment is carried out with due diligence, efficiency and economy in accordance with the time specified in this Contract, observing sound management and technical practices, and complying with professional consulting standards.

Key Dates (sample only, TBC)

DateEventMilestoneFees (incl GST)

Monday 19 May 2008	Start date of contract		
Tuesday 24 June 2008 to	In-country research; end of visit		
2 July 2008	workshop in Tonga to feedback		
	draft findings to key stakeholders		
	(Output 1)		
Monday 7 July 2008	Submission of draft written report	1	50%
Friday 11 July 2008	Submission of final written report	2	50%
Friday 18 July 2008	End of contract		

Quality Indicators and Key Performance Indicators

The consultant shall ensure that the assignment is carried out with all due diligence, efficiency and economy in accordance with the time specified in the contract, observing sound management and technical practices, and complying with professional consulting standards recognised by relevant professional bodies.

Evaluation Follow-Up

Following submission of the final report, NZAID (including the Pacific Group, Strategy Advisory and Evaluation Group and the NZHC) will consider the draft report in consultation with the GOT. The Tonga Programme may prepare a submission to NZAID's Evaluation Committee. This Committee will make recommendations regarding the distribution of the report within NZAID and advise whether any additional external distribution steps need to be taken.

Appendix 3 Tracer study questionnaire

Diploma in Public Sector Management Tonga

Over the last ten years, four courses of the Diploma in Public Sector Management have been conducted for senior civil servants in Tonga. These were supported by NZAID. Now that the programme is finished, we would like to find out how effective it was and what has happened for the people who took part.

You enrolled in one of the DPSM courses so we really need to hear what has happened for you and what you think about the course now. Your answers will be confidential. I will NOT identify you in the report that will go to NZAID.

PLEASE take a few minutes to fill out the survey and write any extra comments on the back – the more the better. MALO AUPITO Alison Gray, Reviewer

1. Circle the year when you first enrolled:

 1998
 1999
 2002
 2003

- 2. What's your situation now? Tick the answer that is right for you
 - a) Graduated Which year _____
 - b) Not graduated Still working towards graduation
 - c) Not graduated Not currently studying

If you haven't graduated, what has made it hard for you to complete the DPSM?

3. Since you began the course, have you changed your behaviour as an employee/manager?

1	2	3
No change	Some change	Very great change
(hat has been the main shange	റ	

What has been the main change?

4. Since you began the course, have you had a promotion?

If yes, what was your level at the start _____ and what is it now____?

No

5. Since you began the course, have you changed your job?

Yes

If yes, was that: Tick the answer that's right for you

Moved within the same Department/Ministry/ SOE

Moved to another Department Ministry

Moved to an a State Owned Enterprise

Moved to an NGO or the private sector

Other

6. How much have you been able to use what you studied in your work?
Put 1 for not at all , 2=have used some learning 2=have used learning a lot Which year did you complete each module?

Module	Rating	Year completed
Human Resource Management		
Finance		
Policy		
Planning		
Service delivery		
Evaluation		
Other projects/assignments		

7. What has made it easier for you to use what you learnt in your work

8. What has made it harder for you to use what you learnt in your work?

9. Was the material you studied relevant to management in the public sector in Tonga?

123Not relevantQuite relevantVery relevant

10. If you were designing the course, what would you do differently?

11. Have you any other comments about the value of the Diploma in Public Service Management?

You may be invited to take part in a brief conversation about the DPSM. I hope you will be able to take part.

