

CHAPTER 17

CONSULTATIONS AND DISPUTE SETTLEMENT

SECTION A

Introductory Provisions

Article 1 Objectives

The objective of this Chapter is to provide an effective, efficient and transparent process for consultations and settlement of disputes arising under this Agreement.

Article 2 Definitions

For the purposes of this Chapter, the following definitions shall apply unless the context otherwise requires:

- (a) **Complaining Party** means any Party or Parties that request consultations under Article 6 (Consultations);
- (b) **dispute arising under this Agreement** means a complaint made by a Party concerning any measure affecting the operation, implementation or application of this Agreement whereby any benefit accruing to the Complaining Party directly or indirectly under this Agreement is being nullified or impaired, or the attainment of any objective of this Agreement is being impeded, as a result of the failure of the Responding Party to carry out its obligations¹ under this Agreement²;

¹ A failure to carry out its obligations includes application by the Responding Party of any measure which is in conflict with the obligations under this Agreement.

² Non-violation complaints are not permitted under this Agreement.

- (c) **Parties to the dispute** means the Complaining Party and the Responding Party;
- (d) **Responding Party** means any Party to which the request for consultations is made under Article 6 (Consultations); and
- (e) **Third Party** means any Party who has notified its substantial trade interest or substantial interest in the matter pursuant to Article 6.7 (Consultations) or Article 10.1 (Third Parties) respectively.

Article 3 Scope and Coverage

1. Except as otherwise provided in this Agreement, this Chapter shall apply to the avoidance or settlement of disputes arising under this Agreement. This Chapter shall not apply to the settlement of disputes arising under Chapter 5 (Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures), Chapter 10 (Electronic Commerce), Chapter 12 (Economic Co-operation) and Chapter 14 (Competition).

2. This Chapter shall apply subject to such special and additional provisions on dispute settlement contained in other Chapters of this Agreement.

3. Subject to Article 5 (Choice of Forum), this Chapter is without prejudice to the rights of a Party to have recourse to dispute settlement procedures available under other agreements to which it is a party.

4. This Chapter may be invoked in respect of measures affecting the observance of this Agreement taken by central, regional or local governments or authorities within the territory of a Party.

Article 4

General Provisions

1. This Agreement shall be interpreted in accordance with the customary rules of treaty interpretation of public international law.
2. All notifications, requests and replies made pursuant to this Chapter shall be in writing.
3. The Parties to the dispute are encouraged at every stage of a dispute to make every effort to reach a mutually agreed solution to the dispute. Where a mutually agreed solution is reached, the terms and conditions of the agreement shall be notified to the other Parties.
4. Unless otherwise specified, any time periods provided for in this Chapter may be modified by mutual agreement of the Parties to the dispute provided that any modification shall not prejudice the rights of the Third Parties pursuant to Article 10 (Third Parties).

Article 5

Choice of Forum

1. Where a dispute concerning any matter arises under this Agreement and under another international agreement to which the Parties to the dispute are party, the Complaining Party may select the forum in which to address that matter and that forum shall be used to the exclusion of other possible fora in respect of that matter.
2. For the purposes of this Article, the Complaining Party shall be deemed to have selected the forum in which to settle the dispute when it has requested the establishment of an arbitral tribunal pursuant to Article 8 (Request for Establishment of Arbitral Tribunals) or requested the establishment of, or referred a matter to, a similar dispute settlement panel under another international agreement.

3. This Article does not apply where the Parties to the dispute agree in writing that this Article shall not apply to a particular dispute.

SECTION B

Consultation Provisions

Article 6 Consultations

1. Any Party may request consultations with any other Party with respect to any dispute arising under this Agreement. A Responding Party shall accord due consideration to a request for consultations made by a Complaining Party and shall accord adequate opportunity for such consultations.

2. Any request for consultations shall give the reasons for the request, including identification of the measures at issue and an indication of the legal basis for the complaint.

3. A copy of all such requests shall be simultaneously provided to all Parties. The Responding Party shall immediately acknowledge receipt of the request by way of notification to all Parties, indicating the date on which the request was received.

