

# MFAT Management Response to Timor-Leste Community Policing Support Programme Strategic Review Report

Evaluation:	Timor-Leste Community Policing Support Programme Strategic Review
Background:	New Zealand has been supporting the institutional development of its counterpart, the Policia Nacional de Timor-Leste (PNTL) for over 20 years. The current phase of support - the Timor-Leste Community Policing Support Programme (TLCPSP) - is a five year NZD14 million dollar activity designed to help PNTL sustain the community policing approach long-term. The TLCPSP is led by the PNTL in collaboration with the New Zealand Police (NZP) and The Asia Foundation (TAF), with funding from the New Zealand Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade (MFAT). It is jointly managed between NZP, TAF, PNTL, MFAT, and the Timor-Leste Ministry of Defence and Security (MDS).
	The TLCPSP builds on New Zealand's previous assistance for policing in Timor-Leste, including a Community Policing Pilot Programme implemented in 2009 under the auspices of the United Nations Mission in Timor-Leste, the Timor-Leste Community Policing Programme 2011-2015 and the HAKOHAK programme 2011-2015, which established Community Policing Councils and trained suku (community-level) police officers in community policing principles. The overall goal of the TLCPSP is improved safety and security in Timor-Leste, through effective and efficient community policing.
	<ol> <li>The TLCPSP comprises five components:</li> <li>A strategic component, focused at the national level, providing support for PNTL to further develop and institutionalise its community policing policy, strategy, action plans, systems and procedures,</li> <li>An institutional component designed to create and embed suku</li> </ol>
	<ul><li>(village) level security mechanisms</li><li>A mentoring and training component designed to support effective</li></ul>

- recruitment and in-service community policing training (among all PNTL staff) to develop knowledge and skills in community policing,
- 4. A "violence against women" component designed to strengthen

the police and community response to domestic violence; and

 A policy component, designed to support deeper integration of community policing approaches into the PNTL strategic plan, budget and operations.

The TLCPSP began officially in June 2016, although a transition period from January 2016 was implemented in accordance with the agreed activity design document whilst waiting for implementation contracts to be signed. A Partnership Arrangement between the governments of Timor-Leste and New Zealand was signed on 10 June 2016. The activity was designed to comprise two distinct phases, covering the first three years of programming (2016-2018) and a final two years (2019-2020) respectively. The first phase was intended to be the most resource intensive while the second, and final, phase was designed to constitute a drawdown of activities and phasing out of New Zealand support. At the time of this review there were two NZP advisers, but since then this number has increased to three

In this activity NZP plays a key technical advisory and training support role. Three NZP advisors provide assistance in the integration of community policing at the strategic level in PNTL, and also training and operational expertise in the further development and implementation of community policing at the sub-national level.

TAF supports development of a sustainable and locally relevant model of community policing that is absorbed by the Timorese State and becomes the full responsibility of PNTL and relevant ministries. The aim of this support is to ensure viable sustainability through integration with local governance structures.

A key focus is on the development and integration of effective crime prevention, and improving response approaches to common issues including domestic violence that are consistent with Timorese law.

# Findings: Key findings from the evaluation **1. Relevance** The Timor-Leste Community Policing Support Programme remains highly relevant to the needs of the PNTL and to the people and the Government of Timor-Leste. The GoTL is currently in the process of operationalising an ambitious community policing approach

throughout the country as part of PNTL Visibility, Involvement and Professionalism (VIP) model of Community Policing.

#### 2. Effectiveness

The TLCPSP has an adequate level of effectiveness. The programme has made significant progress in raising the capacity of PNTL and those who experienced a Community Policing Council. Other significant progress includes: placement of trained police officers at 452 Sukus (communities), training of more than 3,500 PNTL members in community policing; PNTL leadership's growing enthusiasm for an appropriate Timor-Leste community policing model; and the good relationships between PNTL and communities, and New Zealand Police with the Asia Foundation.

Constraints to effectiveness were also identified and are being considered.

#### 3. Efficiency

The TLCPSP has a good level of efficiency and represents good value for money. As of September 2018, with almost the first three years of the programme completed, roughly 50 per cent (NZ\$7,558,602) of the TLCPSP NZ\$14 million budget had been expended on the programme. This has been achieved by deployment of a maximum of three NZP advisors at any one time. Harnessing the expertise of a majority Timor-Leste national-staffed implementation team across both NZP and TAF components also maximised efficiency. The potential to draw down expertise and backroom resources from TAF's main office in Dili and from NZP's Wellington Headquarters (e.g. M&E expertise) also enhanced efficiency.