Thank you for your time and comments

Appendix 4 People interviewed

Name	Position		
Debbie Reschke	First Secretary, AusAID, Nuku'alofa		
Mishka Tu'ifua	Public Service Commissioner		
Course-related people			
Soana Aloua Lala	Formerly Programme Manager, NZAID		
David Bull	Formerly Course Director, Massey University School of Business		
James Lockhart	Associate Pro Vice-Chancellor, College of Business, Massey University		
Tutafu Moeaki	Deputy Secretary, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Formerly Ministry of Education)		
Jeffrey Taufa	Administrator, Ministry of Training, Employment, Youth and Sport		
Participanto and employers			
Participants and employers Luseane 'Aho	CEO. Tanga Wasta Managamant		
	CEO, Tonga Waste Management		
Nanise Fafita	Manager, Radio, Tonga Television		
Lupeolo Fisikale	Principal Assistant Secretary, Public Service Commission		
Marcienne Fukofuka	Senior Trade Officer, Ministry of Labour, Commerce and Industry		
Caroline Fusimalohi	Consultant, Anti-Corruption Commission, Ministry of Justice		
'Emeline 'Ilolahia	CEO, Civil Society Forum Tonga		
'Etena Kilisimasi	Manager, Administration, Tonga Communications Corporation		
Lusitania Latu	Acting Principal Economist, Ministry of Finance and National Planning		
Tevita Latu	Chief Accountant, Tonga Cooperative Federation		
Heimile Lifiafu	Forestry Officer, Ministry of Agriculture, Food, Fisheries and Forestry		
Hon. Luani	MP		
Melenaite Mahe	Officer in Charge, Government Pharmacy		
Lupe Matoto	Senior Environment Officer, Ministry of Land, Survey & Natural Resources and Environment		
Paula Mosa'ati	Manager, Marketing, Tonga Communications Corporation		
Salote Puloka	Hospital Administrator, Ministry of Health		
Etikene Samani	Manager Corporate Services, Tonga Development Bank		
Fatai Soakai	Training Officer, Ministry of Training, Employment, Youth and Sport		
Maliu Takai	Deputy Director, Ministry of Works		
Tu'ifua Takapautolo	Deputy Director, Post Secondary, Ministry of Education, Women and Culture		
Takitoa Taumoepeau	Manager, Tongan Amateur Sports Association		
Hakautapu Tonga	Assistant Senior Tourist Officer, Ministry of Tourism		
Meleoni Uera	Deputy Director, Ministry of Training, Employment, Youth and Sport		
Hon. Albert Vaea	Secretary, Tonga Traditional Committee, Palace Office		
Fotu Vaikune	Acting Chief Architect, Ministry of Works		
Sione Vailanu	Deputy Secretary, Ministry of Labour, Commerce and Industry		
Suliana Vi	Project Coordinator, Ministry of Land, Survey & Natural Resources and Environment		

Apper		ourse participants and stati	19
Intake	Name	Post	Graduate (includes
B			eligible to graduate)
	ector posts	1	
1	Mrs Polotu Paunga	Deputy Director	Graduated
		Women's Division, MEWAC	
1	Mrs Kalolaine Moeaki	TSGP Counterpart, MEWAC	Graduated
1	Mr Tevita Faka'osi	Deputy Director, MAFFF	Graduated
1	Mr Maliu Takai	Deputy Director, MOW	Graduated
1	Mr Fotu Veikune	Acting Chief Architect, MOW	
1	Hon. Albert T Vaea	Secretary, Tonga Traditional Committee, Palace Office	Graduated
1	Mrs Suliana Vi	Project Coordinator, Environment Department	Graduated
1	Mr Pita Vuki	Deputy Secretary, PMO	Graduated
1	Dr.Caroline	Anti-corruption Commission,	Graduated
	Fusimalohi	Ministry of Justice (contractor)	
2	Mr 'Aminiasi Kefu	Senior Crown Counsel, Crown Law	
2	Mr Vilimo Fakalolo	Fisheries Division, Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries, Forestry and Food	
2	Ms Kassa Kilone	Ministry of Education	
2	Ms Akanesi Taufa	CEO, Ministry of Finance and National Planning	
3	Mrs 'Olivina Tu'iono	Senior Education Officer – Scholarship, MEWAC	
3	Ms Pisila Matafahi	Chief Accounts Officer, MOW	
3	Mr Soane Haseli	Principal Traffic Officer, Ministry Marine and Ports	Graduated
3	Ms Lusitania Latu	Acting Principal Economics, Ministry of Finance and National Planning	
3	Mr Sione Lino	Private, Tonga Defence Services	
3	Mr Soane 'Aholelei	Captain, Tonga Defence Services	
3	Ms Siosi'ana Fisi'inaua	Acting Govt Statistician, Statistice Department	
3	Ms 'Olivia Tu'ihalamaka	Senior Health Administrator, Vaiola Hospital	Graduated
3	Mrs Lupeolo Fisikaile	Principal Assistant Secretary, Public Service Commission	
3	Mr Timote Laume	Principal Financial Analyst, Ministry of Finance and National Planning	On a scholarship
3	Mrs Hakautapu Tonga	Asst Senior Tourist Officer, Tonga Visitors Bureau	Graduated
3	Mr Lou Pale	Ministry of Marine and Ports	
4	Mrs Tu'ifua Takapautolo	Deputy Director Post Secondary, MEWAC	Graduated
4	Mr Heimuli Likiafu	Forestry Officer, MAFFF	
4	Mrs Fatai Soakai	Training Officer, MOTEYS	