4. The Responding Party shall, unless otherwise mutually agreed, reply to the request within seven days after the date of its receipt and shall enter into consultations within a period of no more than:

- (a) ten days after the date of receipt of the request in cases of urgency, including perishable goods; or
- (b) 30 days after the date of receipt of the request for all other matters.

5. If the Responding Party does not enter into consultations within the periods specified in Paragraph 4, or a period otherwise mutually agreed, the Complaining Party may proceed directly to request the establishment of an arbitral tribunal pursuant to Article 8 (Request for Establishment of Arbitral Tribunals).

6. The Parties to the dispute shall make every effort to reach a mutually satisfactory solution through consultations. To this end, the Parties to the dispute shall:

- (a) provide sufficient information to enable a full examination of the matter, including how the measures at issue might affect the implementation or application of this Agreement;
- (b) treat any confidential or proprietary information exchanged in the course of consultations on the same basis as the Party providing the information; and
- (c) endeavour to make available for the consultations personnel of its government agencies or other regulatory bodies who have responsibility for and/or expertise in the matter under consultation.

7. Whenever a Party other than the Parties to the dispute considers that it has a substantial trade interest in the consultations, such Party may notify the Parties to the dispute within seven days after the notification of the request for consultations, of its desire to be joined in the consultations. Such notification shall be simultaneously provided to all Parties. Such Party shall be joined in the consultations if the Parties to the dispute agree.

Article 7
Good Offices, Conciliation, Mediation

1. The Parties to the dispute may at any time agree to good offices, conciliation or mediation. Procedures for good offices, conciliation or mediation may begin at any time and may be terminated at any time.
2. If the Parties to the dispute agree, procedures for good offices, conciliation or mediation may continue while the matter is being examined by an arbitral tribunal established or re-convened under this Chapter.
3. Proceedings involving good offices, conciliation and mediation and positions taken by the Parties to the dispute during these proceedings shall be confidential and without prejudice to the rights of any Parties to the dispute in any further or other proceedings.

SECTION C

Adjudication Provisions

Article 8
Request for Establishment of Arbitral Tribunals

1. The Complaining Party may request the establishment of an arbitral tribunal to consider the matter if:
 - (a) the Responding Party does not enter into consultations in accordance with Article 6.4 (Consultations); or
 - (b) if the consultations fail to resolve a dispute within:
 - (i) 20 days after the date of receipt of the request for consultations in cases of urgency including perishable goods;

- (ii) 60 days after the date of receipt of the request for consultations regarding any other matter; or
- (iii) such other period as the Parties to the dispute may agree.

2. A request made pursuant to Paragraph 1 shall identify the specific measures at issue and provide details of the factual and legal basis of the complaint (including the provisions of this Agreement to be addressed by the arbitral tribunal) sufficient to present the problem clearly.

3. A copy of all such requests shall be simultaneously provided to all Parties. The Responding Party shall immediately acknowledge receipt of the request by way of notification to all Parties, indicating the date on which the request was received.

4. Where a request is made pursuant to Paragraph 1, an arbitral tribunal shall be established in accordance with Article 11 (Establishment and Re-convening of Arbitral Tribunals).

Article 9 Procedures for Multiple Complainants

1. Where more than one Party requests the establishment of an arbitral tribunal related to the same matter, a single arbitral tribunal may be established to examine these complaints if all of the Parties to the disputes agree. The Parties to the disputes should seek to establish a single arbitral tribunal whenever feasible.

2. The single arbitral tribunal shall organise its examination and present its findings in such a manner that the rights which the Parties to the dispute would have

enjoyed had separate arbitral tribunals examined the complaints are in no way impaired.

3. If more than one arbitral tribunal is established to examine the complaints related to the same matter, the Parties to the disputes shall endeavour to ensure that the same persons serve as arbitrators for each arbitral tribunal. The arbitral tribunals shall consult to ensure, to the greatest extent possible, that the timetables for the arbitral tribunal processes are harmonised.