#### 4. Sustainability

Local ownership of the activity appears strong, with a high level of commitment and enthusiasm in the PNTL to include community policing in the PNTL's Visibility, Involvement and Professionalism (VIP) model. However, there are still limited resources allocated by the government to the implementation of Community Policing at the municipality level. New Zealand's current support has been delivered at the right time, and in the right context to maximise results. Both TAF and NZP bring an appropriate policing model, with Page 4 of 11

relevant skills and experience, including experience gained through international policing support in other Pacific Island Nations and South East Asia. Ongoing support to the PNTL by the NZP and TAF appears logical and much needed.

#### 5. Cross-cutting themes

TLCPSP scores well on gender, with the Ending of Violence Against Women initiative inherent in TLCPSP outcomes, and a history of activities to realise this. The TLCPSP's annual reports and commissioned research reflect monitoring of gender issues. Despite this, village-level mediation of Violence Against Women and Children, and family violence, continues to occur and will require ongoing attention

Link to evaluation TL-CPSP Strategic Review Report FINAL

Date of Steering Group sign-off 24 July 2019

Approval of the MFAT Management Response

Signature:

Jacquie Dean, Unit Manager

Date:

14 / 10 / 2019

# Page 5 of 11

No	Recommendation	Response and Action (Agree, Partially Agree, Reject)	Responsibility	When	12 month progress
1.	The review team makes the following recommendations on the future of the TLCPSP				
	<ul> <li>Extended Term</li> <li>A drawdown of NZP advisors by 2020 is not recommended. Although the PNTL is committed to implementing community policing, including deploying police officers to communities, it faces challenges in securing funding, assuring the quality of policing services (including internal training), and in building community trust. An increase in the PNTL's members is anticipated to support this strategy. In these circumstances, given NZP's highly relevant policing model and experience, New Zealand's history of support in Timor-Leste, and existing relationships between PNTL and the NZP, withdrawing NZP advisors by 2020 would be counterproductive to the Programme's achievements to date and to its stated objectives.</li> </ul>	Partially Agreed: MFAT/NZP extended the in- country police deployments for two years over 2019 and 2020. This will enable a well- managed transition. At this point NZP will have been partnering with the PNTL for over 20 years and significant progress will have been made towards the objective of improved safety and security in Timor-Leste, through effective and efficient community policing. Continued NZP extensions beyond 2020 could be counter-productive to building confidence in PNTL leadership.	MFAT GDS Wellington (lead) and Dili Post (support) work with NZP on transition	Late 2019 and Early 2020	
	• Extend the TLCPSP for a further five years (from 2019) through to the end of 2023. The Review Team considers that a further five years of support is necessary from 2019 to 2023, with a budget envelope of around NZD8 million for the three years 2021 to 2023. This will provide the opportunity for continued integration of diverse agency operations, along with embedding community policing strategies, principles and operations into workforce culture. This may require MFAT according Timor-Leste special consideration for continued support outside the Pacific Reset.	<b>Partially Agreed:</b> Timor-Leste remains a priority under the New Zealand Aid Programme. While NZP will withdraw after 2020, continuation of the component of the TLCPSP delivered through The Asia Foundation may continue if prioritised by the PNTL.	Dili Post to work with TAF on design and contract for new phase	Ongoing	

# Page 6 of 11

No	Recommendation	Response and Action (Agree, Partially Agree, Reject)	Responsibility	When	12 month progress
2	<ul> <li>Managing Resources</li> <li>The Review Team makes the following recommendations concerning resource management to support programme implementation.</li> <li>NZP to deploy three full-time NZP advisors to Timor-Leste as soon as possible for an initial period of two years (with an option to be considered for a further three years). These advisors would hold the roles of:         <ul> <li>Team Leader (leadership and strategic advice to PNTL Executive);</li> <li>Training Advisor (supporting accreditation and delivery of community policing curriculum, planning and preparing budget submissions for GoTL funding); and</li> <li>PNTL M&amp;E Advisor (supporting and strengthening the PNTL's M&amp;E system for community policing and supporting data collection and analysis about community policing initiatives).</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<b>Partially Agree.</b> NZP deployed three police advisors as recommended from October 2018 (although not including_an M & E specialist), and a managed, phased NZP exit will be implemented by the end of 2020. Community policing support may be provided beyond 2020 through our existing CSO partner (TAF).	MFAT GDS/Dili Post/NZP	Completed (in October 2018)	
	<ul> <li>NZP ISG to adopt client-focussed advisor selection and management processes. This may include consulting Government of Timor-Leste (GoTL) counterparts during the selection of advisors; allowing extension of advisor deployments beyond two years as necessary to ensure continuity of support; and delegating greater administrative and financial authority to the in- country NZP team to undertake work planning and disbursement of funds without seeking ISG approval.</li> </ul>	<b>N/A</b> : Since this will be the final police deployment, this recommendation is not applicable. It should be noted that NZP has sound operational reasons for setting two- year deployment terms, which MFAT fully supports. NZP has reviewed the financial delegations and confirmed that the current arrangements enable an appropriate degree of devolved decision-making by its seconded advisors.	n/a	n/a	