Appendix 5 List of course participants and status

4	Mr Hekisou Fifita	Lecturer, National Centre for	
4		Vocational Studies	
4	Mrs Meleoni Uera	Deputy Director, Training, Admin. &	
4		Policy, MOTEYS	
4	Mrs Marcienne	Senior Trade Officer, Ministry of	
	Fukofuka	Labour, Commerce and Industry	
4	Mr Sione Vailanu	Deputy Secretary, Ministry of	
		Labour, Commerce and Industry	
4	Mrs Lupe Matoto	Senior Environment Officer,	
		Environment Department	
4	Mrs Salote W.	Hospital Administrator, Ministry of	
	(Schaumkel) Puloka	Health	
SOEs			-
1	Mrs Luseane 'Aho	Chief Executive Officer – Tonga Waste Management	Graduated
2	Mrs Melenaite Mahe	Officer in Charge, Government Pharmacy	Graduated
3	Mrs 'Etina Kilisimani	Manager Administration, TCC	
3	Ms Seini Tu'i'afitu	Officer in Charge, Vava'u Tonga	Graduated
		Airport Ltd	
3	Ms Gladys Fukufuka	TCC	
4	Mr Kinitoni Mafi	Airport Manager, Tonga Airport Ltd	
4	Mr Sione Veikoso	Manager, Engineering, Tonga	
		Communications Corporation	
4	Mr 'Etikeni Samani	Manager, Corporate Services,	Graduated
		Tonga Development Bank	
4	Mr Paula Mosa'ati	Manager – Roaming, Tonga	Graduated
		Communications Corporation	
4	Ms Nanise Fifita	Radio Manager, Tonga	
		Broadcasting Commission	
4	Mr Sioeli Maka Tohi	Technical Manager, Tonga	Graduated
		Television	
Non dov	/ /ernment – private		
1	Mr T Kaitu'u Fotu	Manager, Pacific Blue Airline	Graduated
1	Mr Takitoa	Manager, Tongan Amateur Sports	Graduated
	Taumoepeau	Assn	
2	Mr Siale Pahulu	Tonga Print	
2	Mr Soane Patolo	Manager, Fua'amotu Airport	Graduated
		Terminal Services	
3	Mrs 'Emeline 'Ilolahia	CEO, Civil Society Forum of Tonga	Graduated
3	Mr Tevita Latu	Chief Accountant, Tonga	-
		Cooperative Federation	
3	Mr Malakai	Private company	
	Vakasiuola		
4	Mr Angus Naupoto	High Performance Manager	
		(seconded to) Tonga Rugby Union	
Other			

Not curr	ently an employee in Tor	iga	
1	Mr Mosese Fakatou	Retired	Graduated
1	Mr Sione Falemanu	Retired 2008	Graduated
1	Mr Kalolo Fihaki	Migrated	Graduated
1	Mr Lamipeti Havea	Retired 2007	Graduated
1	Mr Finau Savelio	Retired 2006	Graduated
1	Mrs Katarina Foliaki	Migrated, Fiji	
2	Ms Mele Lupe Vunipola	Domestic Mgt	Graduated
2	Mr Tonga Faeamani	Retired June 2007 Now OIC Family History Research	Graduated
2	Mrs Lu'isa Kefu	Retired 2007 Deceased 2008	Graduated
2	Miss 'Asinate Matangi	"Cyclist Manager"	Graduated
3	Mr Sione Ketu'u	Migrated	
3	Ms Emma Finau- Ivarature	Migrated	
3	Ms Lesieli Taumalolo	Migrated	
3	Ms Losaline Ma'asi	Migrated	
4	Mr Viliamu Manu	Deceased	
4	Mr Filimone Matoto	Migrated	
4	Mr Hakaumotu Fakapelea	SPC, Fiji	
4	Mr Tevita Havea	Migrated	
4	Mr Tevita Fatai	Migrated	