Article 10 Third Parties

1. Any Party having a substantial interest in a matter before an arbitral tribunal may notify the Parties to the dispute of this interest no later than ten days after the date of receipt by the Responding Party of the request for the establishment of the arbitral tribunal or the date of a request for a Compliance Review Tribunal pursuant to Article 16 (Compliance Review). Such notification shall be simultaneously provided to all Parties. Any Party notifying its substantial interest shall have the rights and obligations of a Third Party.

2. A Third Party shall receive the submissions of the Parties to the dispute to the first substantive meeting of the arbitral tribunal with the Parties to the dispute.

3. A Third Party shall have an opportunity to make at least one written submission to the arbitral tribunal and shall have an opportunity to be heard by the arbitral tribunal at its first substantive meeting with the Parties to the dispute. Any submissions or other documents submitted by Third Parties shall be simultaneously provided to the Parties to the dispute and other Third Parties.

4. The Parties to the dispute may agree to provide additional or supplemental rights to Third Parties regarding

participation in arbitral tribunal proceedings. In providing additional or supplemental rights, the Parties to the dispute may impose conditions. Unless otherwise agreed by the Parties to the dispute, the arbitral tribunal shall not grant any additional or supplemental rights to any Third Parties regarding participation in arbitral tribunal proceedings.

5. If a Third Party considers that a measure already the subject of an arbitral tribunal proceeding nullifies or impairs benefits accruing to it under this Agreement, such Party may have recourse to dispute settlement procedures under this Chapter.

Article 11

Establishment and Re-convening of Arbitral Tribunals

1. An arbitral tribunal requested pursuant to Article 8 (Request for Establishment of Arbitral Tribunals) shall be established in accordance with this Article.

2. Unless the Parties to the dispute otherwise agree, the arbitral tribunal shall consist of three arbitrators. All appointments and nominations of arbitrators under this Article shall conform fully with the requirements in Paragraphs 9 and 10.

3. Within five days of the date of the receipt of a request under Article 8 (Request for Establishment of Arbitral Tribunals), the Parties to the dispute shall enter into consultations with a view to reaching agreement on the procedures for composing the arbitral tribunal, taking into account the factual, technical and legal circumstances of the dispute. The Parties to the dispute may agree to use any of the optional procedures specified in this Chapter's Annex on Optional Procedures for Composing Arbitral Tribunals. Any procedures for composing the arbitral tribunal which are agreed under this Paragraph shall be used for the composition of the arbitral tribunal and shall also be used for the purposes of Paragraphs 12 and 13.

4. If the Parties to the dispute are unable to reach agreement on the procedures for composing the arbitral tribunal within 15 days of the date of the receipt of the request referred to in Paragraph 3, any Party to the dispute may at any time thereafter notify the other Parties to the dispute that it wishes to use the procedures set forth in Paragraphs 5 to 7. Where such a notification is made, the arbitral tribunal shall be composed in accordance with Paragraphs 5 to 7.

5. The Complaining Party or Parties shall appoint one arbitrator within ten days of the date of the receipt of the notification referred to in Paragraph 4. The Responding Party shall appoint one arbitrator within 20 days of the date of the receipt of the notification referred to in Paragraph 4.

6. Following the appointment of the arbitrators in accordance with Paragraph 5, the Parties to the dispute shall agree on the appointment of the third arbitrator who shall serve as the chair of the arbitral tribunal. To assist in reaching this agreement, each of the Parties to the dispute may provide to the other Parties to the dispute a list of up to three nominees for appointment as the chair of the arbitral tribunal. If the Parties to the dispute have not agreed on the chair of the arbitral tribunal within 15 days of the appointment of the second arbitrator, the two appointed arbitrators shall designate by common agreement the third arbitrator who shall chair the arbitral tribunal.

7. If all three arbitrators have not been appointed within 45 days of the date of the receipt of the notification referred to in Paragraph 4, any Party to the dispute may request the Director-General of the WTO to make the remaining appointments within a further period of 15 days. Any lists of nominees which were provided under Paragraph 6 shall also be provided to the Director-General of the WTO and may be used in making the required appointments.