# Page 7 of 11

0	Recommendation	Response and Action (Agree, Partially Agree, Reject)	Responsibility	When	12 month progress
	• TLCPSP to accord priority to PNTL and Locally-Engaged Staff (LES) leadership. This requires NZP and TAF to increasingly adopt advisory roles, building GoTL counterparts' capacity and confidence to lead and conduct the planning and implementation of programme activities. In addition, NZP and TAF would progressively build the technical and management capacities of TLCPSP LES to provide strategic advice relating to community policing and to manage programme delivery.	<b>Agree.</b> TAF and NZP local staff have been following this approach since late 2018.	TAF and NZP Teams	Since last year and ongoing	
	<ul> <li>NZP and TAF to select a Team Leader and Deputy Team Leader for the TLCPSP. Clarity on this hierarchy issue will streamline programme management.</li> </ul>	<b>Not Agreed:</b> NZP and TAF are mutual partners in implementation and share responsibilities, regular coordination and consultation on matters relating to implementation (e.g. training, budget, etc.)	Dili Post / NZP / TAF	n/a	
	• MFAT to recruit an external, independent M&E expert to work with NZP and TAF to review the RMT at the outputs level for the final two years of the TLCPSP. The expert would also provide advice on the data collection and reporting. This would allow for outputs-level measurement for the final two years of the TLCPSP, and for provision of advice on data collection and reporting.	<b>Partially Agree.</b> The RMT is being revised collaboratively by in-house M&E experts from MFAT, TAF and NZP. Independent M&E expertise may be brought in when the RMT for any follow-up activity (involving TAF) is designed.	MFAT Wgtn / TAF / NZP	Ongoing	
	<ul> <li>The NZP Training Advisor to co-locate with the Australian Federal Police (AFP) at the PTC. This will support consistency between the TLCPSP and TLPDP and alignment to PTC priorities.</li> </ul>	<b>Partially Agree:</b> While not co-located, the NZP training advisor is currently working closely with the AFP adviser in the Police Training College.	NZP	Ongoing	

# Page 8 of 11

No	Recommendation	Response and Action (Agree, Partially Agree, Reject)	Responsibility	When	12 month progress
3	<ul> <li>Planning, M&amp;E and Reporting         The review team makes the following recommendations about the scope of the         TLCPSP's outputs, and processes required to support their implementation:         </li> <li>TLCPSP to align its activities to the PNTL General Commander's three         priorities. Alignment of the current five TLCPSP outputs to the PNTL General         Commander's three priorities (executive support, training, and         strengthened management of community policing M&amp;E) will assure the         relevance of both TLCPSP to the PNTL, and also address the ongoing needs         of Community Policing Councils (CPCs). This will bring clarity to the         programme's implementation, results measurement, and reporting across         both components. The following alignment is suggested.         <ul> <li>Output 1: Leadership: Strategic advice and support to PNTL             leadership in implementing its community policing model and             addressing domestic violence (DV).</li> <li>Output 2: Training: Mentoring and training of PNTL (including at the             PTC) and community policing structures on community policing and             addressing DV. TAF would continue to support CPCs' training and             orientation, but a key shift would be that TAF would work with MoSA             to build internal capacity for MoSA to conduct the CPC orientation</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	Partially Agree. All the partners and stakeholders - MFAT/NZ Embassy, TAF and NZP, Ministry of the Interior, Ministry of State Administration and PNTL - are currently working closely to develop a Transition Plan that will define the priority areas to be focused on in the remaining 14 months of NZP's engagement. The alignment proposed by the evaluators will be considered during this process.	Dili Post / TAF / NZP (with GoTL)	Ongoing – discussion on Transition Plan	
	training sessions; and				