Intake 1

Nine out of the 20 course members in Intake 1 are still employed in the Government, all of them in senior positions. Eight of the nine graduated; the ninth has a project to finish.

One graduate is head of a State Owned Enterprise (SOE); two are in private companies; a fourth is an MP while a fifth is head of the Tongan Amateur Sports Association and the Tongan Representative on the IOC.

Six participants are now retired or deceased or have migrated.

Intake 2

Information was available for only 11 of the 20 participants who began Intake 2. Eight students from this group withdrew - two moved overseas, one left the public service, four could not cope with the study plus their other commitments and one had unforeseen family problems. A ninth planned to resume study with a later group.

Of the 11, four are still employed in the public service, all of them in senior management positions. While none has actually graduated with a Diploma, all have completed the course work.

One graduate is head of an SOEs, both are graduates. Two participants, one of whom has graduated, are in private employment.

Two graduates have retired (one is now deceased) and two graduates are not currently in employment (both have family responsibilities.)

Intake 3

Twenty –two students began Intake 3. Of these, 12 are currently employed in Government, all in senior management positions. A t the time of the review, two of the 12 were studying overseas. Two have graduated and most of the remainder have completed the course work.

Three participants are senior managers in SOEs; one has graduated.

One graduate is head of an NGO; two who have yet to graduate are in private companies. Four have migrated.

Intake 4

Of the 21 students who enrolled for Intake 4, nine are still employed in Government, six in senior positions and three in middle management. None has yet graduated although almost all have finished the course work.

Six are in senior positions in SOEs; three of the six are graduates.

One is a manager in the Tongan Rugby Union on secondment from a Government Department. Five have migrated.

Appendix 6Course content for Diploma in Public SectorManagement

- 1. Public sector policy management module covers:
 - Formulating good policies and seeing whether they fit with other existing policies and general direction of Government
 - Developing sound policy options, analysing them and selecting the most appropriate
 - Reviewing policies so that their relevance and appropriateness are known
 - Translating policies into programs and plans based on the vision, purpose and values of the Ministry
 - Recognising ethical considerations so that the public sector values of service professionalism and integrity are upheld.
- 2. Public sector management module covers:
 - Making planning a consultative process by considering all the relevant interests if the plan is to be relevant
 - Preparing goals that are appropriate to the policies of Government and the areas in which it operates
 - Providing good leadership in order to gain the commitment of people
 - Creating demand for services by marketing them to the public
 - Monitoring, evaluating and reviewing the performance of the Ministry.
- 3. Public sector service delivery module covers:
 - Understanding the nature of the services provided by the Ministry
 - Understanding the demand made by the general public on those services
 - Ensuring quality in service delivery in order to meet the expectations of Government and the general public.
 - Recognising the need to protect the interests of the Government and the public
 - Recognising how Government and the public want the services delivered and in better ways
 - Building a good system of service delivery
 - Promoting a professional service with a good image through public relations
 - Enhancing service delivery by letting the public know the purpose and mission of the Ministry
 - Managing service delivery effectively through project management, project evaluation, information management, quality management and so on.
- 4. Public sector human resource management module covers:
 - Managing human resources in a way that enhances efficiency and effectiveness in performance
 - How to draw a quality human resource plan in order to secure the right kind of people
 - Using effective recruitment and selection, staff development, succession planning and performance management
 - Managing the relationships of the organisation with other relevant partners.

- 5. Public sector financial management module covers:
 - Revising policy and plans in monetary terms
- 6, Public sector evaluation module covers:
 - Effectively evaluating policy, plans and service delivery to create feedback which will be necessary for the ongoing improvement of the organisation.