8. The date of establishment of the arbitral tribunal shall be the date on which the last arbitrator is appointed.

9. All arbitrators shall:

- (a) have expertise or experience in law, international trade, other matters covered by this Agreement, or the resolution of disputes arising under international trade agreements;
- (b) be chosen strictly on the basis of objectivity, reliability, and sound judgement;
- (c) be independent of, and not be affiliated with or take instructions from, any Party to the dispute;
- (d) not have dealt with the matter in any capacity; and
- (e) disclose, to the Parties to the dispute, information which may give rise to justifiable doubts as to their independence or impartiality.

10. Unless the Parties to the dispute otherwise agree, arbitrators shall not be nationals of a Party to the dispute. In addition, the chair of arbitral tribunal shall not have his or her usual place of residence in the territory of a Party to the dispute.

11. Arbitrators shall serve in their individual capacities and not as government representatives, nor as representatives of any organisation. Parties shall not give them instructions nor seek to influence them as individuals with regard to matters before an arbitral tribunal.

12. If an arbitrator appointed under this Article resigns or becomes unable to act, a successor arbitrator shall be appointed in the same manner as prescribed for the appointment of the original arbitrator and shall have all the

powers and duties of the original arbitrator. The work of the arbitral tribunal shall be suspended during the appointment of the successor arbitrator.

13. Where an arbitral tribunal is re-convened under Article 16 (Compliance Review) or Article 17 (Compensation and Suspension of Concessions or other Obligations) the re-convened arbitral tribunal shall, where possible, have the same arbitrators as the original arbitral tribunal. Where this is not possible, the replacement arbitrator(s) shall be appointed in the same manner as prescribed for the appointment of the original arbitrator(s), and shall have all the powers and duties of the original arbitrator(s).

Article 12

Functions of Arbitral Tribunals

1. An arbitral tribunal shall make an objective assessment of the matter before it, including an objective assessment of:

- (a) the facts of the case;
- (b) the applicability of the provisions of this Agreement cited by the Parties to the dispute; and
- (c) whether the Responding Party has failed to carry out its obligations under this Agreement.

2. An arbitral tribunal shall have the following terms of reference unless the Parties to the dispute agree otherwise within 20 days from the date of the establishment of an arbitral tribunal:

“To examine, in the light of the relevant provisions of this Agreement, the matter referred to in the request for establishment of an arbitral tribunal made pursuant to Article 8 (Request for Establishment of

Arbitral Tribunals), and to make such findings and if applicable, suggestions provided for in this Agreement.”

The arbitral tribunal shall make its findings in accordance with this Agreement.

3. The arbitral tribunal shall set out in its report:
 - (a) a descriptive section summarising the arguments of the Parties to the dispute and Third Parties;
 - (b) its findings on the facts of the case and on the applicability of the provisions of this Agreement;
 - (c) its findings on whether the Responding Party has failed to carry out its obligations under this Agreement; and
 - (d) its reasons for its findings in Subparagraphs (b) and (c).

4. In addition to Paragraph 3, an arbitral tribunal may include in its report any other findings jointly requested by the Parties to the dispute. The arbitral tribunal may suggest ways in which the Responding Party could implement the findings.

5. Unless the Parties to the dispute otherwise agree, an arbitral tribunal shall base its report solely on the relevant provisions of this Agreement and the submissions and arguments of the Parties to the dispute. An arbitral tribunal shall only make the findings and suggestions provided for in this Agreement.

6. The interests of Third Parties and those of other Parties shall be fully taken into account during the arbitral tribunal proceedings. Third Parties’ submissions shall be reflected in the report of the arbitral tribunal.

7. The findings and suggestions of the arbitral tribunal cannot add to or diminish the rights and obligations provided in this Agreement or any other international agreement.

8. The arbitral tribunal shall consult regularly the Parties to the dispute and provide adequate opportunities for the development of a mutually satisfactory solution to the dispute.