# Page 9 of 11

Νο	Recommendation	Response and Action (Agree, Partially Agree, Reject)	Responsibility	When	12 month progress
	<ul> <li>Output 3: M&amp;E: Support to strengthen PNTL's and community policing structures' M&amp;E (research, planning &amp; budgeting) in assessing community policing and addressing DV. TAF would continue to support CPCs' monitoring, including through research, but a key shift would be that TAF would work with MoSA to build MoSA's capacity to monitor the quality of CPCs.</li> </ul>	<b>Partially Agree</b> , While NZP and TAF are not	TAF and NZP	Ongoing	
	<ul> <li>Physically integrate TLCPSP components. Following the PNTL General Commander's approval, NZP and TAF personnel to co-locate at PNTL HQ, undertaking any necessary refurbishment to accommodate all staff.</li> </ul>	permanently co-located, their staff are in effect co-located for significant periods while working on activities such as development of Municipality Action Plans (MAP), CP Curriculum Development, Community Policing Forum, OPS Training, District			
	<ul> <li>NZP and TAF to undertake joint planning and joint implementation of activities whenever possible, including providing regular joint operationally-focussed briefings to the PNTL Executive and to MoSA counterparts on programme programs</li> </ul>	Commander Workshop, etc. Agree. This is now standard practice	Ongoing	Ongoing	
	<ul> <li>Counterparts on programme progress.</li> <li>The TLCPSP to report jointly to MFAT quarterly on progress against output indicators, and six-monthly against both output and outcome indicators. The programme's Annual Reports would include summaries of progress on outputs and against outcome indicators, including for long-term outcomes.</li> </ul>	<b>Partially Agree:</b> Currently CPSP Team and PNTL counterparts report jointly to the Programme Management Committee chaired by PNTL General Commander and NZ Deputy Ambassador. A joint annual report will be prepared by TAF in conjunction with NZP. TAF will take the recommendations on contents into consideration in preparing future reports.	TAF, with NZP	Ongoing	

# Page 10 of 11

No	Recommendation	Response and Action (Agree, Partially Agree, Reject)	Responsibility	When	12 month progress
4.	<ul> <li>Revised Focus Areas/Activities</li> <li>The review team proposes the following revisions to TLCPSP's areas of focus:         <ul> <li>TLCPSP to focus on gender equality within the PNTL. Programme efforts to increase female representation and support female officers in leadership roles are recommended. This will include making changes at every point of the employment cycle, including recruitment, offering career progression options, and training. In addition, TLCPSP can continue to serve as a role model by placing women in leadership and other prominent roles within both components of the programme (NZP and TAF).</li> </ul> </li></ul>	<b>Agree:</b> These recommendations will be considered in the next planning retreat to formulate the CPSP 2020 Action Plan.	MFAT Post / TAF / NZP	Ongoing	
	• TLCPSP to explore the possibility of working with the DPKN to form a Human Rights Working Group. The Working Group would review PNTL policies, plans, Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs), and training curricula for consistency with human rights standards.	Agree: CPSP will collaborate with Human Rights Ombudsman office and DPKN to establish this working group to provide oversight of the development and implementation of PNTL policies, plans, Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs), and training curricula for consistency with human rights standards.	TAF	Ongoing	
	<ul> <li>NZP and TAF to specifically address the issue of whether CPCs are operating in a way that is inconsistent with human rights standards in the TLCPSP risk matrix.</li> </ul>	<b>Agree:</b> CPSP (NZP and TAF) will support CPCs to integrate gender and human rights appropriately in their operations. CPSP will then update the TLCPSP Matrix.	TAF	Ongoing	

# Page 11 of 11

No	Recommendation	Response and Action (Agree, Partially Agree, Reject)	Responsibility	When	12 month progress
	<ul> <li>Following a stocktake of the OPS housing project, TLCPSP to consider funding a second phase of building OPS houses at targeted locations. The decision would need to be based on strong evidence that housing built under the first phase has contributed to improved community safety and security because of the OPS living within/closer to the community. An 'accessibility project' approach which applies several TLCPSP areas of activity is recommended.</li> </ul>	<b>Not Agreed</b> : This is not necessary since, following the successful pilot funding by MFAT of 14 community police houses, PNTL, through the Ministry of Interior, has already allocated funds for construction of 28 additional houses in the 2020 budget.	GoTL and PNTL	2020	
	<ul> <li>MFAT to require environment (land disputes) as a cross-cutting issue for the TLCPSP. Inclusion of land disputes in the TLCPSP would assist communities, through the CPCs, to address land disputes, and associated violence.</li> </ul>	<b>Partially Agree</b> : This has been considered during the implementation of the police housing initiative, and integrated into CPCs' work at the Suku (community) level.	Post and TAF	Completed	
	• TLCPSP to explore collaborating with the Australian-funded TLPDP on the Information Management System (IMS). TLCPSP to explore whether information reported by OPS, including data currently recorded in the NZP master dashboard, can be uploaded into the IMS in future to further enable the DPKN to report on community policing activities across Timor-Leste.	Agree: The dashboard has now been shared by the NZP team with all District Commanders to ensure better reporting and use of evidence-based data for decision making and resource allocation. Relevant information will be integrated into the Information Management System.	NZP (with AFP and PNTL)	Ongoing	