9. An arbitral tribunal re-convened under this Chapter shall also carry out functions with regard to compliance review under Article 16 (Compliance Review) and review of level of suspension of concessions or other obligations under Article 17 (Compensation and Suspension of Concessions or other Obligations). Paragraphs 1 to 3 shall not apply to an arbitral tribunal re-convened under Article 16 (Compliance Review) and Article 17 (Compensation and Suspension of Concessions or other Obligations).

10. An arbitral tribunal shall make its findings by consensus provided that where an arbitral tribunal is unable to reach consensus it may make its findings by majority vote.

Article 13 **Arbitral Tribunal Procedures**

1. An arbitral tribunal established pursuant to Article 11 (Establishment and Re-convening of Arbitral Tribunals) shall adhere to this Chapter. The arbitral tribunal shall apply the rules of procedure set out in this Chapter's Annex on Rules of Procedure for Arbitral Tribunal Proceedings (Rules of Procedure Annex) unless the Parties to the dispute agree otherwise. On the request of a Party to the dispute, or on its own initiative, the arbitral tribunal may, after consulting the Parties to the dispute, adopt additional rules of procedure which do not conflict with the provisions of this Chapter or with the Rules of Procedure Annex.

2. An arbitral tribunal re-convened under Article 16 (Compliance Review) or Article 17 (Compensation and Suspension of Concessions or other Obligations) may establish its own procedures which do not conflict with this Chapter or the Rules of Procedure Annex, in consultation with the Parties to the dispute, drawing as it deems appropriate from this Chapter or the Rules of Procedure Annex.

Timetable

3. After consulting the Parties to the dispute, an arbitral tribunal shall, as soon as practicable and whenever possible within 15 days after the establishment of the arbitral tribunal, fix the timetable for the arbitral tribunal process. The arbitral tribunal process, from the date of establishment until the date of the final report shall, as a general rule, not exceed the period of nine months, unless the Parties to the dispute agree otherwise.

4. Similarly, a Compliance Review Tribunal re-convened pursuant to Article 16 (Compliance Review) shall, as soon as practicable and whenever possible within 15 days after re-convening, fix the timetable for the compliance review process taking into account the time periods specified in Article 16 (Compliance Review).

Arbitral Tribunal Proceedings

5. Arbitral tribunal proceedings should provide sufficient flexibility so as to ensure high-quality reports, while not unduly delaying the arbitral tribunal process.

6. Arbitral tribunal deliberations shall be confidential. The Parties to the dispute and Third Parties shall be present only when invited by the arbitral tribunal to appear before it. An arbitral tribunal shall hold its hearings in closed session unless the Parties to the dispute agree otherwise. All presentations and statements made at hearings shall be

made in the presence of the Parties to the dispute. There shall be no *ex parte* communications with the arbitral tribunal concerning matters under consideration by it.

Submissions

7. Each Party to the dispute shall have an opportunity to set out in writing the facts of its case, its arguments and counter arguments. The timetable fixed by the arbitral tribunal shall include precise deadlines for submissions by the Parties to the dispute and Third Parties.

Hearings

8. The timetable fixed by the arbitral tribunal shall provide for at least one hearing for the Parties to the dispute to present their case to the arbitral tribunal. As a general rule, the timetable shall not provide more than two hearings unless special circumstances exist.

9. The venue for hearings shall be decided by mutual agreement between the Parties to the dispute. If there is no agreement, the venue shall alternate between the capitals of the Parties to the dispute with the first hearing to be held in the capital of the Responding Party.

Confidentiality

10. Written submissions to the arbitral tribunal shall be treated as confidential, but shall be made available to the Parties to the dispute. No Party to the dispute shall be precluded from disclosing statements of its own positions to the public provided that there is no disclosure of information which has been designated as confidential by a Party to the dispute or Third Party. The Parties to the dispute, Third Parties and the arbitral tribunal shall treat as confidential information submitted by a Party to the dispute to the arbitral tribunal which that Party has designated as confidential. A Party to the dispute shall upon request of a Party, provide a

non-confidential summary of the information contained in its written submissions that could be disclosed to the public.

Additional Information and Technical Advice

11. The Parties to the dispute and Third Parties shall respond promptly and fully to any request by an arbitral tribunal for such information as the arbitral tribunal considers necessary and appropriate.

12. An arbitral tribunal may seek information and technical advice from any individual or body which it deems appropriate. However, before doing so the arbitral tribunal shall seek the views of the Parties to the dispute. Where the Parties to the dispute agree that the arbitral tribunal should not seek the additional information or technical advice, the arbitral tribunal shall not proceed. The arbitral tribunal shall provide the Parties to the dispute with any information or technical advice it receives and an opportunity to provide comments.

Report

13. The arbitral tribunal shall provide to the Parties to the dispute an interim report, meeting the requirements specified in Article 12.3 (Functions of Arbitral Tribunals).

14. The interim report shall be provided at least four weeks before the deadline for completion of the final report. The arbitral tribunal shall accord adequate opportunity to the Parties to the dispute to review the entirety of its interim report prior to its finalisation and shall include a discussion of any comments made by the Parties to the dispute in its final report.

15. The interim and final report of the arbitral tribunal shall be drafted without the presence of the Parties to the dispute. Opinions expressed in the report of the arbitral tribunal by its individual members shall be anonymous.

16. The arbitral tribunal shall provide its final report to all other Parties seven days after the report is presented to the Parties to the dispute, and at any time thereafter a Party to the dispute may make the report publicly available subject to the protection of any confidential information contained in the report.

Article 14

Suspension and Termination of Proceedings

1. The Parties to the dispute may agree that the arbitral tribunal suspend its work at any time for a period not exceeding 12 months from the date of such agreement. Within this period, the suspended arbitral proceeding shall be resumed upon the request of any Party to the dispute. If the work of the arbitral tribunal has been continuously suspended for more than 12 months, the authority for establishment of the arbitral tribunal shall lapse unless the Parties to the dispute agree otherwise.

2. The Parties to the dispute may agree to terminate the proceedings of an arbitral tribunal in the event that a mutually satisfactory solution to the dispute has been found.

3. Before the arbitral tribunal presents its final report, it may at any stage of the proceedings propose to the Parties to the dispute that the dispute be settled amicably.

4. The Parties to the dispute shall notify the other Parties that the arbitral tribunal has been suspended, terminated or its authority has lapsed pursuant to Paragraph 1.

SECTION D

Implementation Provisions

Article 15 Implementation

1. Where an arbitral tribunal finds that the Responding Party has failed to carry out its obligations under this Agreement, the Responding Party shall comply with its obligations under this Agreement.
2. Within 30 days of the date of the presentation of the arbitral tribunal's final report to the Parties to the dispute, the Responding Party shall notify the Complaining Party:
 - (a) of its intentions with respect to implementation, including an indication of possible actions it may take to comply with the obligation in Paragraph 1;
 - (b) whether such implementation can take place immediately; and
 - (c) if such implementation cannot take place immediately, the reasonable period of time the Responding Party would need to implement.
3. If it is impracticable to comply immediately with the obligation in Paragraph 1, the Responding Party shall have a reasonable period of time to do so.
4. If a reasonable period of time is required, it shall, whenever possible, be mutually agreed by the Parties to the dispute. Where the Parties to the dispute are unable to agree on the reasonable period of time within 45 days of the date of the presentation of the arbitral tribunal's final report to the Parties to the dispute, any Party to the dispute may request that the chair of the arbitral tribunal determine the reasonable

period of time. Unless the Parties to the dispute otherwise agree, such requests shall be made no later than 120 days from the date of the presentation of the arbitral tribunal's final report to the Parties to the dispute.

5. Where a request is made pursuant to Paragraph 4, the chair of the arbitral tribunal shall present the Parties to the dispute with a report containing a determination of the reasonable period of time and the reasons for such determination within 45 days of the date of the request.

6. As a guideline, the reasonable period of time determined by the chair of the arbitral tribunal should not exceed 15 months from the date of the presentation of the arbitral tribunal's final report to the Parties to the dispute. However, such reasonable period of time may be shorter or longer, depending upon the particular circumstances.

Article 16 Compliance Review

1. Where the Parties to the dispute disagree on the existence or consistency with this Agreement of measures taken to comply with the obligation in Article 15.1 (Implementation), such dispute shall be decided through recourse to an arbitral tribunal re-convened for this purpose (Compliance Review Tribunal).³ Unless otherwise specified in this Chapter, a Compliance Review Tribunal may be convened at the request of any Party to the dispute.

2. Such request may only be made after the earlier of:

- (a) the expiry of the reasonable period of time; or
- (b) a notification to the Complaining Party by the Responding Party that it has complied with the obligation in Article 15.1 (Implementation).

³ Consultations under Article 6 (Consultations) are not required for these procedures.

3. A Compliance Review Tribunal shall make an objective assessment of the matter before it, including an objective assessment of:

- (a) the factual aspects of any implementation action taken by the Responding Party; and
- (b) whether the Responding Party has complied with the obligation in Article 15.1 (Implementation).

4. The Compliance Review Tribunal shall set out in its report:

- (a) a descriptive section summarising the arguments of the Parties to the dispute and Third Parties;
- (b) its findings on the factual aspects of the case; and
- (c) its findings on whether the Responding Party has complied with the obligation in Article 15.1 (Implementation).

5. The Compliance Review Tribunal shall, where possible, provide its interim report to the Parties to the dispute within 75 days of the date it re-convenes, and its final report 15 days thereafter. When the Compliance Review Tribunal considers that it cannot provide either report within the relevant timeframe, it shall inform the Parties to the dispute in writing of the reasons for the delay together with an estimate of the period within which it will submit the report.

6. Where an arbitral tribunal is requested to re-convene pursuant to Paragraph 1, it shall re-convene within 15 days of the date of the request. The period from the date of the request for the arbitral tribunal to re-convene to the submission of its final report shall not exceed 120 days, unless Article 11.12 (Establishment and Re-convening of

Arbitral Tribunals) applies or the Parties to the dispute otherwise agree.

Article 17

Compensation and Suspension of Concessions or other Obligations

1. Compensation and the suspension of concessions or other obligations are temporary measures available in the event that the Responding Party does not comply with its obligation under Article 15.1 (Implementation). However, neither compensation nor the suspension of concessions or other obligations is preferred to compliance with the obligation under Article 15.1 (Implementation). Compensation is voluntary and, if granted, shall be consistent with this Agreement.

2. Where either of the following circumstances exists:

- (a) the Responding Party has notified the Complaining Party that it does not intend to comply with the obligation in Article 15.1 (Implementation); or
- (b) a failure to comply with the obligation in Article 15.1 (Implementation) has been established in accordance with Article 16 (Compliance Review),

the Responding Party shall, if so requested by the Complaining Party, enter into negotiations with a view to developing mutually acceptable compensation.

3. If no satisfactory compensation has been agreed within 30 days of the date of a request made under Paragraph 2, the Complaining Party may at any time thereafter notify the Responding Party and the other Parties that it intends to suspend the application to the Responding Party of concessions or other obligations equivalent to the level of nullification and impairment, and shall have the right to begin

suspending concessions or other obligations 30 days after the date of receipt of the notification.

4. The right to suspend concessions or other obligations arising under Paragraph 3 shall not be exercised where:

- (a) a review is being undertaken pursuant to Paragraph 8; or
- (b) a mutually agreed solution has been reached.

5. A notification made under Paragraph 3 shall specify the level of concessions or other obligations that the Complaining Party proposes to suspend, and the relevant Chapter and sector(s) which the concessions or other obligations are related to.

6. In considering what concessions or other obligations to suspend, the Complaining Party shall apply the following principles:

- (a) the Complaining Party should first seek to suspend concessions or other obligations in the same sector or sectors as that affected by the measure; and
- (b) the Complaining Party may suspend concessions or other obligations in other sectors if it considers that it is not practicable or effective to suspend concessions or other obligations in the same sector.

7. The level of suspending concessions or other obligations shall be equivalent to the level of nullification and impairment.

8. Within 30 days from the date of receipt of a notification made under Paragraph 3, if the Responding Party objects to the level of suspension proposed or considers that the

principles set forth in Paragraph 6 have not been followed, the Responding Party may request the arbitral tribunal to re-convene to make findings on the matter. The arbitral tribunal shall provide its assessment to the Parties to the dispute within 30 days of the date it re-convenes. Where an arbitral tribunal is requested to re-convene pursuant to this Paragraph, it shall re-convene within 15 days of the date of the request, unless Article 11.12 (Establishment and Re-convening of Arbitral Tribunals) applies.

9. The suspension of concessions or other obligations shall be temporary and shall only be applied until such time as the obligation in Article 15.1 (Implementation) has been complied with or a mutually satisfactory solution is reached.

10. Where the right to suspend concessions or other obligations has been exercised under this Article, if the Responding Party considers that:

- (a) the level of concessions or other obligations suspended by the Complaining Party is not equivalent to the level of the nullification and impairment; or
- (b) it has complied with the obligation in Article 15.1 (Implementation),

it may request the arbitral tribunal to re-convene to examine the matter.⁴

11. Where the arbitral tribunal re-convenes pursuant to Paragraph 10(a), Paragraph 8 shall apply. Where the arbitral tribunal re-convenes pursuant to Paragraph 10(b), Article 16.3 to 16.5 (Compliance Review) shall apply.

⁴ Where a Compliance Review Tribunal determines that measures taken to comply are inconsistent with this Agreement, it may also, on request, assess whether the level of any existing suspension of concessions is still appropriate and, if not, assess an appropriate level.

SECTION E

Final Provisions

Article 18

Special and Differential Treatment Involving Newer ASEAN Member States

1. At all stages of the determination of the causes of a dispute and of dispute settlement procedures involving newer ASEAN Member States, particular sympathetic consideration shall be given to the special situation of newer ASEAN Member States. In this regard, Parties shall exercise due restraint in raising matters under these procedures involving a least-developed country Party. If nullification or impairment is found to result from a measure taken by a least-developed country Party, a Complaining Party shall exercise due restraint regarding matters covered under Article 17 (Compensation and Suspension of Concessions or other Obligations) or other obligations pursuant to these procedures.

2. Where one or more of the Parties to a dispute is a newer ASEAN Member State, the arbitral tribunal's reports shall explicitly indicate the form in which account has been taken of relevant provisions on special and differential treatment for a newer ASEAN Member State that form part of this Agreement which have been raised by the newer ASEAN Member State in the course of the dispute settlement procedures.

Article 19

Expenses

1. Unless the Parties to the dispute otherwise agree, each Party to a dispute shall bear the costs of its appointed arbitrator and its own expenses and legal costs.

2. Unless the Parties to the dispute otherwise agree, the costs of the chair of the arbitral tribunal and other expenses associated with the conduct of its proceedings shall be borne in equal parts by the Parties to the dispute.

Article 20 Contact Points

1. Each Party shall designate a contact point for this Chapter and shall notify the other Parties of the details of this contact point within 30 days of the entry into force of this Agreement. Each Party shall notify the other Parties of any change to its contact point.

2. Any request, written submission or other document relating to any proceedings pursuant to this Chapter shall be delivered to the relevant Party or Parties through their designated contact points who shall provide confirmation of receipt of such documents in writing.

Article 21 Language

1. All proceedings pursuant to this Chapter shall be conducted in the English language.

2. Any document submitted for use in any proceedings pursuant to this Chapter shall be in the English language. If any original document is not in the English language, a Party submitting it for use in the proceedings shall provide an English language translation of that document.